Language in India www.languageinindia.com are indexed in EBSCOHost database, MLA International Bibliography and the Directory of Periodicals, ProQuest (Linguistics and Language Behavior Abstracts) and Gale Research. The journal is listed in the Directory of Open Access Journals. It is included in the Cabell’s Directory, a leading directory in the USA.

Articles published in Language in India are peer-reviewed by one or more members of the Board of Editors or an outside scholar who is a specialist in the related field. Since the dissertations are already reviewed by the University-appointed examiners, dissertations accepted for publication in Language in India are not reviewed again.

This is our 15th year of publication. All back issues of the journal are accessible through this link: http://languageinindia.com/backissues/2001.html

Contents
English as a Lingua Franca: Creating a ‘Model’ Out of a ‘Muddle’?
Anindya Syam Choudhury, Ph.D., PGCTE, PGDTE,
CertTESOL (Trinity, London) 1-8

Pause Duration in Typically Developing Malayalam Speaking Children
Anuja Sara Abraham, Final Year Post-Graduate Student
Satish Kumaraswami, Principal
Janet George, Final Year Post-Graduate Student
Arya, G. S., Final Year Post-Graduate Student 9-22

Teaching English as Second Language:
An Evaluation of TESL Practices in Indian Context
Birinder Kaur, M.A., M.Phil. (English), Ph.D. Research Scholar
Dr. Jap Preet Kaur Bhangu, Ph.D. 23-34

Vowel Correspondence between Kakching Dialect and
Standard Meiteilon
Naorem Brindebala Devi, Ph.D. Research Scholar
Prof. Ch. Yashawanta Singh 35-46

Acoustic Characteristics of Stop Consonants during
Fast and Normal Speaking Rate in Typically Developing
Malayalam Speaking Children ...
Janet George, Final Year MASLP
Anuja Sara Abraham, Final Year MASLP
Arya G. S., Final Year MASLP
Satish Kumaraswami, Assistant Professor & Ph.D. Scholar 47-59

Brajavali Form of Early Assamese and Early Maithili:
A Contrastive Study ...
Subasana Mahanta, Ph.D. 60-73

Gifts-Giving: A Mythical Reality ...
Dr. Olive Thambi 74-79

Django Unchained: A Slave Narrative with a Capital S ...
P. Ponnivalavan, M.A. 80-91

An Optimistic Evolution of Existence in Saffron Dreams
by Shaila Abdullah ...
Rabia Ashraf, M.Phil., B.S. (Hons.) 92-123

The Literature Tendencies of the Restoration Age
in the Perspectives of John Dryden and Robert Burns ...
Dr. Roshni Duhan, Ph.D. (Law), M.A. (English) 124-138

Comparison between Shaw’s and Brecht’s
Treatment of Political Consciousness ...
Sadia Riaz, M.Phil, Rida Sarfraz, M.Phil, and
Farhan Ebadat Yar Khan, Ph.D. 139-149

The Image of the Woman Paralleled With the Decline of Delhi ...
Sadia Riaz, M.Phil. and
Farhan Ebadat Yar Khan Ph.D. 150-163

Love and Money:
An Analysis of The Great Gatsby ...
Selvi Bunce 164-168

Issues of Caste and Communalism in the Novels of R.K. Narayan ...
Shakeba Jabeen Siddiqui, Ph.D. (Linguistics) 169-177

Assertion of Self:
A Reading of Selected Marathi Dalit Poets ...
Santosh Bahadur Singh, Ph.D.
Shubhanku Kochar, M.Phil., Ph.D. Scholar 178-192

Further Biblical Allusions to John the Baptist in Shakespeare’s Hamlet ...
Song Cho, M.A. 193-194

Acquisition of Case Markers in
Typically Developing Malayalam Speaking Children ...
Sreelakshmi R., Final year MASLP Student
Nandhu S Mohan., Final year MASLP Student
Satish Kumaraswamy, Asst.Professor & Ph.D. Scholar 195-207

Language or Life-force:
What It Takes to be a Language Teacher? ...
Sweta Sinha, Ph.D. 208-216

Use of Discourse Markers:
A Case Study of English Writing by Yemeni Students ...
Thekra Mohammed Abdullah Yehia
Ph.D. Scholar in Linguistics 217-235

by Dorothy U. Seyler - A Review ...
Tom Shetler, M.A., D.I.S. Research Scholar
Dr. E. Sudhir Isaiah 236-255

The Use of Socratic Method as a Teaching/Learning Tool to
Develop Students’ Critical Thinking: A Review ...
Pezhman Zare & Jayakaran Mukundan 256-265
Abstract

In the context of the stupendous growth of English the world over in recent times, and the important role that it is now playing among speakers of English from diverse first-language backgrounds, some academic researchers are now advocating the teaching of English as Lingua Franca (ELF). However, the very notion of ELF, with all its contradictions, comes across as a muddled one, out of which the creation of a model for the English language classroom at this point of time seems a remote possibility. This article discusses this and several other crucial issues related to ELF, and it took its present shape as a result of a series of discussions that I had with several colleagues, the prime among them being Prof Z N Patil, who recently retired from the English and Foreign Languages University, Hyderabad, India.

Keywords: English as a Lingua Franca, World Englishes, Expanding Circle, Model, Variety.

World Englishes

The spread and growth of English, “the native language of a relatively small island nation”, across the world to become “the most widely taught, read, and spoken language that the world has ever known” (Kachru and Nelson, 2001: 9), has been nothing short of a miracle, setting in motion processes leading to the emergence of new varieties of English in different sociolinguistic contexts, now fashionably called ‘World Englishes’ (WEs), and turning topsy-turvy several hitherto sacrosanct notions in English Language Teaching (ELT) like, for instance, the notions of the standard and the model in the language classroom.

Numerous attempts have been made to systematise the complex picture arising out of this diffusion, resulting in the development of several models of Englishes like the ENL-ESL-EFL model developed by Quirk et al. (1972), the Three Circles model of Kachru (1985), the ‘wheel model’ of Tom McArthur (1987) and Görlach’s model (1988). Of these, the Three
Circles model of Kachru has been an epoch-making one, distinguishing between the inner circle (e.g. the UK and the USA), the outer circle (e.g. India and Singapore) and the expanding circle (e.g. Japan and France).

**English as Lingua Franca, Native Speaker and Non-native Speaker**

Without getting into a discussion on the merits or otherwise of the Three Circles model, and the associated terminological quagmire centring around the collocations of ‘English’ with ‘world’, ‘international’ and ‘global’ and so on, I would like to start by simply stating that in their analysis of the English as Lingua Franca (ELF) situation in the world, academic researchers like Jenkins (2006, 2007) and Seidhofer (2004, 2011) et al., who could be regarded as the avant-gardists in ELF research, have usually taken into account only one kind of interaction, that between the different ‘non-native speakers’ (NNSs) of English in Kachru’s Expanding Circle.

Here I must point out that I am aware of the value-loaded baggage that the terms ‘native speaker’ (NS) and ‘non-native speaker’ (NNS) carry, and elsewhere (for instance, Syam Choudhury 2014) I have argued about their inadequacy and, therefore, the need for their eradication, quite in line with the prevalent thinking within the World Englishes paradigm. However, in the context of a discussion on ELF, I find these terms difficult to do away with although my preferred terms, like Prodromou’s (2007b), are ‘L1-user’ and ‘L2-user’.

**Problems with the “Pure Form of ELF”**

Having said this, let me now return to the point I was trying to make regarding how Jenkins and Seidhofer construe what they regard as the “pure” form of ELF which leaves out from its ambit users of both English as a first language and English as a second language (Jenkins 2006, p. 161). What happens as a result is that a large number of interactional situations involving English are ignored by the ELF researchers, making them susceptible to the charge of non-inclusiveness. For instance, as Maley (2010, p. 29) points out, a large number of exchanges take place using the nativized varieties (in Kachru’s Outer Circle), some taking place within the overall variety (as in India, Singapore, etc.) while others taking place between the speakers of different varieties (e.g. Indians-Singaporeans).
And what about the interactional exchanges between the Inner Circle ‘native speakers’ and the speakers of nativized varieties (e.g. Americans-Indians)? Not only are these types of interactional exchanges ignored by the ELF researchers, what is also ignored is the possibility of variation along “regional, social, occupational, generational and lectal lines” (Maley 2010, p. 29).

**Contradictory Points of Views**

In addition, what make matters further confusing are the often so contradictory points of view about the nature of ELF that these academic researchers seem to hold.

Jenkins (2007), for instance, defines ELF as “an emerging variety that exists in its own right and which is being described in its own terms rather than by comparison with ENL” (p. 2; emphasis in original). This definition suggests that Jenkins considers ELF to be one of the many varieties of English that are there in the world today. However, later on, Jenkins (2007) moves from the singular “variety” to the plural “varieties” while discussing ELF, pointing out that “ELF varieties are used internationally rather than intra-nationally and are born of international contact among their NNSs” (p. 17; emphasis added).

This use of the plural word “varieties” seems to be in line with Seidlhofer’s view that we should prevent ourselves from regarding ELF as a “distinguishable, codified and unitary variety...which is certainly not the case” (Seidlhofer 2004, p. 211). However, Seidlhofer (2004) herself cannot be considered to be harbouring a consistent view of the plural nature of ELF for she opines that ELF “is a natural language and can thus be expected to undergo the same processes that affect other natural languages especially in contact situations” (p. 222; emphasis added), giving an impression that ELF is a kind of an “identifiable, discrete entity” (Sowden 2012, p. 91).

Again, there have been others like Dewey and Cogo (2007) who have argued that ELF should not be seen as “a uniform set of norms or practices but rather a set of linguistic resources which, while sharing common ground, is typically more variable than other language varieties” (p. 11).

From the foregoing discussion, it can be clearly inferred that there is some confusion with regard to what actually ELF is, for quite sometime it has been described as “an emerging variety”, while on other occasions the plural word “varieties” has been juxtaposed with it.
While on some occasions ELF is regarded a monolithic variety in which is subsumed the core features of different local variations of English in Kachru’s Expanding Circle contexts, on other occasions ELF is considered a field in which research is focused on describing and making sense “of the processes in operation in lingua franca talk and the strategies used by its speakers” (Cogo 2012, p. 99), and not uncovering any “core” features.

But then, hasn’t setting out the lingua franca core (LFC) been a primary concern of Jenkins (2000), thereby opening “a debate on pronunciation targets and teaching priorities” (Dauer 2005, p. 549)? Moreover, if the focus of ELF research is on making sense of the processes in operation in lingua franca talk, does it mean then that by the term ‘ELF’ what is meant is not the form but the function that English performs in different situations across the world (Saraceni 2008, p.24)?

Apart from the apparent contradictions in the discourse on ELF mentioned above, Jenkins (2006) has often been guilty of sometimes separating ELF from the WEs, which she admits to viewing from a narrow perspective, in the sense of “new Englishes in Africa, Asia and the Caribbean” (p. 159), while on other occasions, as Prodromou (2007a) points out, conflating “ELF and indigenized varieties, sliding from one to the other as if the phenomena described were the same or comparable” (p. 409).

Other Related Issues

There are several other issues in the discourse on ELF which have contributed to the muddled state that it seems to be in at the present moment. For instance, while Jenkins’s view regarding how there ought to be a “pluricentric rather than monocentric approach to the teaching of English” is appreciable, her assertion regarding raising learners’ awareness of the diversity of English by exposing the “less proficient learners” to a range of ELF varieties seems problematic (Jenkins 2006, p. 173). For all Jenkins (2006, p. 170)) has on offer as the “salient features of ELF lexicogrammar” are some features like the following taken from Seidlhofer (2004, p. 220):

(i) Non-use of the third person present tense – s (“She look very sad”)
(ii) Interchangeable use of the relative pronouns who and which (“a book who”, “a person which”)

A Broken Weapon

Language in India www.languageinindia.com ISSN 1930-2940 15:6 June 2015
Anindya Syam Choudhury, Ph.D., PGCTE, PGDTE, CertTESOL (Trinity, London) English as a Lingua Franca: Creating a ‘Model’ Out of a ‘Muddle’?
In this regard, Prodromou (2007a, p. 410) points out quite rightly that describing “such forms in a non-judgemental way is a kind of descriptive linguistics and is a legitimate enterprise, but Jenkins occasionally conflates descriptive grammar and pedagogic grammar”, and there precisely lies the problem.

If the examples mentioned above, based on the description of the language use of ELF users, are considered to constitute the common grammatical core of ELF, as has been done by Jenkins (2006) and Seidlhofer (2004), it must be said that from the point of classroom practice what these ELF researchers proffer is a linguistic code consisting of a set of highly restricted data which Prodromou (2007a) considers to be a kind of a “broken weapon” with which the ELF researchers want to bring the ELF users “stuttering onto the world stage” (p. 412).

Moreover, as Maley (2010, p.31) says, “a new variety needs a base in a speech community”, and this is precisely what ELF lacks for it seems to be “no more than an inchoate and disconnected agglomeration of instances of use.” It is because of this reason perhaps that Prodromou (2008, p. 255) sounds a little apprehensive when he says that one possibly “cannot make a model from a muddle” that ELF is, and unless we have a model, from the pedagogical point of view ELF will remain a chimera.

Patil’s (2014) Proposal: Promoting Our Own Standardized Varieties

In this context, Patil’s (2014) observation is noteworthy and applicable to both ELF and WEs contexts. Patil (2014), while acknowledging how the “formal proliferation and functional diversification” of English “has been spurring scholars to challenge the traditional models and constructs which have underpinned and informed the teaching of English for several decades”, points out quite rightly that we should be promoting “our own respective standardized varieties of English as models for teaching and testing purposes...”, reiterating further that “we should train our learners to be educated speakers of their respective standardized regional variety” (pp. 46-47).

To corroborate his claim, Patil (2014) refers to Honna et al.’s (2001) observation (cited in McMurray 2001) regarding how Japanese students (in what is a proper ELF context) were happy with a standard Japanese accent of English. Talking about the pedagogical
implications of the lingua franca approach, especially for the language teachers, another researcher, Kirkpatrick (2012, p. 40), points out the following:

As the goal of the lingua franca approach is not to produce native speaker clones, but to produce people who are able to use English successfully in multilingual settings, this means that local multilinguals who are highly proficient in English and are suitably trained make appropriate teachers. Such teachers not only represent role models for their students but also linguistic models. (emphasis as in original)

**Functions of the Lingua Franca Approach**

There are two important points that Kirkpatrick makes in the above observation. The first one is with regard to the goal of the lingua franca approach, which, he says, is to produce people who are able to use English successfully in multilingual settings. Few would have any disagreement with Kirkpatrick on this issue. However, it is the second point which he makes, as a kind of corollary to the first, which seems more interesting. Kirkpatrick points out that ‘appropriate’ teachers in a lingua franca context, those who are expected to represent ‘role’ and ‘linguistic’ models for their students, are those trained local multilinguals who are highly proficient in English. In the context of this assertion of Kirkpatrick, one might be tempted to ask a question (rather rhetorical though) like the following:

(i) Why should these ‘appropriate’ teachers in a lingua franca context, who are proficient users of English themselves, take recourse to Jenkins’s ‘emerging’ or ‘emergent’ variety like ELF in their classrooms?

**Non-viability of the “Pure Form” Approach**

It is indeed important to stress here that the strong version of ELF, what is also often referred to as the “pure” form, which is promoted zealously by Jenkins and Seidlhofer et al. and which “tends to emphasise the notion of ELF as an ‘emerging or ‘emergent’ variety or varieties” (Maley 2010, p. 25), does not seem to be pedagogically viable at all. From the point of view of the classroom practitioner, teaching a variety close to a ‘standard’ one is the only possible option. Of course, what should not be lost sight of in the classroom is the necessity on the part of the practitioner to make the learners aware of the variations in English that they would encounter in the world at large once they step out of the classroom.
References


_Language in India_ www.languageinindia.com ISSN 1930-2940 15:6 June 2015

Anindya Syam Choudhury, Ph.D., PGCTE, PGDTE, CertTESOL (Trinity, London)

English as a Lingua Franca: Creating a ‘Model’ Out of a ‘Muddle’?


---

Anindya Syam Choudhury  
Ph.D., PGCTE, PGDTE (EFL University, Hyd.), CertTESOL (Trinity College London)  
Assistant Professor  
Department of English  
Assam University  
Silchar 788011  
Assam  
India  
anindyasyam@yahoo.com
Abstract

In communication, the encoded speech should be fluent. Fluency refers to the continuous and smooth flow of speech production (Starkweather and Ackerman, 1997). The present study included 15 subjects, aimed the difference in filled and unfilled pause duration in typically developing Malayalam speaking children across the age group of 6-8 years in tasks including conversation and picture description. The study reveals that there is not much variation in the filled pause duration whereas the unfilled pause showed a consistent general progression across the age group for conversation task. In picture description task, there was no significant difference for the filled and unfilled pause duration across the age group.

Keywords: unfilled pauses, filled pauses, Malayalam language.

Introduction

Speech is the vocalized form of human communication. It is a complex, highly skilled motor act, the refinement and stabilization of which continues well into adolescent years (Kent, 1976). It consists of articulation, voice and fluency.

The term fluency, derived from the Latin for “fluere”, describes what the listener perceives when listening to someone who is truly adept at producing speech. The speech flow easily and smoothly in terms of both sound and information. Fluency is the ability to talk with the normal levels of continuity, rate and effort. Speech is always without disruptions, which in
Anuja Sara Abraham, Final Year Post-Graduate Student, Satish Kumaraswami, Principal, Janet George, Final Year Post-Graduate Student and Arya. G. S., Final Year Post-Graduate Student

Pause Duration in Typically Developing Malayalam Speaking Children

Disruptions in the forward flow of speech may consist of:

- Repetitions: Repeating of a syllable, sound, word, or phrase (e.g., “li-li-li-like this”).
- Prolongations: Holding onto a sound for an extended period of time (e.g., “lllllike this”).
- Blocks: No sound is produced then a “burst” of tension is released when the speaker if able to vocalize (e.g., “----like this”).
- Interjections: Extra words (e.g., “um, uh, like”).
- Revisions: Speech is revised during and utterance (e.g., “I have to go…I need to go to the store”).

Pauses in speech delivery and their indicative quality of fluency have attracted considerable attention. The presence, frequency and position of pauses affect the listeners’ impression of fluent performance (Chambers, 1997; Fulcher, 1996). However, not every type of pause in speech contributes equally to an impression of disfluency. So-called natural pauses, which occur during breathing or for stylistic reasons, apparently form necessary breaks in fluent speech (Duez, 1982). Two types of pause include: filled pauses and unfilled pauses.

Filled pauses are hesitation sounds that speakers employ to indicate uncertainty or to maintain control of a conversation while thinking of what to say next. Filled pauses do not add any new information to the conversation (other than to indicate the speaker’s hesitation) and they do not alter the meaning of what is uttered.

Silent pauses include intervals of silence within stretches of speech. However, not all silent intervals necessarily count as hesitation phenomena. Many of these silent pauses are simply juncture pauses (e.g., corresponding to, say, commas in writing), or pauses for articulatory reasons.

One very common feature of spontaneous speech is hesitation in the form of pauses that can be one of three types (Dalton and Hardcastle, 1977). The first type is associated with the

Language in India www.languageinindia.com ISSN 1930-2940 15:6 June 2015
Anuja Sara Abraham, Final Year Post-Graduate Student, Satish Kumaraswami, Principal, Janet George, Final Year Post-Graduate Student and Arya. G. S., Final Year Post-Graduate Student
Pause Duration in Typically Developing Malayalam Speaking Children
articulatory closure of stop consonants. These pauses range from 50 msec to 250 msec. Such pauses are ubiquitous and are usually not considered in studies of hesitation phenomena. The second type of pause is associated with respiration and occurs when a speaker pauses in order to breathe. Such pauses are normally silent, though on occasion they are accompanied by "an audible voiceless hissing caused by the generation of turbulent air at various points of stricture in the vocal tract" (Dalton and Hardcastle, 1977). Eisler (1968) in summarizing studies of breath pauses found that their rate and duration are likely related to overall speech performance. The first two pause types are related to articulatory processes. The third type may appear before or after entire speech acts, sentences, clauses, or words, but tends to occur at significant grammatical locations. These may be either silent (or unfilled) pauses or filled (or voiced) pauses (Dalton and Hardcastle, 1977; Leech and Svartvik, 1994).

Rajan (2000) studied the disfluencies in 60 Malayalam speaking children between 3-8 years of age. The results indicated that disfluencies decreased from 3 years till 6 years. In the age group of 6-7 years there was an increase in the percentage of disfluencies and again decrease from 7-8 years. 3-4 years group had the highest percentage of disfluencies. Unfilled pauses were greatest in frequency; in the age range of 3-4 years and 4-5 years. No phrase repetitions and prolongations were noticed in the age group of 4-5 years. Parenthetical remarks were greatest in the age range of 5-6 years audible inspirations were greatest in the age group of 6-7 years and filled pauses were maximum between 7-8 years.

Kowal, Connel and Sabin (1975) considered unfilled pause as a category of disfluency. They define unfilled pause as any silence less than 270 msec. Studies of situational anxiety by Kasl and Mahl (1965); Krause and Pilisuk (1961); Siegman and Pope (1965) found that introduction of high anxiety topics in interviews results in greater occurrence of non-ah hesitations.

Martin, Haroldson and Kuhl (1972) studied 20 children between the age group 3.5-5 years. They found that the disfluencies like repetitions (sound, syllable, word and phrase), prolongations and interjections are present. Moreover, there was no significant difference in the percentage of disfluencies and number of words omitted between the two speaking situations.
(mother-child, child-child). Thus, the disfluencies of children appear to be less environmental variable.

James (2011) studied on nature of disfluencies in typically developing Malayalam speaking children with the age range of 3-6 years and the results revealed that speech of 3-6 year old normal speaking children contains almost all the disfluency types. High proportions of silent pauses, sound or syllable interjections, whole word interjections and whole word and part word repetitions are the most frequent disfluencies occurred in short story narration, song recitation and general conversation.

**Focus of This Study**

The present study focuses on pause duration in 6-8 years typically developing Malayalam speaking children. Pause duration in 6-8 years typically developing Malayalam speaking children, a major language of Kerala, has not been studied so far, regardless of its great use for fluency understanding and clinical application. Although there are studies describing early speech disfluencies across the Indian subcontinent (Nagapoornima, Indu and Yamini, 1990; Rajendraswamy, 1991; Sharma, 1991; Joby, 1998; Umarajan, 2000; Paulene and Bhoominathan, 2008), the data provided by them are diversified. Since stuttering and other fluency disorders are observed universally across culture and languages, there is a need to study the developmental trends in fluency in children belonging to culturally and linguistically diverse backgrounds. The present study may provide a tool in future to differentiate between normal non-fluency and developmental stuttering in children.

Starkweather (1987) opines that knowledge of fluency is a must for the understanding of dysfluency. Only by having a clear and sound knowledge of the fluency development in children, can one identify the disfluent / stuttering group. In order to diagnose a child as having stuttering, it is necessary that the clinician is well aware of the kind of disfluencies seen in normal children of the same age group. Thus, the study of fluency becomes very significant.
Methodology

A total of 15 subjects in the group of 6 years to 8 years typically developing Malayalam speaking children participated in the study. All the subjects were native speakers of Malayalam and had no history of speech, language and / or hearing problems. The task was general conversation and picture description task. Children were tested individually. The procedure was carried out in natural situation and the responses were audio recorded in a quiet room. Subjects were seated comfortably on the chair with one feet distance from the recorder placed on the table. The recorded speech samples were transcribed in International Phonetic Alphabet 4 (IPA IV).

Current study focuses on variation in

- Filled pauses (FP): Pauses filled with „mm…” „a..” „eh..” etc.
- Unfilled pauses (UP): Silent pauses.

Results

The study attempts to understand the variation of pause duration in 6-8 year old typically developing Malayalam speaking children. More specifically it attempts with the specific objectives of:

1. To investigate whether any variation in duration of filled and unfilled pauses across 6-8 years during conversation and picture description.

2. To study the changes in filled and unfilled pause durations within each age group for conversation and picture description.

Conversation Task
Pause Duration in Typically Developing Malayalam Speaking Children

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Task: Conversation</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Deviation</th>
<th>95% Confidence Interval for Mean</th>
<th>Kruskal Wallis test value</th>
<th>p value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Lower Bound</td>
<td>Upper Bound</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Filled</td>
<td>6 yrs</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.873</td>
<td>.380</td>
<td>1.402</td>
<td>2.344</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7 yrs</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.791</td>
<td>.145</td>
<td>1.611</td>
<td>1.972</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>8 yrs</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.848</td>
<td>.114</td>
<td>1.707</td>
<td>1.990</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>1.838</td>
<td>.228</td>
<td>1.711</td>
<td>1.964</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unfilled</td>
<td>6 yrs</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.383</td>
<td>.208</td>
<td>1.125</td>
<td>1.641</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7 yrs</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.832</td>
<td>.156</td>
<td>1.638</td>
<td>2.025</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>8 yrs</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2.457</td>
<td>.269</td>
<td>2.122</td>
<td>2.791</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>1.890</td>
<td>.498</td>
<td>1.615</td>
<td>2.166</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1: Showing the duration of filled and unfilled pauses in the age groups for conversation task

From the above table 1 and figure 1, it is clearly evident that there is no significant difference (p= 0.827) across the age group for filled pause. Whereas, high significant difference (p= 0.02) for unfilled pauses was noticed for conversation task.
Pause Duration in Typically Developing Malayalam Speaking Children

Table 2: Showing the duration of filled and unfilled pauses in the age groups on picture description task.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Deviation</th>
<th>95% Confidence Interval for Mean</th>
<th>Kruskal Wallis Test Value</th>
<th>p Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Filled</td>
<td>6 yrs</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.803</td>
<td>.364</td>
<td>1.350 - 2.255</td>
<td>4.740</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7 yrs</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.588</td>
<td>.322</td>
<td>1.188 - 1.988</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>8 yrs</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2.077</td>
<td>.270</td>
<td>1.742 - 2.412</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>1.823</td>
<td>.362</td>
<td>1.622 - 2.023</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unfilled</td>
<td>6 yrs</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.639</td>
<td>.263</td>
<td>1.312 - 1.966</td>
<td>.620</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7 yrs</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.886</td>
<td>.909</td>
<td>.758 - 3.014</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>8 yrs</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.783</td>
<td>.173</td>
<td>1.567 - 1.998</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>1.769</td>
<td>.525</td>
<td>1.479 - 2.060</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 2: Showing the duration of filled and unfilled pause in each age group on picture description task.

From the above figure 2 and table 2, it is clearly evident that there is no significant difference for filled pause (p= 0.093) and unfilled pause (p= 0.733) across the age group for picture description task.
Duration of filled pauses within age group for conversation and picture description task

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Task</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Deviation</th>
<th>95% Confidence Interval for Mean</th>
<th>Mannwhitney test value</th>
<th>p value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6 yrs  Conversation</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.873</td>
<td>.380</td>
<td>1.402 - 2.344</td>
<td>.10</td>
<td>.917</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 yrs  Picture Description</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.803</td>
<td>.364</td>
<td>1.350 - 2.255</td>
<td>NS</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 yrs  Conversation</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.791</td>
<td>.145</td>
<td>1.611 - 1.972</td>
<td>1.36</td>
<td>.175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 yrs  Picture Description</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.588</td>
<td>.322</td>
<td>1.188 - 1.988</td>
<td>NS</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 yrs  Conversation</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.848</td>
<td>.114</td>
<td>1.707 - 1.990</td>
<td>1.15</td>
<td>.251</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 yrs  Picture Description</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2.077</td>
<td>.270</td>
<td>1.742 - 2.412</td>
<td>NS</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3: Showing the duration of filled pauses within age group for conversation and picture description task.

Figure 3: Showing the duration of filled pauses within age group for conversation and picture description task.

From the above figure 3 and table 3, it is clearly showing that there is no significant difference exist within age group [6years (p= 0.917), 7 years (p=0.175) and 8 years (p= 0. 251)] for filled pause in conversation and picture description task.

Duration of unfilled pauses within age group for conversation and picture description task.
Table 4: Showing the duration of unfilled pauses within age group for conversation and picture description task.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Task</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Deviation</th>
<th>95% Confidence Interval for Mean</th>
<th>Mannwhitney test value</th>
<th>p value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6 yrs Conversation</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.383</td>
<td>.208</td>
<td>1.125, 1.641</td>
<td>1.36</td>
<td>.175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Picture Description</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.639</td>
<td>.263</td>
<td>1.312, 1.966</td>
<td>NS</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 yrs Conversation</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.832</td>
<td>.156</td>
<td>1.638, 2.025</td>
<td>.31</td>
<td>.754</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Picture Description</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.868</td>
<td>.099</td>
<td>.758, 3.014</td>
<td>NS</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 yrs Conversation</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2.457</td>
<td>.269</td>
<td>2.122, 2.791</td>
<td>2.41</td>
<td>.016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Picture Description</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.783</td>
<td>.173</td>
<td>1.567, 1.998</td>
<td>sig</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 4: Showing the duration of unfilled pauses within age group for conversation and picture.

From the above figure 4 and table 4, it is clearly evident that there is no significant difference within age group of 6 years (p= 0.175) and 7 years (p= 0.754) whereas, there is a significant difference was shown at 8 years (p= 0.016) for unfilled pause in conversation and picture description task.
Discussion

The purpose of this study was to understand the variation in the duration of pauses in the general conversation and picture description of 6-8 year old typically developing Malayalam speaking children. The present study focused on (1) type of pauses (filled/ unfilled) present in children with the age range of 6-8 years on general & picture description task (2) general progression of pauses through 6-8 year old children.

The study reveals that there is not much variation in the filled pause duration, whereas the unfilled pause showed a consistent general progression across the age group for conversation task.

In picture description task, there was no significant difference for the filled and unfilled pause duration across the age group. This finding is supported in previous study of Indu (1990) & Joby (1998).

For conversation and picture description, there was no significant difference found for filled pause for the age group 6 and 7 year old children and for unfilled pause, there was a significant difference exist at the age group 8years. This finding is an agreement with previous studies by Yamini (1990) and Sharma (1991)

Summary and Conclusion

The present study was taken up with aim of measure pause (filled and unfilled) duration in typically developing children. A total of 15 subjects, 5 in each group were participated in the study. These subjects were native speakers of Malayalam with no history of speech, language, and hearing problems. Picture description and conversation task were included. Speech samples were elicited and recorded. The samples were analyzed for filled and unfilled pauses.

It is observed that the pause duration do not show a linear increase or decrease with age, rather exhibit a varying pattern. In conversation task, as the age increases the duration of unfilled pauses.
pauses also varying or increasing and a slight variation in filled pauses can also see. In picture description task, there is a slight difference in filled and unfilled pauses as age increases.

Comparing within age group at 8 years, there is a difference in the unfilled pause for conversation and picture description task.

The reason for the increase in the pauses may be attributed to them being used during the planning time, required for the production of the content words (Silverman, 1973). The age of 8 are observed more unfilled pauses during conversation task. It may because of that they tend to repair their speech as they are aware and entering in the social conversation also.

References


Anuja Sara Abraham
Final Year Post-Graduate Student
Dr. M. V. Shetty College of Speech and Hearing
Maladi Court, Kavoor
Mangalore-575015
Karnataka
India
anujaaiswarya@rocketmail.com

Satish Kumaraswami
Principal
Dr. M. V. Shetty College of Speech and Hearing
Maladi Court, Kavoor
Mangalore-575015
Karnataka
India
sat8378@yahoo.com

Janet George
Final Year Post-Graduate Student
Dr. M. V. Shetty College of Speech and Hearing
Maladi Court, Kavoor
Mangalore-575015
Karnataka
India
janetmanthottam@gmail.com

Arya. G. S.
Final Year Post-Graduate Student
Dr. M. V. Shetty College of Speech and Hearing
Maladi Court, Kavoor
Mangalore-575015
Karnataka
India
aryajalakam@gmail.com

Language in India  www.languageinindia.com  ISSN 1930-2940  15:6  June 2015
Anuja Sara Abraham, Final Year Post-Graduate Student, Satish Kumaraswami, Principal, Janet George, Final Year Post-Graduate Student and Arya. G. S., Final Year Post-Graduate Student
Pause Duration in Typically Developing Malayalam Speaking Children
Abstract

The paper attempts to unfold the various TESL (Teaching English as a Second Language) practices followed in Indian classrooms. It would also aim to mark a vivid distinction between the understanding of L1 also known as mother tongue, and L2 or second language. The paper would attempt to reflect the various challenges and difficulties witnessed by the non native learners of English language. Through this paper, the authors would attempt to clearly define what exactly the term TESL reflects in its truer sense, what are the aims and objectives behind designing of such courses and which methodologies are usually adopted in the Indian Classroom teaching of English. There would also be an effort to hint on the current scenario and the gaps that exist in the effective implementation of ESL (English as a Second Language) and how those gaps may be filled by following certain effective strategies at the end of the language teachers thereby contributing to the enhanced proficiency levels of the learners.

Keywords: ESL (English as a Second Language), TESL (Teaching English as a Second Language), L1 (First language or Mother tongue), L2 (Second or Foreign Language).

Introduction

In the present era, the need to explore information and the prime requirement of global communication has turned English into an international language. It belongs not only to the British, the Americans, the Canadians, the Caribbean, the Australians, or the Africans but it also belongs to the rest of the world. English is broadly known, spoken and read by all educated people in the world. English is the only major lingua franca to have an immense impact and is taught in almost all parts of the world irrespective of the nationality, caste, creed or religion. The
rapid increase in the international exchange has raised an emergence for the masses to learn English as a second language. The English language enables the people to participate as the unit of the whole world and not just one nation. William Littlewood aptly states about the status of English as a second language, “The study of second language learning is an immensely rich and varied enterprise. Most participants in this enterprise still see its ultimate justification in terms of the desire to improve learning and teaching”¹ (Littlewood: 2006).

Individuals in different parts of world speak this language in their routine communication either as the mother tongue or as a foreign language or as a second language. The countries, whose mother tongue is not English, learn this as a second language for its enriching, enlightening and practical values. Philip B. Gove in his preface to ‘Webster’s Third New International Dictionary’ very aptly exemplifies the significance of English language, “It is now fairly clear that before the twentieth century is over every community of the world will have learned how to communicate with the rest of humanity. In this process of intercommunication the English language has already become the important language on earth.”²(Philip B. Gove: 1981)

The people of India are no exception to English. English is accepted as the second language in India. The historical account of English in India goes back to 1835 when Lord Macaulay favoured English education and he sought to enhance Indians in English language. English language has had a great footing on the Indian subcontinent, when the East India Company established settlements in almost all the major metropolitans of India. India has an old connection to English and a much longer exposure than any other country which uses it as a second language. The National Policy on Education, 1986 and Revised Programme of Action (POA) 1992 recommended English as second language in secondary schools. In 1968, the National Policy on Education laid down that “Special emphasis needs to be laid on the study of English and other international languages. World knowledge is growing at a tremendous pace, especially in science and technology. India must not only keep up this growth but should also make her own significant contribution to it. For this purpose, study of English deserves to be specially strengthened.”³ (NPE: 1968). As per the policy the language of English has been included as a second language in the school curriculum of the country. We may term it as a
language of functional value. This stature of English has imparted a novel outlook to the teaching and learning of English in the country like India.

The term ESL (English as a Second Language), indicates the usage of English in a non-native area. And the term TESL (Teaching of English as a Second Language) can be more clearly defined as a teacher centered term in which the curriculum is designed to train the pupils whose native language is not English or who are not adept in this particular language or who cannot fluently speak, write, or read English. Individuals across the world join ESL courses for numerous reasons. It may be for accomplishing school education or to get into a higher education or to join a professional course. Apart from these reasons, students generally take ESL courses to boost their career. In a nutshell, the primary purpose of an ESL course is to make an individual proficient in the use of the English language.

**Distinction between L1 & L2**

English as a second language course is chiefly planned with a range of practices and techniques to develop listening, speaking, reading, writing, and vocabulary skills. William Littlewood says about Second Language Learning, “The term ‘second language’ refers to any language that is learnt when the first language system is already in place.”⁴ (Littlewood: 2006). This means second language is consciously acquired for varied purposes whereas the first language or the native language or the language that a child picks from his family environment, before he gets into the mock atmosphere of a school, just grows naturally out of a child. There is a marked difference between the learner learning a first or native language and the learner learning any second or foreign language. “L1 refers to the language acquired or learned first by the student. It generally refers to the mother tongue or the first language of the student. L2 refers to the language or languages acquired or learned subsequent to the first language. The term Second Language also refers to the language or languages acquired or learned subsequent to the first language. It is generally assumed that the first language of a person comes to influence the quality of learning and use of the second language. In this context, the term Source Language generally refers to the first language or the mother tongue or L1 and the term Target Language refers to the second language or L2.”⁵ (M. S. Thirumalai: 2002)
Difficulties Witnessed by Non-Native Learners In India

The learners definitely require enough time and facilitation in order to maximize their second language learning potential. During this learning process they face a number of difficulties and challenges which are discussed under:

1. **Mother Tongue Influence:** The Indian pupils are found to be extremely perplexed because the second language definitely has some sort of similarities with that of the mother tongue. As S. P. Corder (1973) rightly remarks in his book Introducing Applied Linguistics, “A cursory examination of learner’s attempt to speak the target language will show that many of the forms he uses do bear a resemblance of one sort or another to that of the mother tongue” (S. P. Corder :1973).

2. **Differences between Spoken and Written English:** A well instructed child is expected to be well versed with rules of grammar and basic fundamentals but this cannot be considered favorable in the context of spoken English or English pronunciation. Mastery of rules in the target language cannot ensure the correct functional usage of English. Moreover different languages may not necessarily have a common syllable structure. So the non-natives may have problems of making distinctions between the sounds. Corder aptly remarks in this context, “A well motivated learner will eventually master the grammatical rules of the target language. The same cannot be said about his pronunciation. There appears to be some difference of kind between the learning of pronunciation and learning of the formation and speaking rules” (S. P. Corder :1973).

3. **Non-Native Teachers:** Since the paper is focused on TESL (Teaching English as a Second Language) in the Indian context, the presence of non native English teacher in the Indian classroom is but obvious. The worst challenge the Indian students face that their first exposure to the second language is helped through by the non-native teachers while
it is undoubtedly true that native English teachers can impart more authentic pronunciations and much richer expressions as compared to the non-native teachers.

4. **Perception Set Differences:** Students hailing from different cultural, family and social backgrounds may have different perceptions in the classroom. The varying backgrounds due to different cultures, experiences, exposures, values give rise to the distinct level of perception sets in these students. These differences results in communication differences and gaps and further act as a hindrance in the learning of a second language.

5. **Lack of Natural Exposure to Language:** The students have to only depend on the classroom instructions and there is an obvious lack of natural exposure to language as they have in the learning of L1 or first language. Joseph. C. Mukalet precisely observes in this connection, “The L1 is picked up at home, in the most natural situation, guided and controlled by those who are near and dear to child. The L2, on the other hand is learned in most artificial situations, the overcrowded classroom, in an atmosphere of fear, anxiety and tension.”(Joseph. C. Mukalet: 1998)

**Objectives of Teaching English as a Second Language**

For an effective teaching of English as a second language, it is very important to foresee the desirable changes a teacher expects in the pupils. So it becomes significant to determine the objectives first and then carry the instructional work in the classroom. It is particularly important for a teacher of a language. A teacher of English should keep in mind the objectives of teaching English as a Second Language. The foremost objective of teaching English as a second language is to develop the communicative skills for the expression of basic needs and for basic interactive skills. The interactive skills include listening, speaking, reading and writing. A better substitute can be suggested in order to comprehend these four basic skills in a more lucid manner. Out of these four skills of LSRW (Listening, Speaking, Reading, Writing), two of them have a receptive purpose and the other two have a productive purpose. Listening and Reading are both receptive because in this the learner is the receiver of information while the Speaking and Writing are
productive because in these two the learner happens to produce the spoken and written expression.

1. **Listening Objectives:** The learner shall be able to understand the basic expression used in the classroom. The pupil should be capable of responding to the instructions, commands and questions. The teacher of English should emphasize to demonstrate the critical understanding of any spoken discourse.

2. **Reading Objectives:** The teacher of English as a second language should enable the learner to demonstrate word recognition along with correct comprehension of the text. The learner should be able to identify the basic terminology and underlying concepts in the text. Also the pupil should become capable of skimming and scanning the text for required information.

3. **Speaking Objectives:** The teacher must ensure that the pupil should be able to speak correctly, coherently and spontaneously. This ability considerably depends upon the listening exposure to the child. Because the learner who gets enough listening to English gradually becomes efficient in the spoken aspect of language too. Pupil should also be able to communicate the basic needs like greetings, requests, directions, commands, questions, clarifications, repetitions etc.

4. **Writing Objectives:** The objectives of writing concentrate on developing in the learners the ability to write, accurately, precisely and coherently. The child should be able to sift the appropriate vocabulary and make out the differences between formal and informal expressions.

It is a pre-requisite to prune the learners at all the four levels in order to inculcate the language skills. But particularly focusing on TESL practices in the Indian classroom context, reading is probably the most important skill to be imparted to these foreign or non-native learners of English because it is only through reading they can continue to polish their communication. There is an understandable absence of speaking and listening of English in their
immediate surroundings and reading is the only platform that can impart them an exposure to this foreign language. As H.A. Cartledge also puts reading in the forefront, “Of the four skills involved in language learning-listening, speaking, reading and writing- the one which is likely to be the most useful for the students of a foreign language is reading. Many of them, unless they are able to visit a country where it is spoken, will have little opportunity of speaking and hearing the language themselves, nor will most of them have occasion to write in it. All of them, however, once they are able to read it without difficulty can go on improving their knowledge of it indefinitely.”

(H.A. Cartledge: 1955)

Methods Used in Indian Classrooms

1. **Grammar Translation Method:** This is the most popular method of teaching a second language to last even today in Indian schools. This method is popularly used in the primary classes in order to make the students relate with the things being spoken in the classroom. Most of the govt. schools also use this method of teaching English because the majority of these schools cater to the students belonging to rural areas where it becomes almost a challenge for a teacher to teach English to those who have very rare or almost nil exposure to this language. The teaching through this method is done by translating the target language or L2 into the mother tongue or L1.

2. **Direct Method:** The method does not allow the use of translation. Teaching of L2 is done using the target language only. This method is generally employed by many private and convent schools of good repute or professional institutes. Joseph Mukalet aptly remarks about the Direct Method, “The Direct Method essentially consists of learning a foreign language without the medium of the mother tongue and by having a direct association between language and experience i.e. words and phrases with objects and actions. Just as the native learner picks up new language with environmental factors: things, events, persons and features of experience, the L2 learner is expected to master the meaning and the use of a language item by directly relating it to the reality or thing itself.”

(Joseph Mukalet: 1998)
3. **Audio-Lingual Method:** The teaching in this method is done by employing useful teaching techniques like demonstration, dramatization, verbal and pictorial illustration. This method is employed to develop in the learners the aural-oral abilities. This technique is used popularly by many professional institutions which train the professionals like Engineers, Chartered Accountants, Management Trainees, Education Trainees, Lawyers, Marketing Representatives etc, and particularly the convent schools that follow the western pattern of teaching and learning.

4. **Bi-lingual Method:** In this method both the languages L1 and L2 i.e. mother tongue and target language are used, if the situation demands from a teacher to make use of L1 to help the pupil understand L2. Joseph Mukalet rightly puts up, “The mother tongue of the learner is the most potential resource at his disposal in the learning of a language and instead of shutting the door upon the mother tongue, the resource should be systematically employed in the teaching of a foreign language” (Joseph Mukalet: 1998)

Thus, different set of learners need different methods that suits best to their requirements. If we closely analyze, we find that each method has its own significance in its own right. The main stress lies on the fact that how the teacher employs that method to the best of its utility. Otherwise no method can be termed as the most appropriate one to bring about the positive learning experience. Mukalet explains the significance of teacher’s choice and his way of employing the appropriate method for teaching, “There are no whole sale methods which the teacher may be able to use without employing his own mind and originality. Any method, for that matter, requires the teacher’s final polishing touch and organization to become adequate for the use in the class room. The final result of the language learning experiences in the classroom are governed by the way the teacher employs the method”. (Joseph Mukalet: 1998)

**The Serious Flaws in the Current Scenario of TESL (Teaching English as a Second Language) In India**

A major problem is the non availability of efficient community of English tutors. The teachers available are neither trained enough nor are they aware of the current techniques of ELT. One of the most serious issues is probably the authorities’ poor planning of qualification
and eligibility requirement of English teachers. The universities in India only offer Masters in English literature and there is almost nil or very less provision for courses like M.A. in TESOL or in ELT. A teacher who has done M.A. in English literature cannot be expected to impart language learning skills in a very effective manner. Since ages students have been learning language from the teachers of literature while if we follow the opposite path the story can be entirely different. As M.E.S Elizabeth cites a quote of Palmer in her book Methods of Teaching English, “To aim at literature is to miss the way to Language. To aim at language is to pave the way to literature”.13 (M.E.S. Elizabeth: 2004).

At the maximum, our country offers Bachelor of Education and Master in Education teacher training courses under the approval of NCTE (National Council for Teacher Education) but these trained graduates or post-graduates can render their services in public or private schools only. On the other hand the eligibility for the English teachers of conventional or professional degree colleges is Masters in English literature along with qualified National Eligibility Test for lectureship. It is clearly unfair and unjust to have literature teachers for the language teaching purpose and the subsequent result is that the learners of English as a second language in our country are deprived of basic language abilities because they have not been appropriately guided.

Another problem is that the students are not able to get the required exposure to the language, because there is an absence of the real culture of English language and its native speakers. It is only the mock environment of curriculum defined classrooms or labs where these students get a tinge of exposure to this language. Moreover the examination system is just focused on judging the cramming ability of the students. How can a student restate everything in just three hour test that he has learnt in a complete year? Moreover these tests just focus on the writing skills, ignoring the very basic functional value of the language that can only be judged through speaking and listening skills. The complete stress is on the theoretical aspect rather than practical. The students may very well explain you, what is a Tense? or How many types of Tenses are there? They may very beautifully present a Tense chart in their notebook as their home assignment but practically, they are not able to speak English using the right form of tenses.
Another flaw which seems to intervene in the learning and teaching of English as a Second language is the reticent level of students and teachers in learning and teaching through use the latest equipment and technology helpful in the easy comprehension of language fundamentals. Some of the institutions cannot afford this infrastructure because of financial constraints and the institutions which can afford or already own these aids, the teachers concerned, do not prefer or are not trained enough to make a constructive usage of these aids.

**Bridging the Gap**

In the light of above discussion regarding the present scenario of English Language teaching in the country, and the ongoing chaos in its effective implementation definitely requires framing of some remedial policies to make the practice of TESL in India more efficient and dynamic.

1. The foremost necessity is to amend the policy for the teaching courses.
2. The literature teachers should also be trained in TESL and ELT practices.
3. The universities should offer specialized courses in ELT.
4. The government should encourage and extend financial aid for culture exchange programs, so as to enable the students and teachers to immerse in the real culture of English.
5. Native teachers should be invited to have extension lectures in the institutions in order to give an exposure to the original spoken dialect of English.
6. The curriculum should also emphasize on the spoken or functional value of language.
7. The examination pattern should include tests of oral and reading capability instead of just evaluating the writing efficiency.
8. More workshops stressing on the functional aspect of language should be organized for the students and teachers.
9. Schools and colleges should be encouraged to use the latest equipment and technology helpful in the easy comprehension of language fundamentals.
10. The focus in the English classroom should shift from teacher to the student which means the teacher should just act as a facilitator and the rest of the activity should be done by the student.
11. Assignment and projects that involve the student should be made mandatory.
12. Power point presentations should be encouraged.
13. The teachers and students should also be made aware of the objectives of teaching and learning English.
14. Teachers should be trained to have a thorough understanding of the appropriate method to be chosen as per the requirements of the class.

Keeping in view the above mentioned suggestions India can surely expect some positive transition in the direction to improve the TESL practices followed in the country. It is a high time that the authorities frame novel policies for the teacher training courses offered in the country. Unless the ongoing chaos in the Teaching of English Language is dealt with seriousness, we cannot expect to raise the standards of teaching English effectively in our country.

References

7. Ibid, p 133


11. Ibid, p 86

12. Ibid, p 44


Birinder Kaur, M.A., M.Phil. (English)
Ph.D. Research Scholar
Department of Management & Humanities
Sant Longowal Institute of Engineering and Technology
Longowal 148106
Punjab
India
r5sidhu@yahoo.co.in

Dr. Jap Preet Kaur Bhangu, Ph.D.
Professor
Department of Management & Humanities
Sant Longowal Institute of Engineering and Technology
Longowal 148106
Punjab
India
jkbhangu@gmail.com
Irregular Vowel Correspondence between Kakching Dialect and Standard Meiteilon

Naorem Brindebala Devi, Ph.D. Research Scholar
Prof. Ch. Yashawanta Singh

Abstract

Kakching dialect, a dialect of Meiteilon (Manipuri), is used for communication among the people of Kakching town. This dialect has some irregular phonological correspondence with the Standard Meiteilon. This correspondence is irregular or may be the case of sporadic sound change. It happens mostly in single items, sometimes two to three items. This study aims to present a clear description of irregular vowel correspondence between the Kakching dialect and standard Meiteilon, shown at syllable level.

Key words: Meiteilon, Kakching dialect, irregular correspondence (Bhat 1972)

1. Introduction

Kakching dialect (henceforth K.D.) is a variety of Meiteilon (also known as Manipuri), spoken in Kakching, which is situated in the south-eastern part of Manipur valley at a distance of about 45km. from Imphal. It has a population of about 33170 according to All India Census Report 2011. The people of Kakching use this dialect (variety) inside the town for informal as well as day to day use among themselves and they use standard dialect or Standard Meiteilon (henceforth Std.Meiteilon) while communicating with outsiders (Manipuri). Standard Meiteilon here, is the variety of Meiteilon used in Imphal area as well as in Educational institutions, public meetings, announcements, newspapers, magazines, books, articles, dictionaries, theatres, radio, television, administration, government dealings, law courts etc. in short, in education, administration and mass media. This variety (K.D.) has some difference from the Standard Meiteilon which makes this dialect variable from the latter.

The people of Kakching use Standard Meiteilon for formal use (in cases of public meeting, announcements, teaching etc.) as well as with outsiders for communication.
there are some people (a few) who use standard dialect in day to day life/circumstances. Since, this dialect is considered to be a substandard one by many, Standard Meiteilon is used for written purposes. This dialect is regional, that is, a geographical one.

Correspondence is the consistent correlation between two entities. Irregular correspondence in vowel phoneme is found between these two varieties. Variation in phonological level is found to be correspondent irregularly as geographical factor, affected by certain sporadic sound changes (Bhat, 1972). This variation in vowel phoneme is found also in Tulu, a Dravidian language, where

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Southern form (Tulu)</th>
<th>Northern form (Tulu)</th>
<th>Gloss</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>iːiː</td>
<td>idegi</td>
<td>‘belch’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>εːiː</td>
<td>keːrɛ</td>
<td>‘water snake’</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Further this is also found in Cochin dialect of Malayalam. The Trichur dialect and Ernakulam dialect of Cochin is taken up, (Somasekharan Nair, 1979)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Trichur (dialect)</th>
<th>Ernakulam (dialect)</th>
<th>Meaning/Gloss</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>eːa</td>
<td>iskeyilu</td>
<td>‘scale’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>uːiː</td>
<td>eru</td>
<td>‘pungency’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>aːu</td>
<td>aRakkuka</td>
<td>‘to cut’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>uːiː</td>
<td>orupoole</td>
<td>‘similarly’</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2. **Vowel Phoneme Irregular Correspondence**

The correspondence between these two varieties is irregular or they may be the result of sporadic sound changes. The sporadic changes affect mostly single items, sometimes two to three items. “…the sporadic ones affect only single items (two or three items in some cases) and they could not be referred to except by listing the items concerned.” (Bhat, 1972).

There is not so much irregular vowel phoneme correspondence between Kakching dialect and Standard Meiteilon which are given by listing the items only, in this study. This study is discussed in the syllable level under three headings:

(i) Correspondence in the first syllable

(ii) Correspondence in the second syllable
(iii) Correspondence in both the syllables.

2.1. Correspondence in the First Syllable

2.1.1 /u/ ~ /e/

The high back rounded vowel /u/ in the first syllable in Kakching dialect corresponds to the mid front unrounded vowel /e/ in the same environment in Std. Meiteilon in the following lexical item.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Kakching dialect</th>
<th>Std. Meiteilon</th>
<th>‘Gloss’</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>yumpak</td>
<td>yempak</td>
<td>‘parasol’</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2.1.2 /u/ ~ /o/

The high back rounded vowel /u/ in the first syllable in Kakching dialect corresponds to the mid back rounded vowel /o/ in the same environment in Std. Meiteilon. For this type of correspondence, we have taken up these given in the following lexical items.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Kakching dialect</th>
<th>Std. Meiteilon</th>
<th>‘Gloss’</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>murok</td>
<td>morok</td>
<td>‘chilly’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>muhor</td>
<td>mohor</td>
<td>‘measuring unit of gold’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>pudon</td>
<td>podon</td>
<td>‘lamp’</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

There are some other items of the same environment which shows no difference at all. For instance,

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Kakching dialect</th>
<th>Std. Meiteilon</th>
<th>‘Gloss’</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>coron (loan word)</td>
<td>coron (loan word)</td>
<td>‘feet’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>soyon (loan word)</td>
<td>soyon (loan word)</td>
<td>‘a kind of song’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>koloy</td>
<td>koloy</td>
<td>‘name (archaic)’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>poloy</td>
<td>poloy</td>
<td>‘ending’</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2.1.3. /o/ ~ /ə/

The mid back rounded vowel /o/ in the first syllable in Kakching dialect corresponds to the mid central vowel /ə/ in the same syllable in Std. Meiteilon. This can be found in case of in the following lexical item,

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Kakching dialect</th>
<th>Std. Meiteilon</th>
<th>‘Gloss’</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>koroŋcaːk yʊŋbɔ</td>
<td>karoŋcaːk yʊŋbɔ</td>
<td>‘to be somersault’</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2.1.4. /o/ ~ /e/
The mid back rounded vowel /o/ in the first syllable in Kakching dialect corresponds to the mid front unrounded vowel /e/ in the same syllable in Std. Meiteilon.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Kakching dialect</th>
<th>Std. Meiteilon</th>
<th>‘Gloss’</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>yottum</td>
<td>yettum</td>
<td>‘needle’</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The above case can be analysed in semantic domain, the lexicalised term yottum ‘needle’ in Kakching dialect has two roots that is, yot means ‘iron’ and tum- means ‘pointed’ (which is more appropriate to the meaning). This type of correspondence in this environment is not found in cases of other items relating yot ‘iron’. For instance, yotpak ‘spade’ is common to both the dialects. This may be traced back to the etymology of the items which need to be further studied.

2.1.5. /o~/u/:

The mid back rounded vowel /o/ in the first syllable in Kakching dialect corresponds to the high back rounded vowel /u/ in the same syllable in Std. Meiteilon. This type of irregular correspondence is found in the following lexical items.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Kakching dialect</th>
<th>Std. Meiteilon</th>
<th>‘Gloss’</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>nora</td>
<td>nura</td>
<td>‘bodily grim’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>nora</td>
<td>nura</td>
<td>‘cloth to wipe the floor’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>modrubu</td>
<td>muktrubu</td>
<td>‘a culinary shrub’</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2.1.6. /u~/o/:

The reverse of the above is found in this case where the high back rounded vowel /u/ in the first syllable in Kakching dialect corresponds to the mid back rounded vowel /o/ in the same syllable in Std. Meiteilon in the following lexical item.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Kakching dialect</th>
<th>Std. Meiteilon</th>
<th>‘Gloss’</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>uja</td>
<td>oja</td>
<td>‘teacher’</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2.1.7. /i~/ə/:

The high front unrounded vowel /i/ in the first syllable in Kakching dialect corresponds to the mid central unrounded vowel /ə/ in the same syllable in Std. Meiteilon in the following lexical item.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Kakching dialect</th>
<th>Std. Meiteilon</th>
<th>‘Gloss’</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>kʰiʃik</td>
<td>kʰajik</td>
<td>‘some’</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Language in India www.languageinindia.com ISSN 1930-2940 15:6 June 2015
Naorem Brindebala Devi, Ph.D. Research Scholar and Prof. Ch. Yashawanta Singh
Vowel Correspondence between Kakching Dialect and Standard Meiteilon
2.1.8 /ə~/~a/

The mid central unrounded vowel /ə/ in the first syllable in Kakching dialect corresponds to the low central rounded vowel /a/ in the same syllable in Std. Meiteilon in the given lexical items.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Kakching dialect</th>
<th>Std. Meiteilon</th>
<th>‘Gloss’</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>əjəu</td>
<td>tacəu</td>
<td>‘elder brother’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>nəhoŋ</td>
<td>nəhoŋ</td>
<td>‘cloth to piggyback a child’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>kəŋŋəu</td>
<td>kəŋŋəu</td>
<td>‘vegetable fry’</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In the case of Kakching dialect əŋŋəu and Std. Meiteilon kəŋŋəu ‘vegetable fry’, Kakching dialect kəŋŋəu seems to be nearer to the meaning that is, kəŋŋəu is a lexicalised item derived from kəŋ ‘dry’ and əŋəu- ‘to fry’ which form this particular item. Whereas in the case of kəŋŋək ‘dry laugh (ironical laugh)’, there is no such change at all.

Here is one item of this type of correspondence in the given noun incorporation form.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Kakching dialect</th>
<th>Std. Meiteilon</th>
<th>‘Gloss’</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>mai cambə</td>
<td>mai cambə</td>
<td>‘scrabrous face’</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2.1.9. /a~/~a/

In case of the following items, the mid central unrounded vowel /ə/ in first syllable in Kakching Dialect corresponds to the low central unrounded vowel /a/ in Std. dialect in the given lexical items where /a/ is added in the Kakching dialect.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Kakching dialect</th>
<th>Std. Meiteilon</th>
<th>‘Gloss’</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>həra</td>
<td>har</td>
<td>‘fertilizer’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>cəra</td>
<td>car</td>
<td>‘small plant’</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2.1.10. /a~/~ə/

The reverse of the above case is found in the following items where the low central unrounded vowel /a/ in the first syllable in Kakching dialect corresponds to the mid central unrounded vowel /ə/ in the same syllable in Std. Meiteilon in the following lexical item.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Kakching dialect</th>
<th>Std. Meiteilon</th>
<th>‘Gloss’</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>pʰəɾək</td>
<td>pʰəɾək</td>
<td>‘odd’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>tʰəɾə倬</td>
<td>tʰəɾə倬</td>
<td>‘to pluck’</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
This type of correspondence has these following items in phrasal forms:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Kakching dialect</th>
<th>Std. Meiteilon</th>
<th>‘Gloss’</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ɲa Ʉakpə</td>
<td>ɲa lokpo</td>
<td>‘to catch fish in the net’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>hakcik ɬaŋbə</td>
<td>həcik ləŋbə</td>
<td>‘to take rest in the open air’</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In the above phrasal form ɲa Ʉakpə in Kakching dialect and ɲa lokpo in Std. Meiteilon ‘to catch fish in the net’, the forms Ʉakpə and lokpo do not give the intended meaning without the noun ɲa ‘fish’. Like this, in the form hakcik ɬaŋbə in Kakching dialect and həcik ləŋbə in Std. Meiteilon ‘to take rest in the open air’, həcik and həcik is not meaningful without ləŋbə. They are noun incorporation.

2.1.11. /ə/~/e/

The mid central unrounded vowel /ə/ in the first syllable in Kakching dialect corresponds to the mid front unrounded vowel /e/ in the same syllable in Std. Meiteilon.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Kakching dialect</th>
<th>Std. Meiteilon</th>
<th>‘Gloss’</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>sə ɣa</td>
<td>se ɣa</td>
<td>‘side of the body below the armpit’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>sə ɣa</td>
<td>seגרak</td>
<td>‘armpit’</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2.1.12. /i/~/e/ 

The high front unrounded vowel /i/ in the second syllable in Kakching dialect corresponds to the mid front unrounded vowel /e/ in the same syllable in Std. Meiteilon in the following lexical items.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Kakching dialect</th>
<th>Std. Meiteilon</th>
<th>‘Gloss’</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>metʰi</td>
<td>mətʰi</td>
<td>‘last’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>tʰegaŋ</td>
<td>tʰigaŋ</td>
<td>‘waistline, loin’</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2.1.13 /əi~/i/

The diphthong /əi/ of the first syllable in the second item in Kakching dialect corresponds to the high front unrounded vowel /i/ in the same syllable of the same environment in Std. Meiteilon in the following lexical item.
2.1. Vowel Correspondence between Kakching Dialect and Standard Meiteilon

Kakching dialect | Std. Meiteilon | ‘Gloss’
--- | --- | ---
ṭʰŋəọ ləŋəo | tʰŋəọ liŋəo | ‘naughty’

2.1.14. /e/~/ai/

The mid front unrounded vowel /e/ of the first syllable in the second item in Kakching dialect corresponds to the diphthong /ai/ in the same syllable of the same environment in Std. Meiteilon. It is found in this kinship term.

Kakching dialect | Std. Meiteilon | ‘Gloss’
--- | --- | ---
item | itaimə | ‘sister in law (male ego)’

here, /ə/ in the end of Std. Meiteilon, is deleted in Kakching dialect.

2.2. Correspondence in Second Syllable

2.2.1. /i/~/a/

The high front unrounded vowel /i/ in the second syllable in Kakching dialect corresponds to the low central unrounded vowel /a/ in the same syllable in Std. Meiteilon in this noun incorporation form.

Kakching dialect | Std. Meiteilon | ‘Gloss’
--- | --- | ---
nali | nala | drain

2.2.2. /i/~/ə/

The high front unrounded vowel /i/ in the second syllable in Kakching dialect corresponds to the mid central unrounded vowel /ə/ in the same syllable in Std. Meiteilon.

Kakching dialect | Std. Meiteilon | ‘Gloss’
--- | --- | ---
pisik pikpə | pisək pickpə | ‘tiny’

2.2.3. /ə~//u/

The mid central unrounded vowel /ə/ in the second syllable in Kakching dialect corresponds to the high back rounded vowel /u/ in the same syllable in Std. Meiteilon in the given lexical item.

Kakching dialect | Std. Meiteilon | ‘Gloss’
--- | --- | ---
cakʰəm | cakʰum | ‘kitchen’
2.2.4. /u~/ə/

The high back rounded vowel /u/ in the second syllable in Kakching dialect corresponds to the mid central unrounded vowel /ə/ in the same syllable in Std. Meiteilon in the following lexical item.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Kakching dialect</th>
<th>Std. Meiteilon</th>
<th>‘Gloss’</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>yotsubi</td>
<td>yotsabi</td>
<td>‘gridiron’</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

This type of correspondence is found in the kinship term also.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Kakching dialect</th>
<th>Std. Meiteilon</th>
<th>‘Gloss’</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>inum</td>
<td>inəmmə</td>
<td>‘sister in law’</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Here mə in Std. Meiteilon is deleted in Kakching dialect.

2.2.5. /o~/u/

The mid back rounded vowel /o/ in the second syllable in Kakching dialect corresponds to the high back rounded vowel /u/ in the same syllable in Std. Meiteilon in the following given lexical item.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Kakching dialect</th>
<th>Std. Meiteilon</th>
<th>‘Gloss’</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>əmok</td>
<td>əmuk</td>
<td>‘once’</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2.2.6. /u~/o/

The reverse of the above case is found in the following item where the high back rounded vowel /u/ in the second syllable in Kakching dialect corresponds to the mid back rounded vowel /o/ in the same environment in Std. Meiteilon in this lexical item.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Kakching dialect</th>
<th>Std. Meiteilon</th>
<th>‘Gloss’</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>təummək</td>
<td>təummək</td>
<td>‘basket’</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2.2.7. /a~/ə/

The low central unrounded vowel /a/ in the second syllable in Kakching dialect corresponds to the mid central unrounded vowel /ə/ in the same syllable in Std. Meiteilon in the following phrase.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Kakching dialect</th>
<th>Std. Meiteilon</th>
<th>‘Gloss’</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>pairəkkə ləusɨŋ</td>
<td>pairəkkə ləusɨŋ</td>
<td>‘presence of mind’</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2.2.8. /e~/ə/

The mid front unrounded vowel /e/ in the second syllable in Kakching dialect corresponds to the mid central unrounded vowel /ə/ in the same syllable in Std. Meiteilon in this lexical item.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Kakching dialect</th>
<th>Std. Meiteilon</th>
<th>‘Gloss’</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>belendri</td>
<td>beləndri</td>
<td>‘lady’s finger’</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2.2.9. /ə~//i/

The mid central unrounded vowel /ə/ in the second syllable in Kakching dialect corresponds to the high front unrounded vowel /i/ in the same syllable in Std. Meiteilon in this given lexical item.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Kakching dialect</th>
<th>Std. Meiteilon</th>
<th>‘Gloss’</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>kacən</td>
<td>kacin</td>
<td>‘corner’</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2.2.10. /i~//e/

The high front unrounded vowel /i/ in the second syllable in Kakching dialect corresponds to the mid front unrounded vowel /e/ in the same syllable in Std. Meiteilon in this given phrasal form.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Kakching dialect</th>
<th>Std. Meiteilon</th>
<th>‘Gloss’</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>hobi hobi təubə</td>
<td>hobe hobe təubə</td>
<td>‘to be quick’</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2.2.11. /u~//i/

The high back rounded vowel /u/ in the second syllable in Kakching dialect corresponds to the high front unrounded vowel /i/ in the same syllable in Std. Meiteilon.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Kakching dialect</th>
<th>Std. Meiteilon</th>
<th>‘Gloss’</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>həirubop</td>
<td>həiribop</td>
<td>‘hatkora’</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It is found in this phrasal expression also,

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Kakching dialect</th>
<th>Std. Meiteilon</th>
<th>‘Gloss’</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>laiməŋ ləubə</td>
<td>laiməŋ ləubə</td>
<td>‘to access to a ritual practice of one’s life’</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Here, the item in std. dialect seems to be more appropriate to the meaning since lai is ‘God’ and miŋ is ‘name’ that may be ‘in the name of God’. The phrasal expression laiməŋ ləubə represents ‘to access to a ritual practice of one’s life’ in the name of God.
2.3. **Correspondence in Both the Syllables**

This type of correspondence is hardly found between these two dialects. Here, only four items are found for the present study.

### 2.3.1. \( /e/ \sim /o/ ; /o/ \sim /e/ \)

The mid front unrounded vowel \(/e/\) in the first syllable in Kakching dialect corresponds to the mid back rounded vowel \(/o/\) in the same syllable in Std. Meiteilon in this given lexical item. The reverse of this is found in the second syllable of the same item where the mid back rounded vowel \(/o/\) corresponds to the mid front unrounded vowel \(/e/\).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Kakching dialect</th>
<th>Std. Meiteilon</th>
<th>‘Gloss’</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>keŋgroŋ</td>
<td>kongreŋ</td>
<td>oyster</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 2.3.2. \( /a/ \sim /ə/ ; /ə/ \sim /a/ \)

The low central unrounded vowel \(/a/\) in the first syllable in Kakching dialect corresponds to the mid central unrounded vowel \(/ə/\) in the same syllable in Std. Meiteilon in this given lexical item. The reverse of this is found in the second syllable of the same item where the mid central unrounded vowel \(/ə/\) corresponds to low central unrounded vowel \(/a/\).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Kakching dialect</th>
<th>Std. Meiteilon</th>
<th>‘Gloss’</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>hagəm</td>
<td>həkam</td>
<td>‘yawn’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>nahən</td>
<td>nəhan</td>
<td>‘the day before yesterday’</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 2.3.3. \( /ə/ \sim /a/ ; /a/ \sim /ə/ \)

The mid central unrounded vowel \(/ə/\) in the first syllable in Kakching dialect corresponds to the low central unrounded vowel \(/a/\) in the same syllable in Std. Meiteilon in this given lexical item. The reverse of this is found in the second syllable of the same item where the low central unrounded vowel \(/a/\) corresponds to the mid central unrounded vowel \(/ə/\).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Kakching dialect</th>
<th>Std. Meiteilon</th>
<th>‘Gloss’</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>həraw</td>
<td>harəw</td>
<td>‘cricket’</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The phonological correspondence in vowel phoneme is also found in the dialects of Kashmiri found using in various regions of Jammu and Kashmir state like, Srinagar, Anantnag, Pulwama, Brang-Kokernag, Srigufwara, Mattan, Baramulla, Sangrama, Ajas, Kulgam etc. However, the type of correspondence discussed by Sachdeva, Dhar, and Koul in the book *A Linguistic Survey of Kashmiri*.
Dialects (2010) has some hypothetical rules where some of the dialectal differences are shown as per structural dialectological schema. For instance,

\[
Pul-\text{Ang} // i, i \approx u //
\]

Ang \(i \sim i\)

The above schema shows that Pulwama and Anantnag varieties have the vowels \([i]\) and \([\text{i}]\) in common but the words that have \([u]\) in Pulwama variety have \([i]\) and \([\text{i}]\) in Anantnag variety. For example;

\[
\begin{align*}
\text{šutil}^\text{i} & / \quad \text{šiti}^\text{i} & \text{measles} \\
\text{duh} & / \quad \text{dih} & \text{smoke}
\end{align*}
\]

But this type of hypothetical rule cannot be made up and applied to the correspondence between Kakching dialect and Std. Meiteilon. Let us discuss 2.2.9. Here, Kakching dialect \(/\text{o}\) in kac\(\text{\text{\text{\text{\text{\text{\text{o}}}}}}\) corresponds to Std. Meiteilon \(/\text{\text{i}}\) in kacin ‘corner’. But this is an exception to items as \(\text{lacy\text{
References


Naorem Brindebala Devi
Research Scholar
Department of Linguistics
Manipur University
Imphal
Manipur
India
brindebalanaorem@gmail.com

Prof. Ch. Yashawanta Singh
Department of Linguistics
Manipur University
Imphal
Manipur
India
chungkhamyash@gmail.com

Language in India www.languageinindia.com ISSN 1930-2940 15:6 June 2015
Naorem Brindebala Devi, Ph.D. Research Scholar and Prof. Ch. Yashawanta Singh
Vowel Correspondence between Kakching Dialect and Standard Meiteilon
Acoustic Characteristics of Stop Consonants during Fast and Normal Speaking Rate in Typically Developing Malayalam Speaking Children

Janet George, Final Year MASLP  
Anuja Sara Abraham, Final Year MASLP  
Arya G. S., Final Year MASLP  
Satish Kumaraswami, Assistant Professor & Ph.D. Scholar

Abstract

Stops consonants (plosives) are marked by having a complete closure in the oral tract, with the result that the acoustic record will display a measurable period of silence equivalent to this closure. The present study investigated the acoustic characteristics of stop consonants across 2 different rate of speech i.e. normal and fast rate in 7-9 years typically developing Malayalam speaking children. A total of 10 subjects participated in the study. These subjects were native speakers of Malayalam with no history of speech, language, and hearing problems. The subjects were asked to repeat back the words presented in normal and fast speaking rate. The response was recorded using PRAAT software. The acoustic parameters including mean pitch, jitter, shimmer, SNR and HNR were acoustically analysed for normal and fast rate of speech. The results indicated that there is no significant difference for acoustic characteristics of stop consonants during normal and fast rate of speech.

Key words: Stop consonants, Malayalam language

Introduction

Speech is the vocalized form of human communication. Each spoken word is formed out of the phonetic combination of a limited set of consonants and vowels speech sound unit. A vowel is a sound in spoken language, articulated with an open vocal tract so that there is no build-up of air pressure at any point above the glottis. A consonant is a speech sound that is pronounced with complete or partial closure of the vocal tract.
A stop (plosive) is an oral occlusive, a consonant in which the vocal tract is blocked so that all airflow ceases. The occlusion may be made with the tongue blade ([t], [d]) or body ([k], [g]), lips ([p], [b]), or glottis ([ʔ]). Stops contrast with nasals, where the vocal tract is blocked but airflow continues through the nose, as in /m/ and /n/, and with fricatives, where partial occlusion impedes but does not block airflow in the vocal tract. Plosives are marked by having a complete closure in the oral tract, with the result that the acoustic record will display a measurable period of silence corresponding to this closure. On a spectrogram, silence is shown by the absence of any marking throughout the frequency range; therefore all voiceless plosives will be accompanied by such a blank section on the spectrogram. Care must be taken here, however a blank section on a spectrogram will not always mean a plosive is being marked: affricates also have this feature and of course it may well correspond to simple pauses in the utterance in question.

Speech rate is the term given to the speed at which you speak. It's calculated in the number of words spoken in a minute. A normal number of words per minute (wpm) can vary hugely. Schmidt and Flege (1996) stated that speaking rate effects stops produced by Spanish and English monolinguals and Spanish/English bilinguals but the speaking rate changes exerted less effect on the VOT in stops spoken by the Spanish than the English monolinguals, whereas English monolinguals produced the stops /p,t/ with shorter VOT at a fast than at a normal rate. Many Spanish monolinguals showed a trend in the opposite direction. As expected, all 10 early bilinguals produced English stops with VOT values that were similar to the English monolinguals.

Kuwabara and Nakamura (2000) examined the acoustic and perceptual properties of syllables in continuous speech as a function of speaking rate and suggested that individual syllables do not have enough phonetic information to be correctly identified especially for the fast speech.

Miller, Green and Reeves (1986) studied the speaking rate and segments: A Look at the relation between speech production and speech perception for the voicing contrast. Two main findings emerged. First, as speaking rate became slower and overall syllable duration became longer, the VOT value of the consonant, especially that of the voiceless /p/, also became longer. Second, and most important, the VOT value that optimally separated the /b/
and /p/ VOT distributions also changed with rate, increasing with increasing syllable duration. However, the magnitude of the boundary shift obtained for these production data was greater than that typically found in perceptual experiments. This suggests the existence of constraints on the extent to which the perceptual system can accommodate for alterations due to rate of speech.

Savithri (2000) studied the acoustic characteristics of whispered stops in Kannada and found that among transition duration, burst duration, burst amplitude, closure duration and total duration closure duration appears to contrast voicing in whisper followed by total duration. Velayudhan (1975) carried out a study in Malayalam, to study the durational aspects of Malayalam vowels in isolation as well as in a variety of phonetic contexts. The results revealed that the short and long vowel tend to keep their ratio in the range of 1:2.

Manjunath, Sneha and Narasimhan (2010) investigated the changes in VOT for voiceless and voiced stop consonants in Kannada language across different speaking rates and found that VOT values were more at slower rate and lesser values at faster rates. Lohith (2010) studied the effect of speaking rate on acoustic characteristics and perception of voiced stop consonants in adult (20-24 years) Kannada speakers. The results indicated, in within speaker there was greater differences on word duration in all the rates of speech, in second formant duration in normal vs. fast and slow vs. fast, other parameters did not show any significant differences.

Studies in India have focused on perception, voice onset time for voiced and voiceless consonants in Kannada and other languages for different speaking rate and studies using acoustic parameters on stop consonants in different speaking rate have also been reported in Kannada and no studies on speaking rate have been reported in Malayalam language. Malayalam language has different accents across Kerala and people uses normal and fast rate of speech which causes difficulty for perceiving speech by listeners. Hence an attempt has been made to study the acoustic characteristics of stops during normal and fast rate of speech in typically developing Malayalam speaking children.

Aim
To analyse the acoustic characteristics of stop consonants during normal and fast rate of speech of 7-9 years typically developing Malayalam speaking children.

**Methodology**

**Subject selection**

10 Malayalam speaking normal children in age range 7-9 years participated in the present study.

**Inclusion criteria**

- Participants were within the age group of 7-9 years.
- Participants had the medium of instruction as Malayalam.
- First language (L1) was Malayalam.

**Exclusion criteria**

- The subjects selected not have any otological, neurological, psychological, ophthalmic problems or any other cognitive motor deficits.
- Academically average students were selected as per teachers report.
- All the subjects were from the same socio economic background.

**Stimulus preparation**

- Words were formulated using stops such as /p/, /b/, /t/, /d/, /k/, /g/.
- Selected words consisted of stops in initial, medial and final position.

**Recording environment**

Noise free environment was selected for recording the response. At a time one child was selected for recording. Each child was comfortably seated and asked to repeat the words which were presented to him.

**Procedure**

The child was asked to repeat words in a normal rate which the child usually uses and was asked to repeat the words in fast rate while collecting sample for normal and fast rate of
speech respectively. The stimulus was presented verbally. Voice samples were recorded using external microphone connected to the acer laptop. PRAAT voice recording and analysis software 4.6.16 version was used to analyse and record the speech samples.

Analysis

The obtained data was statistically analysed as follows:

- The acoustic characteristics of stops consonants in normal rate
- The acoustic characteristics of stops consonants in fast rate
- Comparison of acoustic characteristics of stops in normal and fast rate of speech

Mean pitch, jitter, shimmer, SNR, HNR were analysed in initial medial and final position. t- Test was used to see the significant difference between normal and fast rate of speech.

Results and Discussion

The study attempts to understand the acoustic characteristics of stops during normal and fast speaking rate in 7-9 years old typically developing Malayalam speaking children.

Each syllable was analysed for different acoustical parameters such as mean pitch, jitter, shimmer, SNR and HNR. t- Test was used to note the significant difference between normal and fast rate of speech.

The obtained data was statistically analysed and results are discussed below:

The results are given according to the following sections:

1. Comparison of each parameters in the initial position for normal and fast speaking rate.
2. Comparison of each parameters in the medial position for normal and fast speaking rate.
3. Comparison of each parameters in the final position for normal and fast speaking rate.

Group Statistics
Table 1: Showing the mean, standard deviation, and standard error mean of stop consonants in the initial, medial, and final position for normal and fast speaking rate.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rate</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Deviation</th>
<th>Std. Error Mean</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Initial</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>5.9347076E1</td>
<td>1.07514959E2</td>
<td>6.20737906</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fast Rate</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>6.0701100E1</td>
<td>1.08518223E2</td>
<td>6.26530253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medial</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>1.5762889E2</td>
<td>1.71928866E3</td>
<td>99.26317726</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fast Rate</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>6.0872067E1</td>
<td>1.09558159E2</td>
<td>6.32534327</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Final</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>6.6744465E1</td>
<td>1.42921784E2</td>
<td>8.25159307</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fast Rate</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>6.0547800E1</td>
<td>1.08942791E2</td>
<td>6.28981498</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

From the above table it is clear that the mean for normal rate in the initial position is 5.93 seconds and in the medial position is 1.57 seconds and in final position it is 6.67 seconds. And for fast speaking rate the mean in initial position is 6.07 seconds and in medial is 6.08 seconds and in final position is 6.05 seconds. The standard deviation for normal rate in the initial position is 1.07 seconds and in the medial position is 1.71 seconds and in final position it is 1.42 seconds. And for fast speaking rate the mean in initial position is 1.08 seconds in medial is 1.09 seconds and in the final position is 1.08 seconds.

The standard error mean for normal rate in the initial position is 6.20 seconds and in the medial position is 99.26 seconds and in final position it is 8.25 seconds. And for fast speaking rate the mean in initial position is 6.26 seconds in medial is 6.32 seconds and in the final position is 6.28 seconds.
Table 2: Showing the degree of significance between normal rate and fast rate in the initial, medial and final position.

From the above table it is clear that there is no significant difference between normal rate and fast rate as far as initial, medial and final factors are concerned at 5% level of significance.

Figure 1: Showing the comparison of acoustic parameters of stops such as mean pitch, jitter, shimmer, SNR and HNR in normal and fast speaking rate in the initial position.
From the above figure, it is clear that there is no much difference in mean pitch, jitter, shimmer, SNR and HNR for normal and fast speaking rate in the initial position of the stops. Slight difference is there in mean pitch, shimmer and HNR for normal and fast speaking rate.

**Figure 2**: Showing the comparison of acoustic parameters of stops such as mean pitch, jitter, shimmer, SNR and HNR in normal and fast speaking rate in the medial position.

From the above figure, it is clear that there is greater difference between the mean pitch for normal and fast speaking rate in the medial position. And there is no much difference in jitter, shimmer, SNR and HNR for normal and fast speaking rate.
Figure 3: Showing the comparison of acoustic parameters of stops such as mean pitch, jitter, shimmer, SNR and HNR in normal and fast speaking rate in the final position.

From the above figure, it is clear that there is slight difference in the mean pitch, shimmer and HNR for normal and fast speaking rate in the final position. And there is no much difference in the jitter and SNR for normal and fast speaking rate.

Discussion

The aim of the study was to understand the acoustic characteristics of stops during normal and fast rate of speech in 7-9 years of typically developing Malayalam speaking children.

From the given values it is evident that there is slight difference in mean pitch, shimmer and HNR of normal and fast rate of speech.

The result shows that there is no much difference between normal and fast speaking rate in acoustic parameters such as Mean pitch, Jitter, Shimmer, SNR and HNR.
This study is in accordance with the study of Lohith (2010) which shows that there is no significant difference between fast and normal rate of speech.

**Summary and Conclusion**

The study geared to understand the acoustic characteristics of stop consonants across 2 different rate of speech i.e. normal and fast rate in 7-9 years typically developing Malayalam speaking children. A total of 10 subjects participated in the study. These subjects were native speakers of Malayalam with no history of speech, language, and hearing problems. The subjects were asked to repeat back the words presented in normal and fast speaking rate. The response was recorded using PRAAT software. The acoustic parameters including mean pitch, jitter, shimmer, SNR and HNR were acoustically analysed for normal and fast rate of speech. The results indicated that there is no significant difference for acoustic characteristics of stop consonants during normal and fast rate of speech.

**Clinical Implication**

The results of the present study shows that, there is no much difference between the acoustic characteristics of stops in normal and fast speaking rate only some difference is there in the mean pitch, shimmer and HNR of the stops.

**Limitation**

1. The number of sample words was limited due to paucity of time.
2. Perceptual comparison was not done.
3. The obtained data was recorded in a more artificial set up compared to speech, which occurs in a more natural setting.

**Future Directions**

1. Similar studies on other types of consonants can be continued
2. Rate of speech can be better controlled for sample preparation
3. Acoustic analysis can be compared with other data for external validity
4. Study can be conducted in other Indian languages
5. Can compare across various age groups
6. Effect of dialectal variations can be considered
7. Effect of socio economic status can be considered

References


aryajalakam@gmail.com

Mr. Satish Kumaraswamy
Assistant Professor
Dr. M. V. Shetty College of Speech and Hearing
Mangalore
Karnataka
India
sat8378@yahoo.com
Abstract

The role of Brajāvalī diction in the languages used in medieval Indian Vaiṣṇava literature has been significant. This is not a language spoken in any region; it is a literary form comprising elements of various languages prevalent in different regions of Northern India --- Nepal, Orissa, Bengal and Assam were written in this form. However, regional differences of this form have also been evident. This paper is an attempt to make a contrastive study of Assamese Brajāvalī form and early Maithili. The study shows that the differences are more than the similarities between early Maithili and Assamese Brajāvalī. It arrives at a conclusion that Assamese Brajāvalī is a different language form than the early Maithili.

Introduction

The role of Brajāvalī diction in the languages used in medieval Indian Vaiṣṇava literature has been significant. This is not a language spoken in any region; it is a literary form comprising elements of various languages prevalent in different regions of Northern India --- Nepal, Orissa, Bengal and Assam were written in this form. However, regional differences of this form have also been evident. This mixed diction and style used by the Vaiṣṇava Saints of Assam, Śāṅkardeva, Mādhavadeva and their follower in their lyrics and drama have been known as Brajāvalī. The basic structure of the Brajāvalī form prevalent in Assam was its own. This form as a medium of Vaiṣṇava literature has emerged through merger of the ancient Assamese form with the elements of Brajabuli or Braj-bhākhā, Khaḍibolī, Avadhī and Maithilī.

There have been varied opinions about the origin, nature and characteristics of Brajāvalī. The opinion offered by G.A. Grierson that the origin of Brajabuli was Maithilī has been recognized by the scholar for a considerable period. Bengali scholar Sukumar Sen3 opined that, the Brajabuli was created in the hands of Bengali poets while writing poems imitating Vidyāpati’s Maithilī Padāvali. The scholar like Birinchi Kumar Barua4, Kaliram Medhi5, Satyendranath Sarma6 used to accept this opinion of Sukumar Sen. Of course, at a later stage, Sukumar Sen changed his earlier opinion and tried to relate Brajabuli with Avahaṭṭha language.7 While discussing about Brajāvalī language and literature many scholars put importance to this opinion of Sukumar Sen. Whereas Jayakanta Mishra8, the Maithilī scholar claimed ‘the lyrics and dramas written in ‘Brajāvalī’ in Assam as Maithilī literature simply pointed out to certain similarities of Brajāvalī with early Maithilī.
Objectives of the Study
1. To find out the differences between Early Maithili and Brajāvalī form of early Assamese in the context of Case-endings and Pronouns.
2. To make an attempt to establish the contrast between Brajāvalī form and early Maithili.

Discussion
1. Case-endings of Early Maithili and Brajāvalī

Although the types of case-endings in early Maithili and Brajāvalī form of early Assamese and inflections for cases in these languages are similar, in case of application of case-endings and post-positions, lot of differences are evident than similarities. Table-1 shows the case-endings used in early Maithili and Brajāvalī.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cases</th>
<th>Early Maithili case-endings</th>
<th>Brajāvalī case-endings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nominative</td>
<td>~,-e,-ê,-ñe,-hi,-hu,-hû</td>
<td>-ã,-u,-ê,-hi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accusative</td>
<td>~,-ê,-ñe,-hi,-hu,-hû</td>
<td>-ã,-e,-ka,-ku,-ko,-ta,-re</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Instrumental</td>
<td>~,-ê,-ñe,-aî,-hi,-hû</td>
<td>-i,-e,-hi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dative</td>
<td>-e,-ê,a,-hi,-hû</td>
<td>-e,-ka,-ku,-re</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ablative</td>
<td>~,-e,-hi,-hu</td>
<td>-e,-ta,-re</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Genitive</td>
<td>~,-e,-hi,-hu</td>
<td>-ka,-ku,-ra,-re,-ta,-ki,-hi,-hu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Locative</td>
<td>-e,-ê,a,-hi,-hu</td>
<td>-ã,-i,-ê,-ko,-ta,-re,-hi,-hi</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Usage of case-endings cited in table-1 have been shown below as instances:

Early Maithili

Nominative Case-endings

~  kadalî viparîta gati kaîlî(Varṇaratnâkāra of Jyotirīśvararatnâkāra)
ê  Bārīni bhelî morî lâje (Vidyāpatipadāvalī)
ê  podmē jalapraveal kaela(Varṇaratnâkāra of Jyotirīśvarara)
ñe  Viśvakarmâñe nirmmauli(Varṇaratnâkāra of Jyotirīśvarara)
hi  jadalâhi râkhala duhu disa lâja(Vidyāpatipadāvalī)
hi  tohâhi saâni dhani(Vidyāpatipadāvalī)
hu  sawâhu dekhalaani(Kṛṣṇajanama of Manabodha of Manabodha)
hû  Karâsa kâhala se sawâhû sunala(Kṛṣṇajanama of Manabodha)
**Accusative Case-endings**

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>~</td>
<td>vadana merāe dhaelanhi <strong>mukhamaṇḍalā</strong> (Rāgatarāṅginī of Locana)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e</td>
<td>Surapati dela āmūle pārijāta eka <strong>phūle</strong> (Pārijāta Harana of Umāpati)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ē</td>
<td>sisirē mahīpati <strong>dāpē</strong> cāpi kahu (Vidyāpatipadāvalī)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ūṇe</td>
<td>je jana <strong>Vidyāpatipadāvalīṇe</strong> jita se pahu morā (Vidyāvilāpa)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ĥi</td>
<td>Harihi cāhi (Vidyāpatipadāvalī)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ĥi</td>
<td>kimbā kara <strong>abhīsārahī</strong> upaśama (Vidyāpatipadāvalī)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>hu</td>
<td>vacanahu nahi nirawāhe (Vidyāpatipadāvalī)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>hū</td>
<td>nayanahū halaba niwāri (Vidyāpatipadāvalī)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Instrumental Case-endings**

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>~</td>
<td>candaka <strong>udaā</strong> kumuda jani hoe (Vidyāpatipadāvalī)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e</td>
<td>punaphale punamata guṇamati pāwai (Rāgatarāṅginī of Locana)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ē</td>
<td>sonāka <strong>dorē</strong> madhyabhāga bādhala (Varṇaratnākara of Jyotirīśvara)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ūṇe</td>
<td>mālāṇe bāndhali āhī (Vidyāpatipadāvalī)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>āi</td>
<td>namita alakāi berhala mukha-kamala sobha (Rāgatarāṅginī of Locana)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>hi</td>
<td>diwasahi ho māsa (Vidyāpatipadāvalī)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>hi</td>
<td>sahajāhi athira yawana (Vidyāpatipadāvalī)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>hū</td>
<td>jatanahū rākhac goe (Vidyāpatipadāvalī)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Dative Case-endings**

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>e</td>
<td>aba jīwana kia <strong>kāje</strong> (Pārijāta Harana of Umāpati)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ē</td>
<td>bhamara <strong>puṣpoddesē</strong> calala (Varṇaratnākara of Jyotirīśvara)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ā</td>
<td>śiṣṭa <strong>sewā</strong> baīsala chathi (Varṇaratnākara of Jyotirīśvara)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>hi</td>
<td>bipra Sudāmahi bahu jasa dela (Krṣṇajanama of Manabodhajanama)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>hu</td>
<td>dinahu hṛdayā nahi tohi (Vidyāpatipadāvalī)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Ablative Case-endings**

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>~</td>
<td><strong>Kamalā</strong> jharae makaranda(Vidyāpatipadāvalī)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e</td>
<td><strong>Paramukhe</strong> suniñe apabānī( Vidyāpatipadāvalī)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>hi</td>
<td>Bahuta kusuma vana <strong>sawahī</strong> birati mana(Vidyāpatipadāvalī)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>hu</td>
<td>talitahu teja( Vidyāpatipadāvalī)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Genitive Case-endings**

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>~</td>
<td><strong>mukulahū</strong> kamalā bhamara madhu pība(Vidyāpatipadāvalī)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e</td>
<td><strong>supuruse</strong> vaīcana-dūṣana lāgata morā(Vidyāpatipadāvalī)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>hi</td>
<td>Basudewahī sira (Krṣṇajanama of Manabodhajanama)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Subasana Mahanta, Ph.D.

Brajāvalī Form of Early Assamese and Early Maithilī: A Contrastive Study

Locative Case-endings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case</th>
<th>Assamese</th>
<th>Brajāvalī</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>-</td>
<td>kokila gāwae madhurima bāṇī ṛtū basantā (Vidyāpatipadāvalī)</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e</td>
<td>dhanu hathe (Pārijāta Haranā of Umāpati)</td>
<td>dhanu khaṣṭhā ṛn (Pārijāta Haranā of Umāpati)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ē</td>
<td>Amṛtaḥu jina svādē (Varnaratnākara of Jyotirīśvara)</td>
<td>Amṛtaḥu jina svādē (Varnaratnākara of Jyotirīśvara)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ā</td>
<td>sājhaḥa bērā jamunākā tīrā (Varnaratnākara of Jyotirīśvara)</td>
<td>sājhaḥa re jāe (Rāgaraṅgaṇī of Locana)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>hi</td>
<td>Khaṇāhi mahābala dela bidārī (Rāgaraṅgaṇī of Locana)</td>
<td>Khaṇāhi mahābala dela bidārī (Rāgaraṅgaṇī of Locana)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>hu</td>
<td>sejahu toria nāma (Vidyāpatipadāvalī)</td>
<td>sejahu toria nāma (Vidyāpatipadāvalī)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>hū</td>
<td>nagaraḥu nāgara bolia (Vidyāpatipadāvalī)</td>
<td>nagaraḥu nāgara bolia (Vidyāpatipadāvalī)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Assamese Brajāvalī

Nominative Case-endings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case</th>
<th>Assamese</th>
<th>Brajāvalī</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ā</td>
<td>Mohe re mahagonalā (Bargīt of Mādhavadeva)</td>
<td>Mahagonalā re dheraḥu bānā ṛn (Bargīt of Mādhavadeva)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>u</td>
<td>Re soi gopāla piyāru meri ṛdhāru madhupuri rahe (Bargīt of Śaṅkaradeva)</td>
<td>Re soi gopālu piyāru meri ṛdhāru madhupuri rahe (Bargīt of Śaṅkaradeva)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e</td>
<td>Jarāsandhe dekhala (Rukmini Haran Nāt of Śaṅkaradeva)</td>
<td>Jarāsandhe dekhala (Rukmini Haran Nāt of Śaṅkaradeva)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>hi</td>
<td>Śrīkrṣṇak bibāha dite sawahī niścaya kayal (Rukmini Haran Nāt of Śaṅkaradeva)</td>
<td>Śrīkrṣṇak bibāha dite sawahī niścaya kayal (Rukmini Haran Nāt of Śaṅkaradeva)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Accusative Case-endings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case</th>
<th>Assamese</th>
<th>Brajāvalī</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ā</td>
<td>badana binindita cāndā (Bhaṭṭimā of Śaṅkaradeva)</td>
<td>badana binindita cāndā (Bhaṭṭimā of Śaṅkaradeva)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e</td>
<td>durjana bānāre dilā āpuni āsān (Bhuṃī ṛṇowā of Mādhavadeva)</td>
<td>durjana bānāre dilā āpuni āsān (Bhuṃī ṛṇowā of Mādhavadeva)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ka</td>
<td>dharamakā karamakā garabakā chori (Guru Bhaṭṭimā of Mādhavadeva)</td>
<td>dharamakā karamakā garabaka chori (Guru Bhaṭṭimā of Mādhavadeva)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ku</td>
<td>sohi hari caranaku bichuri rahae napāi (Bargīt of Śaṅkaradeva)</td>
<td>sohi hari caranaku bichuri rahae napāi (Bargīt of Śaṅkaradeva)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ko</td>
<td>koṭi karama kāya, hariko nāhi pāya (Bargīt of Śaṅkaradeva)</td>
<td>koṭi karama kāya, hariko nāhi pāya (Bargīt of Śaṅkaradeva)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ta</td>
<td>Satyabhāmā piuta puchata (Pārijāt Haranā Nāt of Śaṅkaradeva)</td>
<td>Satyabhāmā piuta puchata (Pārijāt Haranā Nāt of Śaṅkaradeva)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>re</td>
<td>Rādhā jagāilā Harīre (Bhuṣaṇa-haraṇa of Mādhavadeva)</td>
<td>Rādhā jagāilā Harīre (Bhuṣaṇa-haraṇa of Mādhavadeva)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Instrumental Case-endings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case</th>
<th>Assamese</th>
<th>Brajāvalī</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>i</td>
<td>āsiye koutuki (Rukmini Haran Nāt of Śaṅkaradeva)</td>
<td>āsiye koutiluki (Rukmini Haran Nāt of Śaṅkaradeva)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e</td>
<td>Krṣṇamukha padmamadhu netre piye brajabadhu (Bargīt of Śaṅkaradeva)</td>
<td>Krṣṇamukha padmamadhu netre piye brajabadhu (Bargīt of Śaṅkaradeva)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>hi</td>
<td>beṛhala lānjahi (Kāliya Daman Nāt Śaṅkaradeva)</td>
<td>beṛhala lānjahi (Kāliya Daman Nāt Śaṅkaradeva)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Dative Case-ending

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>e</td>
<td>Nanda gela <strong>bāthāne</strong> (Bargīt of Mādhavadeva)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ka</td>
<td>kācaka cāhite jono māṇika harāi (Rukmini Haran Nāṭ of Saṅkardeva)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ku</td>
<td><strong>Kuṇḍinakku</strong> āwe mohana murāru (Rukmini Haran Nāṭ of Saṅkardeva)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>re</td>
<td>Jamunāre gailā hāmu nira ānibāre (Bhūmi Leṭowā of Mādhavadeva)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Ablative Case-Endings

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>e</td>
<td>nayane nigare nira (Cordharā of Mādhavadeva)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ka</td>
<td>Gopīsawā <strong>Kṛṣṇā</strong> sanmāna pāi (Keligopāl Nāṭ of Saṅkardeva)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ta</td>
<td>Purandarata anumati pāi (Pārijāt Haranā Nāṭ of Saṅkardeva)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ra</td>
<td>Batsa Batsapālasavā <strong>swapnara</strong> Jāgi (Kāliya Damān Nāṭ of Saṅkardeva)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Genitive Case-ending

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ka</td>
<td>kaha mohe <strong>kaṇuk</strong> bātā (Bargīt of Saṅkardeva)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ku</td>
<td>Hariku nāma <strong>nimamaku</strong> (Bargīt of Mādhavadeva)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ki</td>
<td>tohō <strong>Jagannāṭhakī</strong> dāsa (Bhojana Behār of Mādhavadeva)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ra</td>
<td>fāndilō <strong>māyāra</strong> pāse (Bargīt of Saṅkardeva)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>re</td>
<td>napāliō <strong>bhāyāre</strong> udiśa (Bhojana Behār of Mādhavadeva)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ta</td>
<td>āvara sākṣīta kamana prayojana (Cordharā of Mādhavadeva)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>hi</td>
<td>rājamahiṣī kānde <strong>manahi</strong> santāpe (Bhātīmā of Saṅkardeva)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>hu</td>
<td><strong>Banahu</strong> mālā śohe (Bhātīmā of Mādhavadeva)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Locative Case ending

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ā</td>
<td>dahśita kāla bhujāṅgama <strong>aṅgā</strong> (Bargīt of Mādhavadeva)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>i</td>
<td>Jagajana jīvana rahu <strong>hrdi</strong> rāmā (Bargīt of Mādhavadeva)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e</td>
<td>buke bāndhi <strong>kole</strong> laila (Bargīt of Mādhavadeva)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ko</td>
<td><strong>Kaliko</strong> parama dharama harināma parhi (Bargīt of Saṅkardeva)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ta</td>
<td>māṭita pava parave nāhi (Rukmini Haran Nāṭ of Saṅkardeva)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>re</td>
<td>kahaya mādhava gati nanda nandana <strong>pāware</strong> (Bargīt of Mādhavadeva)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>hi</td>
<td>mana meri rāma <strong>caṇṇahī</strong> lāgu (Bargīt of Saṅkardeva)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>hi</td>
<td>Kālindī pulina <strong>banahī</strong> jadunandana (Bargīt of Mādhavadeva)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Different between the Two Languages

In both the languages we find the application of all the cases without endings. With regard to application of case endings lots of differences are evident than similarities. As a sign of endings the use of nasal consonant ~ (nasal) in early Maithilī is a significant characteristic. The use of ~ (nasal) is seen in all the cases except the dative case. But it is
Language in India www.languageinindia.com ISSN 1930-2940 15:6 June 2015
Subasana Mahanta, Ph.D.
Brajāvalī Form of Early Assamese and Early Maithilī: A Contrastive Study

not so in case of Assamese Brajāvalī. The use of ‘-e’ and ‘-hi’ in the application of nominative case in Assamese Brajāvalī are also present in early Maithilī; but the use of ‘-ā’ and ‘-u’ in early Maithilī is not evident. It seemed that the use of ‘-e’ in the singular number of nominative case is an impact of Māgadhī Prākrit. It is used in Assamese literature of pre-Sankardeva period also. In the works (Apabhraṃśa writings) of the Sahajiyā Buddhist Siddhāchāryas of the eastern area we find the use of ‘-h’ and ‘-ho’ in the singular number of the nominative case. Their works are claimed as a common treasure of early New Indo-Aryan languages of eastern India. Therefore it can be assumed that the ‘-hi’ form used in early Maithilī and Assamese Brajāvalī is from the same root.

The use of ‘-u’ in Assamese Brajāvalī is a general characteristic of Apabhraṃśa which is not seen in early Maithilī. Lots of examples are evident in its grammar and literature. In the same way we find lots of use of ‘-ā’ in the plural number of Nominative and Accusative case in Apabhraṃśa. It is used in Assamese Brajāvalī but not in early Maithilī. The use of ‘-ka’, ‘-ku’, ‘-ta’, ‘-re’ in the accusative case of Assamese Brajāvalī are also not found in early Maithilī. The use of ‘ka’ and ‘ku’ could be found in the Caryāpadas. We find the use of ‘-ta’ in the language of pre-Śankardeva literature. The use of ‘-re’ in accusative case could be found in Caryāpadas.

The use of ‘-i’, ‘-e’, ‘-hi’ in instrumental case of Assamese Brajāvalī are found in Apabhraṃśa also. There is the use of ‘-a’ and ‘-hi’ in early Maithilī, but no use of the ending ‘-e’. The sign of endings used in dative case are: ‘-e’, ‘-ka’, ‘-ku’ and ‘-re’. The only similarity with early Maithilī is the use of the ending ‘-e’. Among the endings of ablative case the only similarity between early Maithilī and Assamese Brajāvalī is ‘-e’. Its use is found in Caryāpada also. There is no use of ‘-k’, ‘-ta’ and ‘-ra’ in early Maithilī which are used in Assamese Brajāvalī.

On the other hand the use of the endings ‘-ta’ and ‘-ra’ are found in the language of Assamese literature of pre-Śankardeva period. The use of the endings ‘-hi’ and ‘-hu’ of genitive case which are seen in both languages are mainly from Apabhraṃśa. The use of ‘-ka’, ‘-ra’ and ‘- ta’ of Assamese Brajāvalī, which are evident in early Maithilī, are also found in the Ramayana by Madhava Kandali during the pre-Śankardeva period. The use of ‘-ka’ and ‘-ra’ in genitive case are seen in Caryāpadas also.

Along with some similarities between early Maithilī and Assamese Brajāvalī there are some dissimilarity in use of the endings of locative case. The endings ‘-a’, ‘-e’, ‘-ā’, ‘-hi’, ‘-hu used in early Maithilī are not there in Assamese Brajāvalī. On the other hand, the use of endings ‘-i’, ‘-ko’, ‘-ta’, ‘-re’ used in Assamese Brajāvalī are not found in early Maithilī. Moreover the endings used in nominative and accusative case, ablative and genitive case are same in early Maithilī while in Assamese Brajāvalī they are not same.
Use of Post-positions

In Assamese Brajāvalī post-position is added after the accusative, dative, ablative, locative case and with genitive case. There are some noticeable differences between the two languages regarding application of post-positions. The post positions used in early Maithilī and Assamese Brajāvalī are given below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cases</th>
<th>Ancient mithilī</th>
<th>Assamese brajavalī</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Accusative</td>
<td>kaē, ke, kā, kē, kū, sō</td>
<td>kaho</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Instrumental</td>
<td>sa, sā, sañ, saña, sañe, se, te, tē, taha</td>
<td>-----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dative</td>
<td>ke, kā, kē, lāgi, lae, sō</td>
<td>lāi, lāgi, pāśā, nimitta</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ablative</td>
<td>saño, sō, sāu, ta, tahu, tāhi, hate, sante, hunte</td>
<td>hante</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Genitive</td>
<td>era, eri, kā, kē, ki, kaē, ke, kī, kara, kerā, kero, keri, kāha, kāha, tē,</td>
<td>kara, keri, kaho</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Locative</td>
<td>ta, taño, tē, pae, kaē, tū, kaai, kāi, madhye, me, matra</td>
<td>maha, madhye, mājhe</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

From the above tables it is clear that ‘lagi’ used in dative case of Assamese Brajāvalī, ‘madhye’ used in locative case and other post positions used in Maithilī are not similar.

2. Pronoun

There are two forms of pronouns in both early Maithilī and Assamese Brajāvalī: direct and oblique. Although a few of these pronoun forms have similarity, dissimilarity is also evident between the two languages. In the following table a sample of similarities and dissimilarities are given with the different pronoun forms of the two languages.

Personal Pronoun

Form of First Person

In Assamese Brajāvalī the forms of nominative-instrumental case and accusative-dative case are similar:
Some usages of the forms mentioned above are shown in the tables below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Nominative/ Instrumental</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>mañi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>hāmi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>hāmu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>hāmo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>āmi</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Accusative/dative</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>meri</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>moi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>moke</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>more</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>mohi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>mohe</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>hāmāka</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>hāmāri</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>hāmāku</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>āhmāka</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>hāmāre</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Genitive</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>maha</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>merā</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>meri</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>mero</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>moi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>mora</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>morā</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>mohi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>mohe</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>mohora</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>hāmāka</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>hāmāku</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>hāmākeri</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>hāmāra</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The forms of the first person pronouns used in earlyt Maithilī are given below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case</th>
<th>nominative</th>
<th>accusative</th>
<th>Dative</th>
<th>Genitive</th>
<th>Locative</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>hāmāta</td>
<td>hāmāta hāta lagāvalī (A.Bha.)</td>
<td>hāmāta hāma, hāma, mohe, hame, hameu, hamahū, āmi</td>
<td>hāmāta hāma, mo, mohi, morā</td>
<td>hāmāta hama, mo, mora, morā, mori, morē, moya, majhu, hamarā, hamara, hamari, hamārā, hamāre, hamāri, hamē</td>
<td>hāmāta hāmāta hāta lagāvalī (A.Bha.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>āmāta</td>
<td>ābe tomāra āmāta cāturi (Pi.Gu)</td>
<td>āmāta āma, mohi, mohe, hame, mo, majhu</td>
<td>āmāta hama, mo, mohi, morā</td>
<td>āmāta hama, mo, mora, morā, mori, morē, moya, majhu, hamarā, hamara, hamari, hamārā, hamāre, hamāri, hamē</td>
<td>āmāta hāmāta hāma, hāma, mohe, hame, hameu, hamahū, āmi</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In the following table depicts some examples of the usage of the above forms:

**Nominaive**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case</th>
<th>Nominative</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>hama</td>
<td>na hama karaba ote (Rāgatarāṅgini of Locana)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>haño</td>
<td>lāwaño raṇabhāṇa (Kṛtilātā of Vidyāpatī)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>hāma</td>
<td>ki kahaba hāma (Vidyāpatipadāvalī)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>hama</td>
<td>hama hayaba magana (Kṛṣṇajanama of Manabodha)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>mohe</td>
<td>jāeba mohe (Rāgatarāṅgini of Locana)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>mañe</td>
<td>kī sakhi kahaba mañe (Vidyāpatipadāvalī)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>mañi</td>
<td>mañi nagaraka sakha sohara dekhi jāño (Varṇaratnākara of Jyotirīśvara)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>hameu</td>
<td>hameu dharaba jive (Vidyāpatipadāvalī)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>āmi</td>
<td>kathā āmi (Vidyāpatipadāvalī)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Accusative**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case</th>
<th>Accusative</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>hama</td>
<td>hama je ānaole (Vidyāpatipadāvalī)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>mo</td>
<td>kahahi mo sakhi (Vidyāpatipadāvalī)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>mohi</td>
<td>bihi chalalihu mohi (Vidyāpatipadāvalī)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>mohe</td>
<td>kī puchasi mohe nidāna (Vidyāpatipadāvalī)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>majhu</td>
<td>majhu nāhi bhula (Vidyāpatipadāvalī)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>hame</td>
<td>hame heraite (Vidyāpatipadāvalī)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Dative**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case</th>
<th>Dative</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>hama</td>
<td>hama dehu mukuti gopālā (Vidyāpatipadāvalī)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>mo</td>
<td>mo janu deha upekhī (Vidyāpatipadāvalī)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>mohi</td>
<td>biṣa dela mohi (Vidyāpatipadāvalī)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Subasana Mahanta, Ph.D.

Brajāvalī Form of Early Assamese and Early Maithilī: A Contrastive Study

From the above examples, we find that ‘mañi’ and ‘ami’ of nominative case; ‘mohi’ and ‘mohe’ of accusative and dative case; ‘mor’, ‘morā’, ‘hāmāri’ and ‘majhu’ of genitive case—there are no similarities between early Maithilī and Assamese Brajāvalī except these forms. It is notable that the usage of ‘mañi’, ‘mor’ and ‘āmi’ are found in pre-Śaṅkaradeva Assamese literature.

Similarly, in case of the pronoun forms of second and third person, there are more differences than similarities between ancient Maithilī and Assamese Brajāvalī. It will be evident from the tables given below:

**Forms of Second Person**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case</th>
<th>Early Maithilī</th>
<th>Assamese Brajāvalī</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nominative</td>
<td>tu, to, tuhu, tuhū, tañe, tae, tohe, toñe, tōhū, tohi</td>
<td>tañi, tumi, tumahi, toho, tohosava, tohosave, torāsava, torāsava, tumisava</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accusative</td>
<td>tohi, tohe, toha, tohī, tohē, toya</td>
<td>tore, tohoka, toho, torāka, torāsavaka, tumāka, tohāka</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Instrumental</td>
<td>tohe</td>
<td>tohāka lägi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dative</td>
<td>tua, tohi, toya, toha, torā, tohe, toe</td>
<td>tohāka lägi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ablative</td>
<td>tohi, tohi, tohāhi</td>
<td>tomātese hante, tohotese</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Genitive</td>
<td>tumha, tua, torā, toha, tora,tori, tohi, tore, toya, tohā, tohara, tohahi, tohāra, tohāri</td>
<td>tacu, taju, tuvā, terā, teri, tere, tava, tāi, tora, torāka, toraka, tore, tohmāra, tohmāre, tohāka, tohāra, tohākeri, tohāri, tohora, tohe, torāsavaka, torāsavara</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Locative</td>
<td>tohā, tehā</td>
<td>tohāta</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Forms of Third Person

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case</th>
<th>Early Maithili</th>
<th>Assamese Brajāvalī</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>nominative</td>
<td>se, seho, sehu, sehe, seha, seo, tanhi, tani, tē, tehe, sehao</td>
<td>teño, teho, tārāsave</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>accusative</td>
<td>se, seo, tā, tāhi, tanhi, tehī, tehū</td>
<td>tacu, tanika, tāka, tākara, tāku, tāre, tāheka, tārāsavaka, tāsambāka, tāsambāta, tāsu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Instrumental</td>
<td>tehi, tē</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dative</td>
<td>tā, tā, tāhi, tanhi, tanikā</td>
<td>tāku, tāre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ablative</td>
<td>tāhi, tāhe, tāte</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>genitive</td>
<td>tāheri, tahu, tāsu, tanhi, tanhikara, takarā, takari, takarē, tākara, tanhikari, tanhikā, tanhike, tāka, tanhikē, tanhiki, tanikai, tanike, tāhukara</td>
<td>tāthi, tanikara, tā, tākara, tākeri, tāsu, tāhe, tāheri, tārāsavaka, tārāsavara, tāsambāra, tāheka</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Locative</td>
<td>tāhe, tāhi, tā, tā, tathi</td>
<td>tāhe</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It is seen from the above tables that except tor, tore, tohāri of second person pronoun of genitive case and tāheri, tāsu, tākar of third person pronoun of genitive case there are no similarities between early Maithili and Assamese Brajāvali.

Demonstrative Pronoun

Near Demonstrative Pronoun

The following table shows the forms of near demonstrative pronouns applied in early Maithili and Assamese Brajāvali:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case</th>
<th>Early Maithili</th>
<th>Assamese Brajāvalī</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nominative</td>
<td>I, iithe, i, ehe, ei, ihe</td>
<td>e, i, iha, isava, ohi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accusative</td>
<td>ehi, eha, i, iha, ī, enhi</td>
<td>aheka, ihāka, isavaka</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Genitive</td>
<td>ekari, ekarē, ekarī</td>
<td>ehāra, ihāka, unikara</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Far Demonstrative Pronoun

The following table shows the forms of far demonstrative pronouns applied in early Maithili and Assamese Brajāvali:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case</th>
<th>Early Maithili</th>
<th>Assamese Brajāvalī</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nominative</td>
<td>se, seho, sehu, sehe, seha, seo, tanhi, tani, tē, tehe, hehao</td>
<td>se, sohi, soi, so, sesaba, sesabo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accusative</td>
<td>se, seo, tā, tehū, tāhi, tehī, tanhi, tāhi</td>
<td>se</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
It is evident from the above tables that in case of near demonstrative pronoun and far demonstrative pronoun except ‘i’ of nominative case and ‘se’ of accusative case there is no similarity between early Maithili and Assamese Brajvali.

**Indefinite-Interrogative**

**Indefinite Pronoun**

The following table shows the forms of indefinite pronouns applied in ancient Maithili and Assamese Brajvali:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case</th>
<th>Early Maithili</th>
<th>Assamese Brajvali</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nominative</td>
<td>koe, keo, kehu, kēhū, keu</td>
<td>keu, kebā, kāhu, kamane, keva, keho, koi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accusative</td>
<td>kāhu, koi, kāhū, kakarahu, kakarihu</td>
<td>kāhāku, kāhuka</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Genitive</td>
<td>kakarahu, kakarihu</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ablative and genitive</td>
<td>kañonaka, kāhuka</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Interrogative Pronoun**

The following table shows the forms of interrogative pronouns applied in early Maithili and Assamese Brajvali:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case</th>
<th>Early Maithili</th>
<th>Assamese Brajvali</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nominative</td>
<td>kañone, kone, kedahu</td>
<td>ki, ke, kenā, kisaka, koi, kona, konano, kone, kinā, kamane, kā</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accusative</td>
<td>kāhi, kāhī</td>
<td>kāheka, kāre,kāhe, kāhāka</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dative</td>
<td>konē</td>
<td>ki nimitte, kona nimitta, ki lägi, kāhe, kāhā lägi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Genitive</td>
<td>kakara, kañona, kāhakara,</td>
<td>kāheka, kāhera, kāheri, kāhāka</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ablative and genitive</td>
<td>kñonaka</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

From the above tables it is evident that in case of indefinite and interrogative pronoun also a few forms are similar in early Maithili and Assamese Brajvali. It is notable that regarding the forms of these pronouns, Assamese Brajvali is more similar to...

**Conclusion**

The foregoing contrastive analysis of the usage of case endings and the forms of pronouns shows that the differences are more than the similarities between early Maithili and Assamese Brajāvalī. However, the causes of a few similarities can be substantiated by the opinions of Sukumar Sen and Kanika Tomar. According to them Brajabuli developed from Avahaṭṭha. Sukumar Sen is the first one to establish this opinion. According to him Avahaṭṭha is not a property of a particular region. It is a common asset of the Aryan language and from this perspective it is the youngest standard literary Āryan language. The medium of folk literature of the period from ninth century AD to fifteenth century AD of the whole Āryābarta had been Avahaṭṭha. The literatures written by the Brahmin pundits for the elite readers were in Sanskrit. However, the Buddhist and Jain writers always preferred folk languages. The Sahajani Buddhists and the Nath-Yogis used the folk Avahaṭṭha in their verses. The Brajabuli or the Brajāvalī used by the poets of the north-east in their songs, poems and dramas were based on Avahaṭṭha. The comparison in terms of phonology, morphology and vocabularies proves the veracity of this statement. Thus, it can be concluded that Assamese Brajāvalī is a different language form than the early Maithili.

======================================================================

**References**


4 Baruah, Birinchi Kumar, Ankīyā Nāṭ(A Collection of Sixteen Assamese Dramas), Government of Assam, Gauhati, 1940, pp. x-xi.

5 Medhi, Kaliram, op.cit.


==============================================================================

**Bibliography**

Baruah, Birinchi Kumar, *Ankiya Nat*, Government of Assam, Gauhati, 1940


---

Dr. Subasana Mahanta
Associate Professor
Department of Assamese
Dibrugarh University
Dibrugarh 786004
Assam
India
subasanam9@gmail.com
Abstract

The paper deals with the myth associated with the giving of gifts. The custom of gift-giving has been passed down the ages. Gift-giving custom dates back to early civilizations. Gifts symbolise love, respect and regard. They make someone feel important. They are given to reaffirm ties and strengthen bonds. A myth encapsulates within its purview a story, especially one revolving around the early history of a nation. It may describe a natural or social phenomenon and may typically involve supernatural beings or events.

Key words: Myth, gift-giving myths, symbolization, supernatural, affirmation of bonds.

Myth – a Story Revolving around the Early History of a Nation

A myth encapsulates within its purview a story, especially one revolving around the early history of a nation. It may describe a natural or social phenomenon and may typically involve supernatural beings or events. It could be handed down for generations Myths can be spectacular and they can regale the old and the young with their interesting episodes. They have fascinated people. They are priceless and they are enshrined in the hearts and minds of people.
Focus of This Paper – Giving of Gifts

The paper deals with the myth associated with the giving of gifts. The custom of gift-giving has been passed down the ages. Gift-giving custom dates back to early civilizations. Gifts symbolise love, respect and regard. They make someone feel important. They are given to reaffirm ties and strengthen bonds. The gift-giving tradition perhaps could be traced back to 4th century when Saint Nicholas, today known as Santa Claus, generously gave away gifts to children and even rehabilitated families. Later in the 16th century, in Dutch folklore, the Santa Claus was named as ‘Father Christmas’ who reached out to even the older generation. Soon, the figure of Santa Claus took an iconic dimension.

O. Henry’s Della and Jim

The concept of giving gifts perhaps began with the three Magis who presented the Christ child with precious gifts. O. Henry writes a moving story of the selfless love of Della and Jim in his story, “The Gift of the Magi”. The story vividly records an act of love. Della and Jim are a couple whose immense love for each other is quite incredible. Christmas Eve is the time when their love for each other would be put to the test. “One dollar and eighty-seven cents. That was all. And sixty cents of it was in pennies” (1).

For Jim and Della, poverty is not a hindrance in reaching out to each other. Despite their poverty, both try ways and means of giving each other a gift. Della rushed to the store to buy a watch chain for her dear Jim, the watch which would even make King Solomon envy him. Having bought the watch chain for Jim, she waits anxiously for his arrival. As she waits, she prays hoping that Jim would still love her just as she is. She is not worried about the way she looks. She only hopes that Jim’s love for her would not diminish in any way.

When Jim enters the house with his Christmas gift in his arms, he is surprised to see Della in a different hairstyle. He is shocked because, he had bought her a set of combs which she would not be able to use, at least for the time being. When Della opens the packet, she is just as happy as she is heartbroken too. Later, Jim opens his Christmas gift only to find that the watch chain that Della had bought would be of no use to him because he had just sold his watch to buy Della a beautiful set of combs for Della.

The genuine love of both Jim and Della has become legendary.

Emphasis on the Inner Man

The story of the Magis who bought expensive gifts for the Christ child echoes in different dimensions, one of which is O’ Henry’s ‘Gift of the Magi”. It is clear from the story the extent to which the couple adored each other. There is yet another aspect which is addressed time and again and that is the spirit of love which owes its origin to God. Besides, narrating a story of true love, the author subtly stresses on the inner man. The sacrifice as can be seen is pure and
unconditional. It was a pure act of love which completely surpassed all other concerns. More than anything else, Della and Jim were giving over themselves to each other. Whether the gifts they bought for each other were of any use to them or not for the moment, they liked to express their love rather palpably. What they finally found was common ground—love which needed no language to make its presence felt.

Through Gift - Reaffirmation of Valued Presence

Most people feel neglected if they are not given a gift on Christmas. So gifts actually reaffirm loved ones of their valuable presence. They help people bond together very well. Gifts are so symbolic that they reveal a lot about the personality of the giver. Russell W. Belk says in his article, “Possessions and the Extended Self “that possessions are an important component of a sense of self” (139). Gifts become an integral part of a person’s self and so if these material possessions are lost, then a piece of self is lost. In the story, ‘Gift of the Magi”, Jim and Della were poor in the worldly sense but as they sacrificially bought each other gifts, they were extending their very selves in true adoration of each other.

Perception of Needs – Being Looked at versus Being Seen

Aafke Komter says in his article “Gifts and Social Relations: The Mechanism of Social Reciprocity”, “What one gives is not dependent on what one has received, but springs from one’s perception of other people’s needs” (98). Jim and Della were so close to each other that they knew what the other needed. The gifts, though useless for the moment, spoke much about what they meant to each other. In his article’ What Joy to the World really means,” Dr. Kelly Flanagan, a psychologist says that there is difference between “being looked” at and “being seen”. To put it in the psychologist’s own words, “being looked at, is our greatest sorrow, while being seen is our greatest joy”.

According to Dr. Flanagan, when a person is looked at, it is done rather in a casual manner. On the other hand, when he is being seen, he is noticed and is given the lot of attention.

A precious gift can in its unique way express rather tangibly this idea of being seen and recognised. A person could be far away and yet give the impression of just being close to the loved one. St. Paul in the Bible conveys the same idea when he writes a letter to Thessalonians (I Thessalonians 2:17) “But we, brethren, being taken from you for a short time in presence, not in heart, endeavoured the more abundantly to see your face with great desire”.
Another Novel on Gift-giving: *Pollyanna* by Eleanor H. Porter

There is yet another interesting novel which revolves around the subject of gifts. This novel is entitled *Pollyanna* by Eleanor H. Porter. The main character is named Pollyanna Whittier, a young orphan who goes to live in Beldingsville, Vermont, with her affluent but arrogant Aunt Polly. Pollyanna's philosophy of life revolves around what she calls "The Glad Game," an optimistic attitude, she got from her father. The game is just about finding something to be glad about in every situation of life.

In the novel *Pollyanna*, the protagonist Pollyanna herself is a gift to Beldingsville, a town in New England. With her remarkable optimism, she infuses a new hope in the inhabitants of the little town which had been overshadowed by a pall of gloom. Her encouraging words revive people who are living on the fringes of society. Pollyanna meets a lady called Mrs. Snow, who is on her deathbed, making preparations for her impending funeral. In the beginning, the lady is hostile to Pollyana. When nothing that Pollyanna says convinces her, Pollyana retorts saying that she need not worry about her death as long as she lived. She reassured her that she was as alive and vibrant as any other living person on the earth. Pollyanna’s positive words revived Mrs. Snow’s sagging spirits finally.
Proverbs 18:21 says, ‘Death and life are in the power of the tongue. And they that love it shall eat the fruit thereof.’ Pollyanna had been persuading the lady to say positive words which would infuse new life into her. When she finally complied, she found it worthwhile ultimately.

Charles Cabbs says in his book, *Tongue: A Creative Force*, “words are the most powerful things in the universe! The words you speak will either put you over in life or hold you in bondage. Many people have been held captive in their circumstances by their own words” (1).

Pollyanna brings joy and hope to the haughty and miserly bachelor, Pendleton. In the beginning, he drives her out of his huge mansion. But as Pollayanna leaves the place, she leaves behind something for Pendleton to ponder about. Her eyes fall on an beautiful object which has a prism effect on the wall. She points out the effect to Pendleton. Pendleton might have seen it many times but then when he sees it through the bright eyes of the bold Pollyanna, his attitude towards life itself changes.

There is a divine touch that most people miss out on. They need people like Pollyanna to find the lost light which could enlighten their eyes. People should make the most of what they have. The entire universe is full of God’s splendour and grandeur. The truly amiable find it and receive the gift of joy and happiness they actually deserve.

References


Dr. Olive Thambi
Assistant Professor of English
LRG Government Arts College for Women
Palladam Road
Near Tamil Nadu Theatre
Tiruppur 641604
Tamil Nadu
India
olivphilip@gmail.com
Django Unchained: A Slave Narrative with a Capital S

P. Ponnivalavan, M.A.

On Defining Slave Narrative

Slave narrative is a genre of writing that recounts the personal experiences of slaves or former slaves. It serves the anti-slavery cause and portrays the atrocities committed by the slave owners and shows how the dominant society accepted the pro-slavery ideals. Britannica Encyclopaedia defines slave narrative as,

…an account of the life, or a major portion of the life, of a fugitive or former slave, either written or orally related by the slave personally. Slave narratives comprise one of the most influential traditions in American literature, shaping the form and themes of some of the most celebrated and controversial writing, both in fiction and in autobiography, in the history of the United States (“slave narrative”)
Frederick Douglass’ Narrative

A Narrative of the Life of Frederick Douglass, an American Slave, by Frederick Douglass, Boston (1845) is a perfect example of a slave narrative. In contemporary works, especially fiction inspired by the slave narratives, the term Neo-Slave narrative is used. In his work The Afro-American Novel, Bernard W. Bell describes “neo-slave narratives” as “residually oral, modern narratives of escape from bondage to freedom” (qtd. in Smith 168). Valeria Smith modifies the description further:

…although over time that definition has expanded to include a more diverse set of texts than Bell's initial description could have anticipated. This genre, which includes some of the most compelling fiction produced in the last fifty years, has evolved to include texts set during the period of slavery as well as those set afterwards, at any time from the era of Reconstruction until the present” (Smith 168).
The Film **Django Unchained** – About a Black Slave

The term *slave narrative*, which is usually used in the context of fiction and occasionally to poetry in order, is used as a frame to study the American Western film, *Django Unchained* (2012) directed by Quentin Tarantino. This film is about Django a black slave, who, when freed, sets out to exact his revenge on the Whites who enslaved him, while saving his wife Broomhilda.
Spaghetti-Western and Blaxploitation Films

In this western, as a kind of counter-narrative, the typical gun slinging white hero is replaced with a black man who kills a number of whites. In generic terms, *Django Unchained* is a combination of Spaghetti-Western and Blaxploitation films. Spaghetti-Western films are the Westerns produced in the 60s, by the Italian film companies.

Characteristically, a Spaghetti-Western is a low budgeted movie set in the American civil war backdrop depicting the adventures of one or more white heroes.

Blaxploitation films are mostly low budgeted violent action movies, featuring black characters. The genre was most popular in the 70s America and the films were targeted towards the urban black population. David Walker remarks, “Blaxploitation films changed how black men and women were portrayed in films. Gone were the old negative stereotypes that had dominated films for over 70 years” (ix).

Director Quentin Tarantino


The road of excess leads to the palace of wisdom, Blake wrote, and for the last few decades no one in Hollywood has followed that road more assiduously than Quentin Tarantino. His movies are famous for their violence and bloodshed; their blaring soundtracks; their offbeat, Pinteresque dialogue; their startling performances from actors you had almost forgotten about; and their encyclopedic range of references to other movies, especially schlocky ones. (Mcgrath)

Tarantino is usually known for his non-linear plot structures, razor-sharp dialogues and the portrayal of excessive violence in his films. Though he alludes to a number of other films in his works, he has attempted to fuse two contrastingly different film genres into one. The 1996 Film, *From Dusk till Dawn* directed by Robert Rodriguez and scripted by Tarantino is a combination of a Hardboiled Thriller and a B Grade vampire flick.

Fusion of Two Genres
In *Django Unchained*, Tarantino once again has fused two film genres: the Spaghetti-Western, which focuses on the adventures of a White gun slinger, Bounty Hunter or a treasure seeker (E.g. *The Good the Bad and the Ugly* (1966), *Django* (1966) and *A Fistful of Dollars* (1964)) with the Blaxploitation (*Shaft* (1971), *Hit man* (1972) and *Black Caesar* (1973)) where the new Black Man exhibits his heroics.

In simple terms, Tarantino has effectively attempted to subvert the genre of the slaver using the genre of the slave in *Django Unchained*, which makes it a unique Slave narrative with a capital S. The idiom, ‘with a capital A/B etc.’ means ‘Something that you say in order to emphasize a particular quality’ or ‘the most formal and often limited understanding of that’ ("with a capital [A etc.]".).

**Focus of This Paper**

The paper treats the first definition as the usage of the colonised and the second as the coloniser’s and employs the former to discuss the film *Django Unchained*. It aims to study *Django Unchained* as a slave narrative which portrays not just the suffering of the slave but also the slave’s revenge (which is borrowed from the Blaxploitation genre), differentiating itself from the other slave narrative films not just in terms of story but also in terms of genre and film making techniques and present it as a slave narrative film with a strong emphasis on the slave.

**Portrayal of the Suffering and Agony of the Slaves**

The slave narratives are usually centred on the suffering and agony of the slaves. The films based on the slave narratives serve the purpose of presenting the hard-to-digest facts about slavery to the world like the recent film *12 Years a Slave* (2013) which is based on the memoirs of Solomon Northup, a former slave. Films like these visually present the inhuman punishments meted out to the black slaves in the name of law and religion.

**The Fugitive Slave Act of 1850**

The Fugitive slave act of 1850 strengthened the powers of the slavers allowing them to punish the captured run-away slaves to any extent. The Fugitive slave act reads

> And be it further enacted, That when a person held to service or labor in any State or Territory of the United States, has heretofore or shall hereafter escape into

*Language in India* [www.languageinindia.com](http://www.languageinindia.com) **ISSN 1930-2940 15:6 June 2015**
P. Ponnivalavan. M.A.
*Django Unchained*: A Slave Narrative with a Capital S
another State or Territory of the United States, the person or persons to whom such service or labor may be due, or his, her, or their agent or attorney, duly authorized, by power of attorney, in writing, acknowledged and certified under the seal of some legal officer or court of the State or Territory in which the same may be executed, may pursue and reclaim such fugitive person, either by procuring a warrant from some one of the courts, judges, or commissioners aforesaid, of the proper circuit, district, or county, for the apprehension of such fugitive from service or labor, or by seizing and arresting such fugitive, where the same can be done without process, and by taking, or causing such person to be taken, forthwith before such court, judge, or commissioner, whose duty it shall be to hear and determine the case…(sec. 6)

_Django Unchained – In a nutshell_

As the film’s opening credit sequence plays we see Django among four other slaves being led by the Speck Brothers and in a close up we see the runaway ‘r’ burnt into his cheek revealing his identity as a former-fugitive who was captured. Throughout the film, in chunky flashbacks we get to see Django’s cruel past where he tries to run away from his slaver with his wife Broomhilda and is captured. His slaver mercilessly whips his wife’s back while Django is made to watch. Soon after giving them their ‘r’s, the slaver sells them to different buyers in the Greenville Slave auction in Greenville, Mississippi.

Django’s past resembles many of the other slave narratives and the films that are based on them. While the other films stop with the suffering of the slaves, _Django Unchained_ goes a step further. The plot of the film begins where the other slave narratives end. Within the first 12 minutes of the film, Django becomes Django Freeman. He is freed by the German dentist turned Bounty hunter Dr. King Schultz (Christoph Waltz).

Soon Django gets promoted as a Bounty Hunter by Dr. Schultz. A Bounty Hunter, which is a recurring stereotyped in many of the American and Spaghetti-Western films (played by white actors), is re-constructed as a black man in _Django Unchained_. We have seen the Blacks rebel in a number of films based on slave narratives including _The Last Supper_ (1976). The rebellion is usually curbed with the iron hand of law and the slaves pay the price for rebelling and fighting their white masters. But in _Django Unchained_, unlike the rebelling
slaves in other slave narratives, Django kills all the whites who were responsible for making him suffer and saves his wife from the inhuman Calvin Candy, finishing what he had started.

**American Civil War Focus – White Saviour Dr. Schultz**

Some of the films based on the Slave narratives focus on the American Civil war which was responsible for the abolition of slavery from America. But in *Django Unchained* which is set two years before the civil war, we see a deliberately anachronistic reference to the north or the union which supported the anti-slavery cause. When Dr. Schultz frees Django, pointing north he tells the other slaves: ‘Oh, and on the off chance that there's any astronomy aficionados amongst you, the North Star is that one’ (*Django Unchained*). Dr. Schultz plays the typical White liberator or the White messiah who saves the black victims, but with a difference. A White saviour in a film about slavery or racism is usually glorified and given the guardian angel status (E.g. *The Blind Side* (2009)).

Dr. Schultz, right from the beginning, when he sees the lash marks on Django’s back till he is shot dead, is unable to digest the cruelty that is meted out to the black slaves by the other whites around him. When the plot begins, he kills the Speck Brothers and frees the slaves. He raises the status of Django to that of a bounty hunter and treats him equally. Though he is a character who despises slavery, he saves Django with an ulterior motive that is to find the Brittle brothers. He promises to give Django his freedom and 75 dollars if he helps him in his quest to find and kill the Brittle brothers.

What looks like the plot of the entire film ends very soon. The Brittle Brothers are found and killed within the first 40 minutes of the film. Later, fascinated by the German name of Django’s wife, Dr. Schultz helps Django find his wife Broomhilda. In the process he gets killed and it is Django, the *internal-focaliser* who takes the plot forward and succeeds in their joint mission.

Unlike the White liberators with faux-friendliness (E.g. The Count in *Last Supper*) and holier than thou attitude, the German Bounty Hunter is a humane non-black character who finds it too hard to accept the atrocities committed by the whites in the name of slavery. As Owen suggests in his article about *Django Unchained* and *Spartacus*, ‘Whites perpetrated the injustice of slavery, and whites therefore are required in order to achieve rectification.’ Even in a film which is born of the union between Spaghetti-Western and Blaxploitation...
genres it becomes impossible to leave out the white liberator, though he is not an American in
the film in question. Though we do not know much about Dr. Schultz’s backstory, he reflects
the guilt that is provoked in every white man in the audience from being inside the film.

**Sergio Leone Zoom**

Dr. Schultz acts as a foil to all the other white characters in the play, who find it
obnoxious to see a black man on a horse. Tarantino makes it a point to emphasise the reaction
of every single white character who appears in the film to Django being a Freeman. When Dr.
Schultz and Django enter the inn in Daughtrey, Texas, Tarantino uses a *Sergio Leone zoom* to
highlight the reaction of the bartender, who has never seen a black man visit his place.

*Sergio Leone zoom* is a camera zoom-in technique popularised by the legendary
Spaghetti-Western maker Sergio Leone, from Italy. It is usually used to attract the attention
of the audience while in a wide shot to a specific character’s face or to an object of extreme
importance. Tarantino uses this sudden zoom in technique quite a few times in *Django
Unchained*.

**A Parody**

The use of Sergio Leone zoom to underline the reaction of the nameless bartender
who appears only once in the film appears ridiculous at first look but contributes something
brilliant to elevate *Django Unchained* from an ordinary slave narrative to a Slave narrative
with a capital S. A technique used in the Spaghetti-Western films which illustrate the bravado
of white gun slingers, is exceptionally parodied in *Django Unchained* to bring out the cruelty
of slavery like the eloquent abuses of Caliban in the language of his masters in Shakespeare’s
*The Tempest*. Caliban says, ‘You taught me language, and my profit on’t is I know how to
curse’ (Tem.1.2.363). A white man’s technique is used in this slave narrative to ‘curse’ the
white men in Caliban’s terms.

**Use of Violence**

Violence is a common denominator in the Spaghetti-Westerns and Blaxploitation
films and Quentin Tarantino is known for his highly stylised use of violence in his films.
Right from his 1992 debut feature *Reservoir Dogs* to *Django Unchained* Tarantino has been
heavily criticised for the aesthetization of violence. Will Kallenborn writes,
Tarantino has compared his use of violence to the cinematic use of dance sequences. It seems Tarantino considers violence to be the medium in which he works. Violence is an important aspect of reality that should be represented in film, but Tarantino’s violence has no basis in reality, and even worse is that his violence has no real basis in fiction. (Kallenborn)

In a 1993 interview, Tarantino famously remarked to Jessica Seigel of the Chicago Tribune,

This is how I am when it comes to movies: I love movies. I love movies in color, and I love ’em in black and white. I love B movies. I love foreign movies.

The bottom line is I’m not responsible for what some person does after they see a movie. I have one responsibility. My responsibility is to make characters and to be as true to them as I possibly can. (Tarantino)

**Binary portrayal of Violence**

In *Django Unchained*, there is a binary portrayal of violence: the violence inflicted by the masters on the slaves and the violence that the slavers are subjected to, at the hands of Django. Most of the slave narratives comprise the former and in for most parts while *Django Unchained* is full of shots illustrating the white men being killed like ‘flies to wanton boys’ (Kin. 4.2.36) by Django. Tarantino employs a typical *Hong Kong Shootout* in the third act, at the end of which most of the white men are dead. *Hong Kong Shootout* is an elaborate action sequence interspersed with slow motion shots. It is a technique popularised by the Asian film maker John Woo (*The Killer* (1989), *Hardboiled* (1992), *Face/Off* (1997) and *Mission: Impossible II* (2000)) which has become an inevitable ingredient in Action movies all over the world. It is interesting to see that Tarantino, who is a connoisseur of Hong Kong action films, borrow a technique from a prominent Director of the Third world cinema (before he moved into Hollywood) to be used in his Spaghetti Western – Blaxploitation Conglomerate, which results in the birth of the Slave narrative with a capital S. When the film ends, Django demolishes the ‘Big House’ in Candy land and walks proudly to his wife with the house burning in the back drop in John Woo style.

**Some Privileges Extended to Django**
On the lighter side, when Django plays Dr. Schultz’s Valet, he is left to choose his own costume. Django chooses a costume which Tarantino refers to in the script as ‘blue satin little lord Fauntleroy outfit’. This particular outfit is inspired by Thomas Gainsborough’s painting “The Blue Boy” (1770) which in turn is a homage to Van Dyck’s portrait of a young Charles II. When Django puts it on, Dr. Schultz takes him to Bennett Manor, a plantation in Gatlinburg, Tennessee, where Spencer ‘Big Daddy’ Bennett instructs Betina, one of his slave girls to show Django the farm. While they walk together, Betina asks Django after confirming that he is no slave, asks him: ‘You mean you wanna dress like that?’ treating us with a farcical moment. Tarantino ahistoricises a particular outfit which belongs to the whites and uses it on Django to be poked fun at, by a black slave girl, to subvert a white ‘thing’ creating a case of mimicry ‘because mimicry is never very far from mockery, since it can appear to parody whatever it imitates’ (Bill Ashcroft, Gareth Griffiths and Helen Tiffin 139).

An Avant-garde Attempt

Tarantino’s avant-garde attempt to fuse two popular genres from completely different eras does not stop at the level of being a mere academic exercise but it enables him to place his black slave right at the centre of the narrative. In this slave narrative film, the techniques belonging to Blaxploitation subverts the Spaghetti-Western allowing Django to do what the slaves in other narratives could only dream of. The title of the film is a reference to the 1966 film Django, a Spaghetti-Western. The Django of Django Unchained is definitely not the Django of Django since he is a black man. Instead, the Django in the title Django Unchained could be seen as a reference to Django, the Spaghetti-Western itself. Django Unchained is about what happens when a Spaghetti-western is unchained with the tools of Blaxploitation, placing the emphasis on the slave and makes the film a Slave narrative with a capital S.

Primary Source


Secondary Sources

Language in India www.languageinindia.com ISSN 1930-2940 15:6 June 2015
P. Ponnivalavan. M.A.
Django Unchained: A Slave Narrative with a Capital S


P. Ponnivalavan. M.A.

*Django Unchained:* A Slave Narrative with a Capital S


http://idioms.thefreedictionary.com/with+a+capital+%5bA+etc.+%5d. Web.
An Optimistic Evolution of Existence in *Saffron Dreams*
by Shaila Abdullah

RABIA ASHRAF

Roll No. BS ENG-4069
(Session 2008-2012)

DEPARTMENT OF ENGLISH LANGUAGE AND LITERATURE
LAHORE COLLEGE FOR WOMEN UNIVERSITY
LAHORE, PAKISTAN
I, Rabia Ashraf, declare that the Research Paper entitled An Optimistic Evolution of Existence in Saffron Dreams by Shaila Abdullah is my own work and is not submitted previously, in whole or partial, in respect of my any other academic award.

__________________________  ________________________
Signature of Candidate

I approve the above titled thesis to be submitted for Examination.

__________________________  ________________________
Signature of Supervisor

__________________________
Chairperson Department of English
An Optimistic Evolution of Existence in
*Saffron Dreams* by Shaila Abdullah

This Research Paper is submitted by Rabia Ashraf to the Department of English, Faculty of Humanities, Lahore College for Women University, Lahore, Pakistan, for the partial fulfillment of the requirement for the degree of B.S 4 Years (English Literature) 2012

Approved on ____________________

Internal Examiner    Signature ________________

External Examiner    Signature ________________

Chairperson of English Department    Signature ________________

Department: English

Faculty: Humanities
Acknowledgments

In the preparation of this Research Paper, first of all I pay my gratitude and praise to Almighty Allah for providing me strength and lifting me up at hard times. I am profoundly indebted to Ms. Naveeda Mustansar, who enthusiastically supervised my B.S Honors in English Literature dissertation, with her valuable guidance, selfless involvement and ever present encouragement. I wish to avail myself of this opportunity to thank Ms. Tanzeela Ambreen and Ms Fatima Hassan who were abundantly helpful and suggested me certain lines of argument. Besides, I am forever grateful to Ms. Mahrukh Bokhari and Ms. Sobia Kiren whose appreciation became the motivating force for me. I shall never be able to thank them adequately.

Words appear insufficient when I pay thanks to my beloved parents, siblings and friends as without their endless love, understanding and support, this work would never have seen the light of the day.

Rabia Ashraf
TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract

Chapter 1
Introduction
Research Methodology

Chapter 2 Literature Review

Chapter 3
From Pessimism to Optimism

Chapter 4
Saffron Dreams - An Existential View

Conclusion

References
Abstract

In the realm of emerging contemporary Pakistani writers, writing in English, Shaila Abdullah’s name shines as an epitome of exuberant writing style and purely Pakistani thematic considerations. Bestowed with the title of ‘Word Artist’ by critics, Abdullah uses her sharp and precise images to tear open the façade of the conventional practices a society nurtures. By probing into the psychology of her protagonists, Abdullah delineates different levels of struggles these women have to go through in order to establish an identity and disclose the true meaning of their existence. Arissa Illah’s journey in Saffron Dreams is unique in its own way. She gathers up all she is left with, after facing a great tragedy. She then, joins these bits and pieces of her life not leaving even for a moment, the hold of a subtle tinge of hope and positivity. This optimism makes her stand on her feet once again and understand the real meaning and purpose of her life. Her existence evolves through stages to acceptance and negation, making her a survivor who did not succumb to the circumstances of life.
Chapter 1
Introduction

*Saffron Dreams* (2009) deals with a common tragic experience of facing the aftermath of the death a loved one in an uncommon way. The subject of death is considered from many different standpoints in literature from around the world as man faces death, deals with the death of a loved one or ponders upon the religious or philosophical significance of death. Shaila Abdullah explores an urge of figuring out a form of life from the chaotic framework of external circumstances and deciphers how through ways of psychological progressive development, struggle blesses the protagonist, Arissa with life. Abdullah believes that by an optimistic interpretation of the hardships of life and rejuvenation as a key to the acceptance of darker reality, Tragedy, be it the loss of a loved one who is the sum and substance of your life, no
longer remains tragic.

As a voice from another Continent, Abdullah is in no way unaware of the prevalent issues for discussion that contemporary Pakistani society offers. She moves from the plight of Pakistani women, their heart touching experiences and crude attempts to hold up in society to a larger perspective where one Pakistani woman experiences widowhood, loneliness, single parenthood, lack of maternal love and other similar external and internal conflicts. Abdullah focuses upon the psyche of an Asian woman who is very traditional and bound by some set norms passed on from generation to generation. But, her exploration is not the one seeking pity and sympathy from the reader instead it shows the hidden mental and psychological strength of a Pakistani woman who can conquer all with her resolute and firm outlook towards life. By this thematic specificity, Abdullah states the notion that self actualization or self hood is not an end in itself but it is the
initiator of hope to move forward in life.

It is significant to note how the protagonist, Arrisa Illahi moves from pessimistic view of life towards acceptance, optimism and finally concludes with a definition of the nature, elements and ingredients of which human life is composed of. Arissa undergoes progressive and gradual stages of psychological metamorphosis. Her mental travelogue is from despondency to expectancy and it is worth exploring even at minute stages of her conscience pricking her subtly while making strong decisions about her loved ones and her future course of life.

Existentialism attained the height of its popularity in France during World War II. After the Second World War, Jean Paul Sartre (1905-1980) came up with Existential philosophy. The main conceptions of Existentialism were expressed by Sartre in his lecture, ‘Existentialism is Humanism’ (1946). Sartre and other Existentialists gave importance to individual and his freedom. In Saffron Dreams (2009), Arissa is ultimately alone, like an isolated island of subjectivity in an objective world, but she has absolute freedom over her internal nature, and the source of her value is only internal. Existentialism propounds the slogan of Existence preceding Essence by which they mean that human being has no predetermined nature or essence that controls him.

**Research Methodology**

The research methodology used in this work entitled An Optimistic Evolution of Existence in Saffron Dreams by Shaila Abdullah is analytical that discusses my work through a qualitative approach. Analytical and speculative research has been applied to highlight varied aspects of the primary source. This research paper explores the dimensions of protagonist’s psychological development from hopelessness to hope and also figures out various Existential
themes prevalent in the novel. Also, Abdullah’s novel *Saffron Dreams* (2009) has been analyzed, examined and probed with reference to the theories and ideas of Existentialists especially those of Jean Paul Sartre.
Chapter 2
Literature Review

There are number of reviews that address and appreciate *Saffron Dreams* (2009), Abdullah’s writing style and expose prominent existential characteristics in the work. Some of these are as follows:

Olivia Baumgartner- Jackson who is a translator, interpreter and editor in United States writes about Abdullah’s exuberant artistic and thematic skills in *Reader Views*, Modern History Press,

There are books that are beautiful simply because they are so positive and pleasant. And there are those that manage to be beautiful in spite of the pain, suffering and the heartbreaking contained within. Shaila Abdullah’s *Saffron Dreams* is both. Her writing is mesmerizing. On one hand it feels like a classically cut diamond - precise, sparkling, blindingly beautiful, but also incredibly sharp. (2009)

Jackson talks about the sensuous experiences felt by the reader on reading *Saffron Dreams* (2009). Abdullah portrays Arissa within a medium of harshness amalgamated with softness of life. Her juxtaposition of hope and despair in the novel adds beauty and greatness to
the work. Jackson relates the work to a ‘diamond’ and finds it sharp but diverse containing many flavors and heart rending feelings.

Saima Shakil Hussain writes about Abdullah’s protagonists in Dawn Newspaper which is Pakistan’s leading and first English Newspaper. The title of her review is *Above and Beyond*,

The female protagonists may be rich and educated or illiterate and impoverished but one thing they all share is the courage to overcome their hardship. Like so many real Pakistani women they are not just victims but also fighters and perhaps more importantly, survivors. (2009)

Abdullah’s protagonists including Arissa do not become victims of the social conventions and maltreatments. They are able to maintain their relations and connections in life. What Abdullah portrays is such a fight which does not end with no result but with a promise of a better future and a confirmation of the conception that survival is possible, no matter how hard the norms are. Through Existentialist underpinnings, it also becomes evident that struggle and the ability to survive in all kinds of undesirable circumstances stems out of one’s value of his life through which he explores the meaning of Existence.
Chapter 3
From Pessimism to Optimism

“If winter comes, can spring be far behind?”

(Shelley, Ode to West Wind.70)

The journey from Pessimism to Optimism can be termed as the one from the “tendency to see only what is gloomy and futile in life' to the 'tendency to look on the more favorable side of happenings” (The Random House Webster’s Dictionary). It is an evolution of positivity and hope from gloom and negativity making Optimism and Pessimism two different states of human mind set. Shaila Abdullah focuses upon the successful struggles of life as a triumphant journey from darkness to brightness. Giving a new definition of Tragedy, Abdullah considers tragedy an essential ingredient for the realization of one's potential to stand hardships. Pessimism is not compulsively a symbol of degeneration and decline of individuality. She propounds the conception of the 'Pessimism of Strength' (Higgins, Solomon 113). Her protagonist, Arissa Illahi throbs in a medium that challenges her at great levels projecting a belief that there is no greatness in living a life that meets no chaos. The value of individuality lies in facing the tough situations and utilizing all mental and physical powers to become a survivor. Abdullah thus deciphers how Arissa very gradually moves from a pessimistic outlook of life to happiness and the way her philosophy of life undergoes a radical transformation.

Optimism is a general idea that the future outcomes will be positive where as pessimism is a common notion that future events will have more probability of being negative. Determining
whether a person is an optimist or a pessimist depends upon the experiences he faces. Hope is a defining and essential characteristic of optimism. It involves two main components: an ability to plan paths to desirable goals and an agency or motivation to utilize the pathways. *Saffron Dreams* (2009) balances bitterness with happiness and focuses upon the growth of protagonist’s viewpoint from pessimism to optimism. Arissa uses both these components of hope to emerge out as a better wife, mother, daughter and a citizen.

Pessimism is a wrestling or fight within one's own psyche. Arissa, initially a pessimistic protagonist, continues to measure her life on a highly pessimistic scale framed within her own mind. Getting married to Faizan was a dream come true, 'evoking the dainty sweet fragrance of jasmine and the pungent scent of hina' and later, loosing Faizan is defined by the “hodgepodge of colors” bleeding into one blunt shade of “scorching black” (Abdullah Chp 2). Opening her eyes in an affluent Pakistani family, Arissa finds herself in search of pure and genuine maternal love which her mother fails to give her because of other base concerns governing her life. Arissa struggles against insincere relations and experiences that it is the expectation that makes the heart weep for it is not blood that determines the presence or absence of love. A series of ominous happenings continue to disturb her before getting in a typical arranged marriage with Faizan. These premonitions have symbolic significance. The image of a ‘Firedancer’ expressed by the beggar woman for Faizan reveals the couple's misfortune, hardship, helplessness, challenge and lose in future course of marital life. Thus, Abdullah prepares for the huge disaster very swiftly by lying bare, casements of gloomy predictions and happenings.

The very day Faizan becomes a pitiful victim of World Trade Centre Attacks, fire engulfing the fire dancer from all sides, Arissa undergoes a psychological shift. Expecting a child in near future as a single parent, she concludes that humans live a 'Sheltered Existence'
(Abdullah Chp 8). She realizes how fragile and vulnerable human life is and the omnipresent threat that life faces of collapsing down at any moment. There is no running away from the sinister visage of death for 'Abramovitz's Satan' (Chp 8) delivers its blow and brings the massage of barrenness and loneliness since eternity. Her days lack brightness while her nights are loathsomely dark. Her emotional pain, depression and dominantly passive views about life show 'Depressive Realism' (Ingram 211).

As a young, expatriate, expecting widow, Arissa's first contact with conventional American society, after Faizan's death is a heinous experience. Race conflict becomes explicit in the incident where she moves out of her apartment after bereavement period and is bullied and harassed by a clan of young American boys. Her veil is labeled as a façade and they blame her for being the perpetrator of Attack on Twin Towers. The conflict of race overlooks the basic similarities as members of same specie (Blumer 38). The consequential attitude of Americans hit by the Attack is hostility towards the 'yellow race'. There is a high degree of hatred nurtured by members of this society with those of other. Arissa, thus becomes a victim of 'Ethnocentricism' (38). It is not written upon her forehead that she is a widow and an equal rather slightly more a victim of World Trade Centre Attacks but it does shine upon her forehead that she is a Muslim and a Pakistani experiencing a diasporic feeling, she is conscious of being 'suspended in mid-air' because of being homesick and a victim torn between two labels of identity, discrimination, racism and prejudice. Muslims considered as a race gone mad and bad leave another sense of hollowness and religious depravity in her mind. Her removal of 'Veil' is symbolic of a 'New Beginning' as she becomes aware of the need to be accepted in society and for that she frames and devises her own life plan. Taking up a job at ‘Chamak’ where her artistic skills are
illuminated and her pent up emotions get an expression, Arissa is able to balance herself financially, for her own self and for the future of Raian, her son. She adapts herself to the practices of New World as a plan to move forward with her life.

With the revelation of giving birth to a child with CHARGE Syndrome, in a nutshell, Arissa’s journey of loss comprises of only forty one days. The child as a gift from Faizan and a symbol of his memory initially provided her a source of hope but the very thought of the orphanage and abnormality of the unborn child before coming to the world, leads her to a dungeon of pessimism. She loses all the bits of positive energy and with unlucky fate circling her from all sides; she knows that she has become a 'Reluctant Traveler' (Abdullah Chp 9).

Arissa Illahi’s shift from pessimism to optimism is gradual but continuous. Along with all other factors, her brief but didactic relationship with Zaki contributes in making her aware of the reality that since she has lost the spring of her life and it is autumn that now welcomes her. She starts looking directly into the eyes of reality but initially, is fearsome of stumbling down. Abdullah slowly builds up the tension of moving from Arissa's flawed sense of direction, her flawed beauty and her flawed life to her flawless perception of life. “Arissa's sense of direction is seriously flawed...that part of the brain that makes sense of directions never fully develops...” (Tichlear, Reader Views).

The narrative in the initial parts of the novel is highly interrogative. It appears that the protagonist is unsure, insecure, confused, restless and questions and laments upon whatever befalls her as an expression of lost and perturbed mentality but it also marks a sense of
consciousness that she does not live in oblivion. The emotional obstacles faced by Arissa are, despair, angst, absurdity, alienation and nostalgia. Abdullah penetrates into the mental conflict of Arissa and juxtaposes the feeling of loss with a subtle tinge of hope. Arissa finds her solace and catharsis in 'Art' and it provides her with a healing effect, she says “In all fairness, colors define me” (Abdullah Chp 2). The biggest conflict that she faces is loneliness and the feeling of being incomplete physically and psychologically. Zaki comes to her life as a hope of eradicating this solitude but Arissa's calculated decision labels him as a misfit for a relationship, ultimately explaining that she fears loneliness no more. Tragedy occurs when there is a conflict but Abdullah propounds that one needs to crawl if not move at par with tragedy so much so that the tragic feeling falls back leaving you lighter. Therefore, multifarious levels of challenges increase Arissa's potential to fight them off, ruin them and tatter them to pieces. Agents that help her to be an optimistic are Faizan's memory, her son Raian, completing Faizan's book, and the strong and steadfast personalities of Ami and Baba. Her resolutions turn out to be the removal of 'Veil', 'Move' on with life and do justice to 'Soul Searcher' by showing it the light of the day.

Facing the reality of death directly, makes Arissa reject the beauty of life but this renouncement makes her strong and fearless about loss. Death transforms the feeling of irreparable loss to the appreciation of loss. From minute level of optimism where Arissa searches for the dead body of Faizan, Abdullah moves to the height and magnitude of Optimism where Arissa preserves Faizan's legacy and ambition in the form of completing his book and his identity and existence in the form of giving birth and raising up Raian as she says, “I had survived, I realized with a degree of pride. I had not succumbed to the pain of my loss” (Abdullah Chp 18). More than Faizan as a person in her life, it is Faizan and the power of her
love for him that becomes a vital cause of her survival. In short, giving life to the pages of Faizan's *Soul Searcher* gives life to Arissa's soul.

The recollections of her past, Faizan and her blissful marital life construct and define her future. Here, Abdullah shows a belief that real life is not devoid of imagination and inner unconscious processes. Arissa lives by the memory and re memory of Faizan. Her psychology merges past with present and future, killing the spatial time considerations. It is the interpretation of an experience in a positive way that influences the outcomes positively. Abdullah exposes the value of each human life as in preserving Faizan’s life through recollecting his memory time and again, Arrisa preserves her own life and identity. Also, it is her will power that helps her to improve with passage of time.

It is incredible to note how *Saffron Dreams* (2009) opens with dark and desolate images. The description becomes lighter in its pictorial representation as Arissa learns to reconcile with fate. The very nature of tragedy is expressed sensationally where chapter one opens when the season of autumn at its apex and the outer atmosphere is ‘foggy’ as Arissa walks past the trees in full bareness and fallen leaves with tinges of yellow and pale shades. The season co relates with the mental state of Arissa and she feels herself as a toy horse that rejoices while swinging as an outward gesture but is bound to a fixed position. Arissa is fixed as to what will be her future course as an untimely widow. She experiences a feeling of being ‘adrift’ and ‘afloat’ and a bird that has a single wing. This single wing represent her status as a student of motherhood whose lesson to fly and soar to heights must be special and efficiently planned since she has no husband.
to share the duty with her. She thus, gropes in dark and lands empty handed with a feeling of hollowness after an undesired happening.

Moving on to the positive descriptive images in the novel, one of the most prevalent and eye catching image is the one that the title creates. Saffron Dreams (2009) talks about a concrete and an abstract image of saffron and dreams and this is how Abdullah has juxtaposed the extremely realistic elements with highly imaginative elements in the novel. Saffron is a herb which is added to any dish in order to make the taste unique and adorable. The aspirations which both Arissa and Faizan nurtured before the tragedy befalls them are unique like the taste of saffron. Arissa hopes to materialize these saffron dreams and this is from where positivity originates within her. Faizan’s love related to her through a pair of blue socks where later on one sock loses its shape by pulling a string of wool convey the image of separation as an inevitable reality. From black, Arissa learns to subjugate to the presence of white color symbolizing her colorless but satisfied life. The images are realistic just like the realistic mental state of the protagonist. Arissa’s dream in which her home is set ablaze shows how the fire dancer crept past her life leaving behind only the fillers of that fire. These images declare the notion of completion and an end to adversaries in her life; it is her own sense of resolution that completes her.

Saffron Dreams (2009) is a 'chiaroscuro' piece of work in which Abdullah has very finely juxtaposed brighter with darker shades of life coming up with the true grey shades which are natural and realistic. Throughout the course of the novel, Abdullah establishes the negative idea very poignantly and intensely ending with gradual but comparatively brief resolution. The time span of Arissa as a struggler is larger and rapid in comparison to the final outcome of Arissa as a
survivor where she establishes a direction of her life. Her soul is no more in destitute, her existence no more lives in an oblivion and her life is no more tattered and broken.
Chapter 4

*Saffron Dreams*- An Existential View

From Centuries, literature of all genres has tried to define the meaning of life from different perspectives and manners. The only crude and rough boundary appearing between the primitive idea of the exploration of life’s meaning and the neonate or post modernist one is that in the later life is deciphered on the basis of its reality and purpose where as in the former, man suffers the dilemma of restoring, preserving and securing the essence of the acquired meaning of human life. Existentialism explores the meaning of life by emphasizing upon its importance and value. It primarily focuses upon an individual and his experiences that shape him, making it within his reach to live his life in the most sincere and complete manner. Each life has its self created standards upon which morals and values are measured. From the chaotic explanations that the world provides of human life and the purpose of the existence of a human being, Existentialism involves an attempt to develop an understanding.

After the Second World War, writings of prominent names like Jean Paul Sartre, Simon de Beauvoir, Albert Camus and Franz Fanon were considered as dealing with the significance of human existence, importance of devising ways to fathom out obstacles in life, formation of an authentic individuality, admitting the temporality and mortality of human life and the presence of alienation or forlornness in life. Absurdity is dealt in context of life and the process to attain existence as the one from absurdity to a well defined meaning. This craving of meaning instills...
determination to get rid of the idea of being a stranger in world or world as a strange land that cannot be comprehended. Existentialists take this world as a picture and the hero is a common individual. For them, individual experiences are highly interesting and capable enough to be explored. The impact of Existentialism on literature is significant and substantial. The basic doctrines handled by existentialists are ‘man’s alienation, dread, absurdity, bad faith, responsibility, commitment to freedom and anguish’ (Ahmed 10).

Jean Paul Sartre (1905-1980), was a French philosopher, writer and a political activist. He is considered as the hierophant of modern Existentialism and he built a connection between literature and philosophy in his writings. According to Sartre, mankind is responsible for its own actions.. Dreams and intentions are not valid in such cases because they are not grounded in reality. Man, in all circumstances is condemned to be free because he did not create himself; yet he is free to do as he wishes. From a general view point, Existentialism is described as an optimism driven by concrete human acts. Mankind is essentially free and not bound by religion or dogmas and consequently needs to take responsibility and act according to conscience and ideology.

Exploring the feminine emotional world of women, Abdullah brings to light the various deeper forces at work in feminine sensibility and psychology. This predilection leads her to examine the psyche of her woman protagonist, Arissa when she is confronted with the absurdity of life as an untimely gap created by lost relations. Abdullah places Arissa in a hostile and uncongenial environment as a Pakistani widow in New World who has to fight against the odds. This problem of the tragic tension between the individual and her unfavorable environment acquires the dimension of existential angst.
Sartre says in ‘Existentialism is Humanism’, ‘Man first of all exists, encounters himself, surges up in the world- and defines himself afterwards’. According to him, Existence is active and not passive. Man exists by fashioning his own existence and by choice of doing something and ignoring the other; he gives an essence to his existence (Cuddon 109). One of the most important notions of Sartre is that of ‘Existence preceding Essence’. Existence coming before Essence has two possibilities. Firstly, the universe being utterly meaningless so that man creates his own values. This is very much like calling universe as the biggest absurdity and the real challenge is to decipher a sense out of the absurd and unclear information that is provided. Thus, *Saffron Dreams* (2009) as an absurdist piece of work, which operates within the framework of chaos but Abdullah negates a complete absurdist view of the universe. According to her, the basic laws of nature and passions are liable for the growth of a person like her protagonist and they contain a strong presence of a cause and effect relationship.

Secondly, by saying ‘Existence precedes Essence’, Sartre believes in the presence of a hidden meaning in existence which is only revealed if man exercises his resources and abilities at full. This idea is true to Abdullah’s portrayal of Arissa. With losses hovering all over, Arissa utilizes all her powers to get stability. Before she becomes a widow, Abdullah does not penetrate into her psyche very deeply as her psychological state is not much significant at that time but the moment Faizan dies an unnatural death, Arissa loses the balance of her existence and her emotions are triggered. This is where Abdullah works upon the protagonist’s mental state. She takes the reader much into the recesses of the protagonist, making it apparent how her essence or character is formulated. The development is not simplistic for, it has diverse stages and levels of complexity influencing Arissa both physically and mentally. She shuns away hopelessness and gloom by reconciling and accepting whatever she is left with and confirming to Sartre’s
reinforcement that if hopelessness takes over, destruction is obvious. She becomes so strong that she is fearless of everything.

After Faizan’s death, Arissa questions herself that what should she do with her life now? She has an unclear and foggy idea of her future course of life. This is a very much an Existentialist question as ‘Internal Conflict’ is significant in consideration with Existentialists. As Arissa’s struggle is unceasing, indefinite and infinite, she makes a strenuous effort to contend and compete against difficulties showing that it is not life that never saw pain and misery, that never faced adversary directly or indirectly and that never sympathized with the sufferer. There resides a perpetual struggle behind every step that she is forced to take as she lives within the confines of social, psychological and physical mediums. She is bound at many levels starting from her own outlook of life to the larger organic unity of life. This gestalt creates considerable extent of limitations that become the defining elements of how she acts and reacts to the situations and defines her life.

Abdullah's treatment in Saffron Dreams (2009) is the ‘end’ of struggle as survival. If struggle is unstable, survival is stable. With struggle initiation of something new takes place. This activity is continuous as from the time Arissa is born; she is put in a situation that is likely to be unhappy and dissatisfied. Arissa faces the homelessness created by her real mother. She says ‘Hate. Such a strong word, but it was also a mother’s final parting gift to us, the knowledge that she despised us, me most of all’ (Abdullah Chp 4). On the other hand, survival is complete and linked with achievement. The battle between suffering, desire to mar it and final end is not a physical action as a compulsion. It is more of a mental and psychological progress attained by making resolute decisions within the mind. Faizan's novel, 'Soul Searcher' is symbolic of search and quest of a soul, life, dynamics and flux. The moment Arissa completes it; she gains her
identity, “Saffron. It reminded me of an unfinished project that was much closer to completion than it was a year ago” (Chp 2). Searching the meaning of her life, Arissa sustains by getting validity and authenticity of her existence through making her own choices. Loaded with responsibilities as a widow, she takes each step forward with a caution. The bombardment of problems remains continuous making her negate the reality of widowhood completely.

Arissa faces a strong existential angst when Raian is born. She feels her way to destination filled with utter forlornness but is conscious of the freedom that she has just got. “I imagined being a toy horse, galloping on bound legs, destination firmly defined, thrilled with providence in my naivete” (Abdullah Chp 1). The same feeling of angst also takes over her when she decides to part ways with Zaki. Making a choice of a secure past over an insecure future, Arissa embraces Faizan and Raian as the sharers of her grief and partners in her journey. Similar is her situation, when she meets her real mother who apologizes years later for the vacuum and deprivations that she caused in Arissa’s life but here again Arissa holds upon the dignity of her lonely struggles and rejects the late shower of maternal love from her mother not forgetting the suffering that she has gone through, all alone.

“Marching over the terrains of time” is an existential resolution and Sartre propounds the presence of this resolution in every human being. Those who determine their identity are the ones who are able to locate the abilities that they possess and Arissa becomes an example of such a person. Moreover, what Abdullah means to say is that life is never lived as a whole but in parts, but moment by moment. This makes the journey easier to go through and interpret. By an elaborate expression of her free will and demonstration of her ability to choose and act, Arissa sets the forest on fire towards the end of the novel. This fire, created by her is the result and manifestation of her existential angst to destroy the old and meaningless and make room for the
new and significant. It is an affirmation of her search for values in an otherwise futile existence. If solitude is the crux of her life then she accepts it happily. If Raian becomes her strength, she appreciates and values it.

_Saffron Dreams_ (2009) circulates around the importance of self. Reaching towards selfhood is a struggle to attain a distinct, different and fully developed consciousness of one’s self. The ability to regain an essential trait of personality which is lost when circumstances trample over you determines the ‘self’. Arissa’s character is shaped by the decisions she makes and the feelings she has to cope with. In this way, she reaches near to self-awareness. Her character shapes and develops by adapting to what is essential for her and by discarding the unimportant. She formulates her preferences in life like Raian as her utmost recipient of attention and Zaki as a prospective lover, an insignificant distraction. Arissa experiences all this in stages leading to the development of her psychology. Existentialists see it as, “Man is born into a kind of void, a mud. He has the liberty to remain in this mud and thus lead a passive, supine acquiescent existence…” (Cuddon 109)

The images of ugliness, destruction, annihilation and loneliness are consistently used by Abdullah in order to show the existential tone of the novel. With the help of several images a strong atmosphere of solitary introspection is created. The loneliness embedded in outside atmosphere creates a strong sense of inner loneliness. The novel opens with the season of autumn at its apex and the colors of leaves are described as ‘glowing golds’, ‘bloodlike reds’, ‘brazen brown’ and ‘somber yellows’. These colors convey a strong impact of energy and life but all at once Abdullah juxtaposes the vitality of these colors to the ‘cracking’ of ‘crispy’ leaves under Arissa’s feet, “lifeless but not without a voice” (Abdullah Chp 1). She relates the presence of

Language in India www.languageinindia.com ISSN 1930-2940 15:6 June 2015
Rabia Ashraf, B.S. (Hons.), M.Phil.
An Optimistic Evolution of Existence in _Saffron Dreams_ by Shaila Abdullah

117
hope in lifelessness. The havoc played by World Trade Centre attacks is described in phrases like “a new layer of sediment composed of ash and dust had formed a permanent footprint on the river bed after the towers had collapsed” (Chp 1) and “New York skyline blown away by raging swords of fire” (Chp 8). Faizan’s unnatural death leaves Arissa sheltered no more. Thus, nature speaks of her mood and sets an existential background for the novel.

Loss, separation and nostalgia are the feelings prominent within the psyche of Arissa more intensly. She is terrified for being in complete solitude all of a sudden. Fate governs her life. She laments by exclaiming “this was too big for us, too big for me. This cannot be a part of our lives” (Abdullah Chp 8). Her helplessness conveys a highly tragic tone where she says “I refused to sleep or lie down. I felt that if I did, I’d lose him forever” (Chp 8).

Arissa experiences a strong omnipresence of facticity in her life. She feels herself existing in a world not of her own making and completely indifferent to her concerns, desires and ambitions and that she is not the source of her existence, instead thrown into a world she does not and cannot control. She says “Waking was a nightmare, a realization of a life stretching before me without a partner” (Abdullah Chp 8). Moreover, Arissa shows anxiety in her behavior as well. She is faced with the responsibility of choosing her own nature and values, and, in doing so, she is faced with an awesome responsibility of choosing human nature and values for all humanity through free choices. The exertion of blunt reality is seen in the lines when Arissa resolves to start afresh. Her agitation and anxiety is produced because of losing her balance compelling her to say, “Until I have it all together in my hand, I remain agitated, anxious. The new twist in my life has caught me unaware, and I had not found my balance yet” (Chp 10).

Saffron Dreams (2009) is an optimistic and existential piece of work but it opens up many questions while also answers many. An existential view holds that the world runs opposite
to man’s dreams and makes it impossible to realize his dreams. The absurdity of world is revealed through chances in life, death, the esoteric reality and uncontrollable reality. Alienation in pursuit of individuality, freedom and dreams is also a thread that runs throughout the course of the novel. A search for truth, sincerity and pure existence in a world ridden with illusions and absurdity is explored with depth. Arissa feels alienated and rejected amidst a world and society she cannot connect with. She struggles for this need of her relationship with others. Existentialism explores that in order to navigate successfully through absurdity, one must take action while be aware of the falsity that surrounds man if he hopes to achieve a lasting sense of purpose and meaning.
CONCLUSION

*Saffron Dreams* (2009) exposes the common tragic perception in a highly uncommon way. Abdullah explores a continuing urge to trace a sense and meaning out of the haphazard framework of external circumstances. Using psychological progressive development of the protagonist, she states how struggle blesses Arissa with yet another life which is far better than the one she would have lived, had the towers not collapsed. Abdullah believes in the importance of an optimistic interpretation of the hardships in life. Optimism is a key to the acceptance of reality making tragedy lose its hopelessness and connotations of psychological devastation. Focusing upon highlighting the path through which Arrisa Illahi moves from suffering and pessimistic view of life towards acceptance and optimism and finally concludes with a definition of obstacles as necessary ingredients of the composition of human life is how Abdullah treats her subject matter. In an interesting manner she traces out the conception of the value of individuality that lies in facing tough situations and utilizing all mental and physical powers to become a survivor from being a sufferer.

The novel attracts as an Existential piece of work through and through. It unfolds a different kind of journey where Arissa does explore her identity and the purpose and meaning of life but this is done through an evolutionary process. The intricacies of this process can be very suitably viewed from the stance of Existentialists, especially Jean Paul Sartre. The novel contains within itself, most of the prominent Existential themes like sufferings of Arissa that leave her in solitude and loneliness. This feeling of loss is heightened by the deprivation she faces.
challenged in taking some of the significant decisions of her life, ultimately facing angst and strong sense of responsibility. And, as the novel closes, she no longer remains in the quest of her identity. She reaches to a staunch definition of her life. She is sure and confident about her future and it is her very own self that brings her out of the state of destitute.
REFERENCES

Abdullah, Shaila. Beyond the Cayenne Wall. Texas: Barnes and Noble, 2005. Web


Dienstag, Joshua Foa. Pessimism. 2006. Print


Higins, Solomon. Reading Nietzsche. n.d. Print


Ingram, Rick E. An International Encyclopedia of Depression. n.d. Print


Language in India www.languageinindia.com ISSN 1930-2940 15:6 June 2015
Rabia Ashraf, B.S. (Hons.), M.Phil.
An Optimistic Evolution of Existence in Saffron Dreams by Shaila Abdullah
Rabia Ashraf

M. Phil. English Literature - Kinnaird College Lahore

B.S. (Hons.) English Literature - Lahore College for Women University Lahore

Lecturer English

COMSATS Lahore, Department of Humanities and Social Sciences - Postal Code: 54700

Defense Road, Off Raiwind Road, Lahore, Pakistan

rabiashraf@ciitlahore.edu.pk
Abstract

The Restoration Age is probably one of the most interesting and important, if not one of the richest, periods in the history of English literature. Though not marked by an exuberant growth of drama as the Elizabethan Age, of poetry as the Romantic Age, or of Criticism as the modern Age, the Restoration Age remains a very important and interesting period for the student of literature because it gave birth to modern English prose and because it marks the birth of modern English criticism formulated on the classical dogma of the ancients. It is important because it witnessed the birth and growth of many important literary movements, of many new species of literature in the field of poetry and drama, because it innovated and perfected many forms of literary expression. If we make a careful perusal of the history of English literature and of the social and political trends we come to know that a change began to come over the spirit of English literature about the middle of the seventeenth century which was not due to any fluctuations in literary fashion but was deep rooted in the life of the time.

Keywords: Restoration Age, Romantic movement, Scottish Diaspora, Restoration drama

Introduction

The Age of Renaissance was an age of expansion – spiritual and material. For the first time Englishmen realized their national solidarity. Emancipated from continental struggles, their loyalty to the queen, their pride in the country and their delight in country’s past are reflected in the Faerie Queene and historical dramas of Marlowe and Shakespeare. But the emotional excitement and zeal could not be sustained for long and its splendid exuberance had degenerated into extravagance and violence in the early years of the seventeenth century. The drama was in more critical state than poetry.
Restoration Drama

Restoration drama has been regarded as both the glory and the shame of the period. The comedies handle wit, satire and neat situation in a manner hardly surpassed elsewhere in English drama, but they are not deficient in moral decency, through very sensitive to a superficial norm in manners.

The Restoration Comedy has been termed as comedy of manners as manners, modes and conventions of the upper classes of society are reflected in it. Since at this time upper strata of society was one which was patronized by Charles II and his courtly circle of wits, the comedy written at this time, chose to depict the ethos of that class only. The comedy of manners is said to be written on the lines of the realistic comedy as written by Ben Jonson in England and Moliere in France. Moliere provided the English dramatists with ideas for plot and comic characterization.

The exponents of new empirical philosophy were Hobbes and Locke, and their principles and discoveries were definitely in favour of rationalism and realism as opposed to the element of supernatural mystery and extravagances of uncontrolled Fancy.

The age of Dryden was dominated by Hobbes, who sought to banish the old machinery of ghosts and fairies from the domain of serious literature and confine even poetic activity to the sphere of the probable and rational. But he was the first philosopher to attempt a psychological approach to the problem of the poetic or creative process. He analysed the components of the human mind itself, and explained the nature and function of the faculties requisite for poetic creation. He singles out Fancy and Judgment for special consideration.

The Restoration, thus, was a period of considerable poetic activity as well as of great critical confusion. The critics of the period were faced with rival creeds and theories which stood sharply opposed to each other; the Ancient vs the Modern; the contemporary classical French drama and the irregular or romantic Elizabethan drama; the vigorous but rough literature, Medieval and Elizabethan vs the refined products of the cultivated wits in contemporary England.
John Dryden

John Dryden (1631-1700) was an English poet, literary critic, translator and playwright who was made Poet Laureate in 1668. He is seen as dominating the literary life of Restoration England to such a point that the period came to be known in literary circles as the Age of Dryden. In 1650 Dryden went up to Trinity College, Cambridge. Here he would have experienced a return to the religious and political ethos of his childhood: the Master of Trinity was a Puritan preacher by the name of Thomas Hill who had been a rector in Dryden's home village. Though there is little specific information on Dryden's undergraduate years, he would most certainly have followed the standard curriculum of classics, rhetoric, and mathematics. In 1654 he obtained his BA, graduating top of the list for Trinity that year. In June of the same year Dryden's father died, leaving him some land which generated a little income, but not enough to live on.\(^1\)

Returning to London during The Protectorate, Dryden obtained work with Cromwell's Secretary of State, John Thurloe. This appointment may have been the result of influence exercised on his behalf by his cousin the Lord Chamberlain, Sir Gilbert Pickering. At Cromwell's funeral on 23 November 1658 Dryden processed with the Puritan poets John Milton and Andrew Marvell. Shortly thereafter he published his first important poem, *Heroic Stanzas* (1658), a eulogy on Cromwell's death which is cautious and prudent in its emotional display.
In 1660 Dryden celebrated the Restoration of the monarchy and the return of Charles II with *Astraea Redux*, an authentic royalist panegyric. In this work the interregnum is illustrated as a time of anarchy, and Charles is seen as the restorer of peace and order.

**Dryden’s Satire**

Dryden's greatest achievements were in satiric verse: the mock-heroic *Mac Flecknoe*, a more personal product of his Laureate years, was a lampoon circulated in manuscript and an attack on the playwright Thomas Shadwell. Dryden's main goal in the work is to "satirize Shadwell, ostensibly for his offenses against literature but more immediately we may suppose for his habitual badgering of him on the stage and in print."[2] It is not a belittling form of satire, but rather one which makes his object great in ways which are unexpected, transferring the ridiculous into poetry.[3]

This line of satire continued with *Absalom and Achitophel* (1681) and *The Medal* (1682). His other major works from this period are the religious poems *Religio Laici* (1682), written from the position of a member of the Church of England; his 1683 edition of *Plutarch's Lives Translated From the Greek by Several Hands* in which he introduced the word biography to English readers; and *The Hind and the Panther*, (1687) which celebrates his conversion to Roman Catholicism.

**Absalom and Achitophel**

The first point that we should note is that in the “Preface” Dryden calls ‘Absalom and Achitophel’, ‘A Poem’. The choice of the term is significant. ‘Mac Flecknoe’ and ‘The Medal’ are both designated ‘Satyres’.

Dryden appears to be making a distinction between the term ‘poem’ and ‘satire’ similar to that made by Aristotle between ‘poetry’ and ‘history’. A ‘poem’ is possibly better, because more universal, more elevated, than a ‘satire’, which is too particularly related to historical circumstances, and Dryden is therefore freed, by his choice of term, to make a more inclusive commentary on human affairs[4]. He is able in this way to amalgamate the activities of the poet and the satirist in a poem which, while drawing its inspiration from particular men and the vicissitudes of their political careers, yet rises above its sources and benefits from the characteristic effects of satire without being restricted to them[5]. In Aristotle’s words, it becomes ‘more philosophic and of graver import’, and it draws only on the satiric, but also on...
various other literary modes – epic elegiac, panegyric, allegoric and incorporates several kinds or styles of presentation dramatic speeches, sections of narrative, passages of rhetorical argument and formal portraits or ‘characters’.

In his preface Dryden disclaimed the role of inventor and claimed that of historian, ‘Were I the Inventor, who am only the Historian… This disclaimer, however, is merely part of the thin pretend that the poem is sheer Jewish history based on Second Samuel. It is a gesture of modesty over the designedly evident fact of the invention exhibited in the combination of the two histories. Moreover, the use of Jewish history emphasizes the valutative aspect of the history that is drawn from a sacred book. The whole Judaeo-Christian tradition has operated to transmute the history of the Jews into a moral order.

Line 1 – 45 “Pious” Times!

In the opening lines, Dryden introduces King David, who was Israel’s monarch and the prevalence of the system of polygamy, when a king could have more than one wife, and also could have many children through sex relations with many women. Dryden ironically calls those times “the pious times”. When the priest craft was not a part of the way of life and the cursed custom of monogamy, confining to one wife, was not in vogue. No law denied the rightful use of “Concubine and Bride”. In those times, the King of Israel (a parallel to the king of England, (Charles – II) was doing a faithful service to his maker, for multiplying his Maker’s image, the Lord and had relations with many women, and also had many issues from them. In these lines, Dryden satirizes humorously the profligacy and corruption of King Charles II and his court. In this age, the moral values were kept at abeyance and loose unethical kind of sexual relations prevailed. By cursing monogamy and the virtue, the poet highlights ironically the prevalence of polygamy and vice all around, which were the order of the day.

Lines 46 – 83 Inconstancy and Fickleness

Dryden makes a general observation on the character of the Englishmen in gentle and polite manner. He wishes to remind them of their inconstancy and fickleness without using any strong words. These lines illustrate the touches of fine raillery scattered throughout the poem. No king, no God could satisfy them for long because they would get made the idols of gods of different shapes and sizes by their goldsmiths and priests. These Jews were lucky
enough like Adam in the paradise to enjoy freedom, yet they felt that liberty was denied to them, hence they began to dream of it. When they found that no race in the entire history enjoyed greater freedom than they did, they began to feel that only primitive people were really free and the true freedom was there in the wood and caves only.

**Lines 84 – 133 Suffering of Jebusites Likened to Suffering of Catholics in England**

In this passage, Dryden refers to the Jebusites and how they suffered in their own country, Israel. According to the Jewish Bible, “Canaanite tribe who built and inhabited Jerusalem prior to its conquest by King David”. The Jebusites (now referring to Roman Catholics in English in the poem) were the old inhabitants of Jerusalem (England). But with the chosen people (Protestants) growing stronger day by day, the religion of the Jebusites or Roman Catholics was regarded as hateful. As a result, the Jebusites or Catholics were subjected to a number of hardships. Thus, weakened and despised and displeased, they were forces to submit to the government of David (Charles II). They were reduced to poverty and deprived of all positions of authority. Their taxes were doubled and many of them were deprived of their lands. All this was done through numerous laws passed against the Jebusites or Roman Catholics.

What was even more intolerable was the fact that their images and relics were disrespected and thrown into the fire like common wood. They could not bear such insults and as a result, they were compelled to do something against the government. This ultimately resulted in the Popish Plot of 1678. Here, Dryden refers to the disabilities suffered by the Jebusites (Roman Catholics). Their life became intolerable and as such they were compelled to do something against the government. The poet describes the political environment of the time in which it was easy for the anti-royalist party to raise a revolt against the King. Dryden here satirises the priests whether Catholics or Protestants.

**Lines 133 – 149 Factions Hostile to One Another**

Popish Plot failed because of the foolishness of Titus Oates and other Whigs but it led to many evil and drastic consequences. As when the body is heated by fewer, the disease which had been lying dormant find an outlet to burst – out, similarly when political body of Israel (England) was infected by the alleged plot, many hostile factions raised their heads
against the government. These proved to be more dangerous to the public good than original
Popish plot could have been.

**Line 150 – 229 Contradictory Character of Achitophel**

The character of Achitophel is full of contradictions. On the one hand, he is called
prudent and bold and on the other hand, he is called unfixed in principles. His fiery soul is ill
matched with his weak body. But by and large, he is a man of misguided enthusiasm and
misdirected energy.

Shaftesbury was like an insolvent debtor of his physique. He was extravagant, devoid
of comfort. In Platonic language he was a two-legged unfeathered animal. He was false,
hateful and doomed to destruction than to rule a state. He broke the triple bond to gain power.
Shaftesbury actively promoted war against Holland in March 1672 by breaking the Triple
Alliance between England, Sweden and Holland.

**Dryden’s Preference for Calling Absalom and Architophel ‘A Poem’ and not ‘A Satire’**

In his note to the reader prefixed to Absalom and Architophel, Dryden calls it “a
poem” and not a satire, the term which he uses to describe MacFlecknoe and the Metal. The
word “poem” in Dryden’s view meant a long story verse, an epic or heroic poem or a play
like an epic. The distinction between a “poem” and a “satire” was clear. A satire had specific
aims and limitations proper to itself as lower genre and was not expected to have so larger a
moral responsibility when he calls Absalom and Architophel a poem. Dryden also assumes
the freedom to make it a general criticism of life. The poem though, occasional in its
inception, goes beyond its occasion and penetrates to the elements inseparable from the
human condition.

**Robert Burns (1759 –1796)**

Robert Burns was a Scottish poet and lyricist. He is widely regarded as the national
poet of Scotland and is celebrated worldwide. He is the best known of the poets who have
written in the Scots language, although much of his writing is also in English and a
light Scots dialect, accessible to an audience beyond Scotland. He also wrote in Standard
English, and in these writings his political or civil commentary is often at its bluntest. He is
regarded as a pioneer of the Romantic movement, and after his death he became a great source of inspiration to the founders of both liberalism and socialism, and a cultural icon in Scotland and among the Scottish Diaspora around the world.\[6\].

Celebration of Burns’ life and work became almost a national charismatic cult during the 19th and 20th centuries, and his influence has long been strong on Scottish literature. In 2009 he was chosen as the greatest Scot by the Scottish public in a vote run by Scottish television channel STV. As well as making original compositions, Burns also collected folk songs from across Scotland, often revising or adapting them. His poem (and song) "Auld Lang Syne" is often sung at Hogmanay (the last day of the year), and "Scots Wha Hae" served for a long time as an unofficial national anthem of the country. Other poems and songs of Burns that remain well known across the world today include "A Red, Red Rose"; "A Man's a Man for A' That"; "To a Louse"; "To a Mouse"; "The Battle of Sherramuir"; "Tam o’ Shanter"; and "Ae Fond Kiss"\[7\][8].

**Burns and His Times**

By 1780 the mid-century poets, like Thomas Gray and William Collins, were mostly gone. A new generation of poets could now be seen rising. Among the most distinguished of these new poets were William Cowper, Robert Burns, William Blake etc. Cowper and Burns have similarities, which other do no share with each other in the same measure. These two
mark alike a tendency to use subjective, autobiographical material and to write of rural domesticity. They can be considered among the latest flowerings in the eighteenth century of the cult of simplicity.

Since Cowper’s dates (1731 – 1800) are exactly a century later than Dryden’s, it seems useful to compare these last voices in the neoclassic choir (if indeed they belong there) with the tones of Dryden and Pope, the actual founders of the neoclassical tradition in English poetry. Obviously the century elapsed has grown tender; Burns and Cowper both write satires, but their satires are relatively good-humoured, perhaps a little too much good-humoured. Cowper’s satire in particular lacks hardness, flash and cutting edge. Burns, like Dryden and Pope, has sympathetic generalized observations to make about man; but like Blake and Cowper, he is most aroused concerning underprivileged man. Burns and Blake show faith in progress and in the ability of man to achieve his own destiny. Like Dryden and Pope, Cowper shows a sense of man’s limitations.

Like William Cowper, Burns is also known to be largely a poet of emotion. But whereas Cowper had liking for environment for its own sake, Burns loved it for the human relationship implied in it. His poem, The Cotter’s Saturday Night, is an obvious illustration. Burns also found his local background a grim stimulus towards an escape to a larger life. In his view, this life was the just destiny of all men in a state of freedom. Burns was by no means so untaught as this quoted stanza would seem to say. But this stanza constitutes at least a declaration of poetical independence of learning. On the other hand, it is an implicit reaffirmation of the favourite dogma of the century, “Nature is nature wherever placed.” The ability of “the force of Nature” to reach the heights, if unhindered, or even to reach despite hindrance, had been a cherished notion throughout the Augustan age. Burns can be said to be a complete demonstration of this idea. It may also be noted that, later in the nineteenth century, natural genius will be regarded as “spontaneity” rather than untaught. But Burns was not all for spontaneity; he always felt proud of his careful revision of his poems.

Burns as Scottish Poet

The growing tendency of Scottish writers to write in English, led to an almost disappearance of the Scots literary language. Consequently, it led to the survival of Scots only as a series of regional dialects. Several historical events went into the making of English
the more attractive option for the writers of Scotland. The Reformation, the Union of the Crowns in 1603, and the prestige and influence of the Elizabethan writers, all helped in the rise of this phenomenon. The Union of Parliaments in 1707, when the Scottish Parliament ceased to exist and Scotland ceased to be a political entity to become only the northern part of Great Britain, marked a further stage in the assimilation of Scottish culture to English. Its short run influence was, however, in the opposite direction. Feeling frustrated in their national hopes. Scotsmen turned to their literary past for consolation. As a result, the antiquarian interest in Old Scottish literature steadily grew throughout the eighteenth century\(^9\). At the same time, attempts were made to imitate and perpetuate, in whatever limited a way, some of the older Scottish literary traditions\(^{10}\).

**English Speech and Poetry Form as Medium for Scottish Writers**

In the given circumstances of the eighteenth century it was inevitable that English speech and English literary forms should be looked upon as the proper medium for Scottish writer who wished to succeed in the larger world. No doubt, there was a revival of Scots verse, but it was a dialect verse used for the most part for humorous or sentimental purposes, in a patronizing, exhibitionist, or nostalgic manner. Robert Burns is said to have brought to a brilliant close the chapter in the history of the Scottish poetry that had been begun by Allan Ramsay. Burns had begun in early 1783 to keep a Commonplace Book in which he entered his poems and his comments on poetry and song.

**Burns as a Song Writer – Singing Soul of Scotland**

To pass from Burns’s poems – his epistles, satires and narratives – to his songs is to pass to something purer and more piercing and aerial, less tied to traditional tales, real persons, known legends, local incidents, and all the harsh, tough fibres of Scottish character and the oddities of country physiognomy. It is to pass from the earth to the air or the fire. For even when the matter of the songs is actually of that familiar sort, rank or homely, it has wandered wider on the lips of the people.

It is the poet who makes it universal by his treatment. He sublimates the earthly material. He captures the breath and finer spirit “of his people, which, more than all others, is inconceivable without songs.
No one has ever done this for England, where there is no such material to work upon. No one has done it for Ireland, where the material is far more abundant. Burns and Burns alone has done it for Scotland. He really became the singing soul of his people. Nearly two hundred songs were sent by Burns to his employers. He sent some to the unlettered engraver James Johnson for his Musical Museum in 1787. Others, in 1792, he sent for the Scottish Airs, of George Thomson. He scattered many more all around. He had freedom in the museum to virtually edit his songs, and he was then at his best. Whatever be the case, his songs are enchanting. Think of his world famous “O my luve is like a red, red rose”. This, too, he picked up from the old stock, mended and amended, softened and sweetened, and made it a haunting piece.

Such ways of working could be shown at endless length in the case of Burns. He took whatever served him, and did what he would with it, with unfailing instinct. Also, as his manuscripts often show, he gave to it a ceaseless care and revision, which is most striking in some of the most artless-seeming and reeled-off ditties. “O saw ye home Lesley” is a piece of gallantry of his own, in honour of a real Miss Leslie Baillie, when he accompanied her, with her father, on a ride southward.

*The Cotter’s Saturday Night*

This poem has been considered by critics as a sort of hybrid. It is, for one thing, written in the Spenserian stanza, which Burns borrowed, not directly from Spenser, but indirectly from Beattie. It remains of purely English descent, never before used by any Scottish vernacular poet. Although said partly to have been suggested by Fergusson’s Farmer’s Ingle, and professedly descriptive of a lowly Scottish interior, and of “the sentiments and manners” of the Scottish peasants in their more hallowed relations.

*Burns’ Style*

Burn’s poem is not, like Fergusson’s written “in their native language”. It is written, on the contrary, substantially in modern English with, here and there, a sparse sprinkling of Scottish, or Scoto English, terms. It is for this reason that it has been called a hybrid, for it mixes the English and the Scottish traits together. Much of this poem’s tone, many of its sentiments and portions of its phraseology are reminiscent of those of the English poets whom Burns knew. These poets are Milton, Gray, Pope, Thomson and Goldsmith. The poem

---

Dr. Roshni Duhan, Ph.D. (Law), M.A. (English)
The Literature Tendencies of the Restoration Age in the Perspectives of John Dryden and Robert Burns

---
comes out as a kind of medley of ideas and phrases partly borrowed from them, very much in the manner of Grey’s poetry.

Burns mixes these borrowings with reflections of his own and descriptions partly in their manner but derived from his own experience. It may in fact be termed a splendidly specious adaptation rather than quite an original composition. However, in *The Cotter’s Saturday Night* there is a genuine pulse of poetry under an occasionally unreal, or rather uncongenial phraseology. As Burns himself tells us, he had “greeted by his father’s fireside” whilst composing it.

The workmanship of the English parts of the poem has been, quite often, underestimated. But at other times, he would turn out, in uncomfortable poetical or rhetorical diction, his utterances of revulsion and repentance. The poet’s devotion though honest enough, has gone rather hectic.

However, we must not forget that no such legacy of form can be one of form alone. We know how the soul of Burns was itself an inheritance. That tone of fetal familiarity, for one thing, before which everything goes down, is deep in the Scottish character. It is a feature, it will not be too much to say, even of its religious himself Burns emerges a free-loving peasant amorist, as he does in *The Cotter’s Saturday Night*, living at first by semi-polygamous country custom, full of passion, blatancy, fickleness, tenderness, fun, true and untrue sentiment, unchivalry, repentances, and domestic feeling, and if he enjoys and struggles accordingly, well, it is idle to pity him alone. We must take generations of his peasant forbears under the wing of our patronage or condonation, and praise nor does he show us every kind. But, on the whole, Burns is a far more superb figure and represents a richer type, than any which it lay within the plan or perhaps the ability of Scott to portray. Finally, in *The Cotter’s Saturday Night* Burns affects for a time the slow pensive movement of his Spenserian model.

*Holy Willie’s Prayer*

The real Burns is said to be revealed in his satires and humorous poems and in the abandonment to the moment of experience. We find this abandonment celebrated in many of his best songs as well. The poem opens with a calmly expressive statement of the view that
man’s salvation or damnation is decreed by God without any reference to man’s behavior. It is the very quietness and assurance of the statement that, at first, conceals its preposterousness. Then, suddenly, it reveals it when we least expect it:

O thou that in the heavens does dwell!
Wha, as it pleases best Thysel.
Sends one to heaven and ten to hell,
   A’ for thy glory!
And no for only guide or ill
   They’ve done before thee.
I bless and praise Thy matchless might,
When thousands Thou has left in night,
That I am here before Thy sight
   For gifts and grace,
A burning and a shining light
   To a’ this place.

As the poem progresses in the above quoted liturgical manner, the speaker’s appalling complacency and egotism, even to the speaker himself, as humility, are cumulatively revealed. Burns does not portray Holy Willie a conscious hypocrite. Thus, Holy Willie’s Prayer is wholly satirical in tone. The poem can be considered a mere material chain of brilliantly relentless mockery. Burns makes this mockery serve both a general and a special purpose.

**The Jolly Beggars**

Like his Holly Willie’s Prayer, Burns also excluded from his Kilmarnock volume his remarkable anarchist cantata, “The Jolly Beggars”. In this poem, Burns assembled a group of social outcasts and put into their mouths roaring songs of social defiance and swaggering independence. In burns, there always seemed a streak of anarchism. But in the poem, he associates it with conviviality in a characteristic way. Here are abandoned in roaring professions of antisocial independence all institutions, all conventions, anything that limits the freely chosen association of friends and lovers with one another. The attitude manifested in the poem may not be mature or complex, but it does touch a fundamental human drive.
The Jolly Beggars gives a brilliant expression to man as outcast and vagabond. Complete independence of social order implies poverty, squalor, and vice, but Burns does not shrink from that prospect. He refuses to romanticize independence from society. He only bodies it forth, motivated less by doctrinaire anarchism than by sheer high spirits. Burns does not seem to have been acquainted with the old English plays, treatises and songs dealing with the fortunes of beggars, vagabonds and outlaws. But he must have read, one can legitimately presume, Gray’s The Beggar’s Opera. He decidedly knew the clever Scottish ballads The Gaberlunzie Man and The Jolly Beggar. He evidently got faint hints from The Happy Beggars – an excerpt from Charles Coffey’s ballad opera, The Beggars’ Wedding, The Merry Beggars of Ramsay’s Tea-Table, Miscellany and the song books.

Burns’s manuscripts, as well as his comments to Johnson, show his fidelity to this creed. One can connect it, on one side, with his study of Pope and Addison. On the other, it recalls that of his contemporary Blake, who preached gospel of execution, or of firm determinate outline. Burns’s thrift and precision are among his greater attributes as a poet. It does not at all seem fair to read The Jolly Beggars immediately before passing to the humours of the middle-class topers in Guy Mannering. The Jolly Beggars is Burns’s longest, best harmonize, and most magnificent production, perfectly harmonious in its uproar. It is without even one flagging moment in its ever varying bravura.

Burns as a Poet Freedom

The three poems we have discussed here are, more or less, satires. But they are not the type of satires Dryden and Pope and Johnson wrote. Burns, unlike these three, did not make any attempt to master the classics. He never thought of imitation Horace or Juvenal. In that sense of a learned poet, Burns was not a classic. And yet he practiced some of the finest qualities of classical art. Similarly, he shared a good deal with the romantics, and yet he was not a romantic in the formal sense in which Blake and Wordsworth were. Hence, he is a classic and not a classic: a romantic and not a romantic.

As is clear from these three poems, his satire is as distinctively Burnsian as anything else he wrote. He is too individualistic to be easily grouped with any literary movement or style. He does seem to be as unique as Blake was, or Byron was. But behind all the variety of

Language in India www.languageinindia.com ISSN 1930-2940 15:6 June 2015
Dr. Roshni Duhan, Ph.D. (Law), M.A. (English)
The Literature Tendencies of the Restoration Age in the Perspectives of John Dryden and Robert Burns
subject and style, mode and method, there is an essence of the life and temper of his country which Burns represents, and this essence can be described as the freedom of the natural soul.

References


Dr. Roshni Duhan, Ph.D. (Law), M.A. (English)
Counsellor
IGNOU Study Centre
Rohtak 124001
Haryana
India
roshni_0507@yahoo.com
Comparison between Shaw’s and Brecht’s
Treatment of Political Consciousness

Sadia Riaz, M.Phil, Rida Sarfraz, M.Phil, and
Farhan Ebadat Yar Khan, Ph.D.

Abstract

The German Bertolt Brecht (1898-1956) and the Englishman George Bernard Shaw (1856-1950) were socially and politically active, innovative, progressive, radical, controversial, and “problem” playwrights who wrote in tradition of political theatre. Most active during the first half of the Twentieth Century, both were revolutionary social critics who shocked their contemporaries with the unpopular activist philosophies of their plays and other writings. Their political philosophies stemmed from the same fount of Marxism.

Brecht adopted communism and Shaw espoused socialism. In their dramatic works, their political consciousness reflects in their dramatic characterization, thematic concerns, and stylistic organization and devices. This paper aims at examining the treatment of political consciousness in these master political playwrights of political consciousness through comparison and analysis of their art of characterization, thematic patterns, and dramaturgical techniques. Interestingly, their characters become their mouth pieces by manifesting their creators’ political conscious through ironic tone or through morally negative consequences of the idealist behaviour of their heroines. Moreover, both cloak their political thematic patterns in dramatic devices which will also come under scrutiny. However, they were different temperamentally which somehow shaped their respective dramatic visions and intentions somewhat differently.

Key words: Bertolt Brecht, George Bernard Shaw, political consciousness in creative writing, comparison.
Introduction

When the playwright can stab people to the heart by showing them the meanness of cruelty of something they did yesterday, and intend to do tomorrow, all the tricks to catch and hold their audience, became the silliest of superfluities… The dramatist knows that as long as he is teaching and saving the audience he is sure of their strained attention as a dentist is or as Angel of Annunciation.

Bernard Shaw,

*The Quintessence of Ibsenism*¹

To understand the political dynamics of Brecht’s and Shaw’s plays, an incisive understanding of Karl Marx (1818-1883)’s idea of “[political] consciousness” is vital. In Marx’s view, consciousness is always political, for it is always the outcome of politico-economic circumstances. What one thinks of life, power, and self, for Marx, is always a product of ideological forces. For him, ideologies appear to explain and justify the current distribution of wealth and power in a society.² In societies with unequal allocations of wealth and power, ideologies present these inequalities as acceptable, virtuous, inevitable, and so forth. Ideologies thus tend to lead people to accept the status quo. The subordinate people come to believe in their subordination: the peasants to accept the rule of the aristocracy, the factory workers to accept the rule of the owners, consumers the rule of corporations. This belief in one’s own subordination, which comes about through ideology, is, for Marx, in a politically charged sense, becoming “politically conscious” is often meant to connote that people have awakened to their true political role, their actual identity. For Marx, this meant that the working classes would become conscious of themselves as the agents of history--they would unite and share in the wealth of labor. This, for Marx, was

¹ Shaw, Bernard, *The Quintessence of Ibsenism* (Routeledge, 2009), p 50
² Marx, Karl and Frederick Engels, *The German Ideology Part One, with Selections from Parts Two and Three, together with Marx’s "Introduction to a Critique of Political Economy"* (New York: International Publishers, 2001), p76
their historical role and their right (as opposed to working for wages, fighting wars on behalf of capitalists, and so forth). Significantly, both Brecht and Shaw endeavour to reach out the audience and awaken them from spiritually deadened existences and thus to germinate “political consciousness” in strictest Marxist term.

The political groundings of both Brecht and Shaw ran deep as they both were actively involved in their lives to pragmatically step up for their Marxist cause. Shaw’s association with Fabian Society and Brecht’s affiliation with Leninist-Marxist’s ideology and practice need no preamble.

Discussion

This portion is concerned with the study of the traces of political consciousness in Shaw’s and Brecht’s plays in terms of parallel themes, devices, and characterization. Another subdivided part will bring out the points of departure in their political consciousness.

(1) Themes

First we will discuss the thematic similarities between these two modern playwrights’ works. The political aesthetics steeps deep as they radically castigate the society’s dirty politics, senseless war, corrupted societal institutions, illusive ideals, unequal distribution of wealth, nonsensical societal value-systems, and in the midst of which are mired apathetic people. Hence both understand the need to brutally shake them out of their bovine apathy. Needless to say, this aim is the sum and substance of the political theatre.

In Shavian theatre, instances abound. Shaw’s attempt to dislocate the audience from their received notions so that out-of-box thinking will emerge if the society is to make headway is reflected in Mrs. Warren’s Profession and Widowers’ Houses. Dealing with

3 Ibid., pp.12-15.
5 Ibid., p.20.
social conditions, “the unpleasant play” Mrs. Warren’s Profession presents a practical
discussion of prostitution, the means by which Mrs. Warren educated her children and made
of them a lady and a gentleman. In return she receives their criticism for her profession. Like
Widowers’ Houses, this play realistically accepts a condition unmentionable in polite society
at the time. Shaw boldly produced many such plays. He critiques the unjust economic
system in Pygmalion and many others. In Major Babara, Shaw posits that the hell is located
in the poverty-stricken slums of cities and here he influenced Brecht in Mahagonny and the
Holy Bible. His anti-war sentiments surface in Arms and the Man which is rather a satirical
assault on those who would glorify the horrors of war. Here he fashions the subjects of false
ideals, heroism, romanticism and the fake glories of war farcically.

In The Apple Cart, Shaw ridicules the course of modern world politics, the
ineffectuality of the nations torn with dissension and jealousy.⁶ There is an irony about
government and power, especially the people who use the power in the play. In preface to
the play, Shaw says that he aims at shattering the idealisms attached to both democracy and
monarchy. Therefore, Shaw’s purpose, as the critic Eric Bentley has pointed out, was to
investigate the relation between idealism and realism.⁷ Exposing hypocrisy was not his goal
rather he hoped to demonstrate how human beings are hoodwinked by their own
unconsidered actions and the beliefs they profess to hold. An opponent of second-hand
thinking in all its guises, he shows his characters discover who they really are, not through
the agency of the plot, but through the exercise of their minds and the movement of their
souls. This sort of original thinking is the first step towards emancipation of an individual
and that of the society on the whole and this is another underlying idea of political theatre.

The above-mentioned thematic patterns echo in Brecht’s drama. He explores themes
related to war, ownership, sacrifice, the notion of justice and the theme of the inequalities
produced by “superior” people in power over the “inferior” lower class in scores of plays,
for example, The Caucasian Chalk Circle. Here he also tries to teach his audiences not to

---

102-104.
⁷ Ibid., p.117.
accept the world as they find it. This dramatic intention is to recur in his plays again and again. In fact, Brecht later develops a new type of theater which he called *Lehrstück* “learning play.” As Hans Eisler posits these plays resemble “political seminars” and as Brecht described them as “a collective political meeting” in which the audience needs to participate. The “learning plays” are the model for the “theater of the future.”

They exemplify the proposition of his political aesthetics keeping in mind participatory culture that would spring revolution. *The Measures Taken* is only one instance; it is about how the rights of individuals are taken away for the sake of group which is also another political issue. Some of his important plays are about the class systems. In *The Good Woman Schuizen*, he points fingers at bourgeois ethos in bourgeois relationships. Similarly, in *Mahagonny, Mother Courage, and The Three Penny Opera*, he explores the dynamics of relations in the capitalist society.

In *Life of Galileo*, he delineates truth-as-commodity idea which is another political theme. In short, the philosophical base of his theatre is political and he veils no attempt to politicize his theatrical art.

In short, Brecht’s and Shaw’s plays address the mental structures that underpin and validate the social institutions which is a political act on their part. They understand Althusser’s philosophy that ideology is imaginary and without critiquing it modern theatre would not and could not exist.

(2) Devices

Shaw never theorizes his dramaturgy in great detail so his innovatory theatrical devices went unnoticed at first. Before Brecht, Shaw flouted the prevalent naturalism in his prologue to *Caesar and Cleopatra* (1898). This aligns him with Brechtian anti-naturalistic epic theatre which intended to subvert and revolt the dominant dramaturgy. The alienation effect, “Verfremdungseffekt,” which gained currency after Brecht’s theorization of it actually had its seed-beds in Shaw’s plays. As Hornby says, Shaw’s plays “are not mere oratory decked out with a few playwriting tricks…they do not promote socialism or any

---

9 Ibid., p.6.
10 Bertolini, John Anthony, *Shaw and other Playwrights*, (Penn State Press, 1993)
other doctrine; they raise questions rather than answer them”.11 Basically, this is the very idea of Brechtian alienation which buds critical thinking in audience’s mind.

The didactic sermonizing epitomizes the political genre of theatre which jolts the people out of their instilled robotic homespun notions and Shaw’s plays are no exception. Shavian introductions, prefaces, drawn out stage directions, lengthy descriptions of characters, epilogues and so on are to orientate the audience and reader to the spirit of his radical activism. Shaw’s Pygmalion is only one example where he propagates his socialist ideals even through characters’ descriptions. Brecht also does sermonize in his plays and steers the ship of audience’s mind to feed on his philosophical treatise of Marxism.12 His putting a long speech into the mouth of Galileo in The Life of Galileo can be cited as an example. So, sermonizing is another commonality between the two. Shaw writes, “The theatre is really the week-day church; and a good play is essentially identical with a church service as a combination of artistic ritual, profession of faith, and sermon.”13 Shaw’s detailed descriptions and stage directions function to make the reader aware of play-within-a-play which later Brecht’s dramatic art also accomplishes to virtual perfection. Such an alienated effect-ploy makes the audience conscious that they are watching a play so their critical outlook springs.

More often than not both Shaw and Brecht present their political ethos through “historicizing”. As Brecht says, “...the epic poet presents the event as totally past, while the dramatic poet presents it as totally present.”14 History is teaching philosophy through examples. Shaw’s Saint Joan is situated in history yet currently relevant therefore he becomes part of “epic theatre” as dubbed by Brecht.15 Almost all of Brecht’s plays are distanced in corridors of history like The Caucasian Chalk Circle, Mother Courage, Life of Galileo. He terms this theatrical practice “historicization” through which a critical outlook

13 Bertolini, John Anthony, Shaw and other Playwrights, (Penn State Press, 1993)
14 Harben, Niloufer, Twentieth Century English Plays from Shaw to Bond (Rowman and Littlefield, 1988)
toward the society is given birth. The reason is the status quo is, by then, viewed as “historical, transitory, and subject to change.” Thus Man’s patterns of behaviour are productive of his socio-political contexts and affirmation of this fact is another stepping stone towards political change.

Another theatrical device of “alienation effect” which is the point of convergence in both these playwrights’ spectrum of techniques is the use of “episodic” ploy. It is a constant chiming bell to remind the audience that they are watching the message-driven play so it stimulates contemplation. This is inspired from Elizabethan “Chronicle Play.” Shaw’s *Pygmalion* exemplifies such structural organization.

They share another ground which is their interest in music. The musical effect heightens the mood on the one hand, and, on the other, reinforces the fact that the audience is watching the dramatic performance which is another distancing technique. Their plays like *Pygmalion* and *The Caucasian Chalk Circle* are examples. And as is know, to distance is to make the audience think and re-think. In fact, music is one of the greatest inspirational forces behind their dramatic techniques and conceptions.

Another element which binds them together is their resistance to the Aristotelian representational function of the drama and their endorsement of Platonic idea of drama. Their plays do not have emotive inducement but thought-provoking power. The non-naturalistic surrealistic settings are another significant junction point to trigger critical thinking in order to see the reality of things which are hitherto submerged in audience’s mind and their plays amply exemplify it.

Brecht contends that the distinguishing feature of epic theatre is its dialectic quality which is essential for the political play. This is also the characteristic feature of Shaw’s plays. For instance, Shaw’s *The Apple Cart* debates on the superiority of ideologies argued by the characters of Magnus and the labor leader. What makes the audience choose sides is

---

16 Maison, Bruster, Blackmore Evans, *In the Company of Shakespeare*, (Fairleigh Dickinson University Press, 2002)


Sadia Riaz, M.Phil, Rida Sarfraz, M.Phil, and Farhan Ebadat Yar Khan, Ph.D.

Comparison between Shaw’s and Brecht’s Treatment of Political Consciousness 145
the logic and force of the characters’ words and actions and Magnus, as a Constitutional
Monarch, hold influence in a sympathetic way.17 Similarly, Brecht’s *Mother Courage and
her Children* is all about its argumentative quality which is “live by the sword will perish by
the sword.” Some critics hold that Shaw’s dialectics are more complex, and, therefore,
powerful than that of Brecht. But significant is the fact that they both use dialectics to
educate the audience’s mind.

For Shaw and Brecht, the kernel is important than shell, the content than form. Shaw
once writes, “…to listen for a writer’s message, even when the fellow is a fool, is one thing:
to worship his tools and tricks, his pose and his style, is an abomination. Admire them by all
means, just as you admire the craft of the masons and the carpenters and sculptors who built
your cathedral; but don’t go inside and sing Te Deums to them”.18 Therefore, their
techniques are mere instruments to get across their message.

(3) Characterization

Shaw’s and Brecht’s art of characterization runs in same vein to an extent. Their
characters often act contrary to the mood set by the music and stage-setting. They are
endowed with unconventional and unanticipated features. In Shaw’s Ana, there is a fusion
of ideal and human traits which also flouts the preconceived notions about stereotypical
female onstage. This is Shavian way of distancing and causing the audience to re-think
about the instilled notions about women after winning them over with humour. The
protagonist of *The Good Woman Schuzen* is another such character. Their most significant
message gets through real characters and not conventional, expected archetypes.

To Rabey, the political theatre was trying to expose the contradictions via individual
consciousness and thereby maneuvered its audience into a critical position towards the status

---

17 Bentley, Eric, *Bentley on Brecht*, (North Western University Press, 2008)
18 Stanley Weintraub, *Shaw: The Annual of Bernard Shaw Studies*, Vol. 8. (University Park and
quo. Hence characterization is the core. Shaw initiated such a ploy and Brecht furthered it which is the linchpins of political theatre.

The humane feature of their characters is essential element of their characterization and this places their political consciousness amidst humanism. Above all, Shaw’s Eliza and Brecht’s mother are humans in Pygmalion and Mother Courage respectively.

(4) Points of Departure

Despite Shaw’s insight into the ways of world, he is still able to thread the utopian world. But Brecht knows that such imaginative indulgences are not necessary and his indignation towards life leads him to draw a harrowing reality. Thus his plays reflect his “brutal, irrational, satanic side” of his personality in contrast to Shaw’s genial temper which makes him keeps faith in human beings as reflected through their works.

Concluding Remarks

The drama of 20th-century was dominated by Shaw and Brecht who were believers of political aesthetics or social function of art and through their plays they crushed floating illusions of reality and addressed other urgent contemporary issues. As Shaw writes, “in modern society is full of people who are being imprisoned and harmed by institutions within which they live… patriotism, marriage, duty, respectability… not encouraged to be out of them. Idealism is beautifying the pictures of institutions. Ibsenities are revolutionary because they demolish Ideals and disable the psychological mechanisms which make institutions bearable”. So, both came into the fold of Ibsenities. They placed their political perception in a historical situation to show larger dimension of time, awareness of different possible dimensions of an event, and a serious regard for the historical truth. The significance of the political plays was accentuated because they were writing at the time when the world was raged with appalling chaotic inferno of wars and revolutions.

---

19 Rabey, British and Irish Political Drama in 20th-Century, p.27.
21 Ronald D. Gray, Brecht the dramatist, (Faber and Faber, 1956)
22 Shaw, Bernard, The Quintessence of Ibsenism (Routeledge, 2009), p 34
In the 20th-century Europe, dominant politics was that of right, but political theater was meant to be of left though it should have denoted political neutral. Both Shaw and Brecht learned much from the same unlikely mix of “comedians, sports, film, Marx, and the Bible.” Thus both were significant contributors to progressive theatre theory and practice. Both belonged to a similar tradition of dramatic writing as they had been subjected to similar influences, and showed a surprising agreement in such things as their attitude towards Naturalism, or their rejection of a merely photographic rendering of the world around them. In short, their thematic and structural patterns, dramatic devices, art of characterization struck the audience as similar because their tradition was the same.

=================================================================

Bibliography

Gray, R. D. Brecht the dramatist. Faber and Faber, 1956.
Maison, Bruster, & Blackmore E., In the Company of Shakespeare. Fairleigh Dickinson University Press, 2002

23 Drain, Richard, Twentieth Century Theatre: A Sourcebook, (Routeledge, 1995)
Comparison between Shaw’s and Brecht’s Treatment of Political Consciousness

Rabey, British and Irish Political Drama in 20th-Century, p.27.

Sadia Riaz, M.Phil.
sadisehole@gmail.com

Rida Sarfraz M.Phil.
ridasarfraz052@hotmail.com

Lecturers, University of Management and Technology
Lahore, Pakistan

Farhan Ebadat Yar Khan, Ph.D.
Professor of English
Higher Education Department
Government of Punjab, Lahore
dr.farhanebadatyarkhan@gmail.com
The Image of the Woman Paralleled With the Decline of Delhi

Sadia Riaz, M.Phil.
Farhan Ebadat Yar Khan Ph.D.

Abstract

This paper critically analyzes and traces the parallel images that contribute in establishing Ahmed Ali as both a feminist writer who brings out the voice of the suppressed female as well as a writer who laments the change that the Delhi city and the people of India were wrought. In tracing this decline, Ahmed Ali’s feminist stance is also revealed, where he likens the beauty of the Delhi city with the beauty of a woman. It is thus, that the image of the woman: the courtesan as well as the domestic woman reign important in the novel. The gradual decline of the position of women, demonstrated in the marriages that take place and in their physical ailments and gradual deaths, is paralleled with the historical changes that take place in this city.
**Key Words:** Feminism, Hybridity, Subalterns, Marginalization.

1. **Introduction**

‘Delhi was once a paradise,
Such peace had abided here;
But they have ravished its name and pride,
Remain now only ruins and care’

-Bahadur Shah (quoted by Ahmed Ali in the epigraph of ‘Twilight in Delhi’)

Salman Rushdie’s axiom, “the Empire writes back to the centre” gets currency from Ashcroft’s, Griffiths’s, Tiffin’s celebrated book titled the same, *The Empire Writes Back*, which denotes to the process of probing and re-presenting the colonial discourse which characterises postcolonial writings (McLeod, 28). The postcolonial core of *Twilight in Delhi* manifests most in its thematic concerns. A postcolonial discourse studies the dynamics of identity, politics, race, power, subordination and dominance, landlessness, displacement or dislocation of culture, and hybridization.

McLeod claims that the utmost feature of any postcolonial text is its posing a direct threat to the colonial centre from the colonised margins. Ahmed Ali’s novel classifies into this postcolonial criterion as he shows the reader the other side of the story, for example, of the hitherto distorted and blunted picture of the 1857 War of Independence which has been dubbed as “Mutiny” by the British colonisers. He confers the new ways of seeing which contest the dominant mode of seeing and voice the colonised people of subcontinent. Homi K. Bhaba attributes this feature as the heart of post-colonialism, “what does need to be questioned, however, is the mode of representation of otherness” (Bhaba, 54). This act can be termed as textual de-colonisation. Actually, British felt Ali’s book as posing a threat to them evident from the denied publication of his book by the leading British publication houses of the times (Ali, xvii).

The first and foremost principle of post-colonialism is the right to autonomous self-government of those being controlled by foreign power (Young, 109). At the coronation, Mir Nihal’s anguished utterance to his grandson is representative of political ethos of Indian Muslims about their self-imposed British rulers. He says, “see there go the horses and the
Farangis… Don’t you see them? Those are the people who have been our undoing, and will be yours too… But you will be brave… fight… drive them out of the country” (Ali, 148). Begum Mir Nihal echoes her husband’s discontent, “its God’s vengeance falling on these good-as-dead Farangis. May they be destroyed for what they have done to Hindustan” (Ali, 154).

Post-colonialism carries an utmost importance in the history of a nation because it is “a state of consciousness, a crucial stage in the continuum of cultural process and self-awareness” (ed. Lazarus, 113). Ali himself admits he intends to evoke “racial memory” through his literary piece (Ali, i). Many postcolonial theorists ascribe such function to Post-colonial Literature. Leela Ghandi refers to this point, “post-colonialism can be seen as a theoretical resistance to the mystifying amnesia of the colonial aftermath. It is a disciplinary project devoted to the academic task of revisiting, remembering, and crucially interrogating the colonial past” (Morton quoted Ghandi, 123). As Ali writes, “it’s [Delhi] human identity now lost forever in the forced amnesia of plucked out memory…” (Ali, xx). Bhaba seconds Ghandi’s stance when he says “post-colonial project… seeks to explore the social pathologies _ loss of meaning, conditions of anomie” (Bhaba, 202). Therefore, the postcolonial themes are the usable past, the cultural roots, and displacement. Ali’s novel is the prismatic spectrum of all of them. As he himself clearly states,
“What I had in mind… was the awareness or the consciousness of the past… a certain feeling for the glory that was gone, the failure of the people of India, and of the Muslims especially, to have held on to life, to have been able to look at things in terms of cause and effect. And behind this sadness and sorrow was the reason for the disappearance of this glory: the bêtes noires, British imperialism and the British people themselves.”

The postcolonial theory inverts and subverts the binaries and hierarchies. For instance, the Self and Other paradigm is turned upside down. The hitherto tagged Other, Muslims and Indians, is now Self and until now celebrated English Self is turned into Other. Ali uses reductive imagery to portray the English as they are termed as “tommies” and are lurking behind the shadows whereas the Indian Muslims are holding the stage.

McLeod posits that a post-colonial text is always politically “radical” in its approach. Ahmed Ali’s subversive intention is obvious from his political radicalism. The pained polyphonic symphony of nostalgic past of Mughal-Muslim rule pervades the text which shows that he feels the presence of the absence and wants to regain the lost pre-lapsarian paradise. He writes in his introduction that he intends to stir up “racial memory” through his book and this evoking of the bygone days of Muslim rule on his part unveils his political alignment. Moreover, unlike a colonial text, the postcolonial text is political because it never self-idolises by imposing and insisting that its experience is eternal and of universal relevance. It never claims to envisage a holistic outlook. However, these postcolonial writers contend that their writings are voicing the authenticated experiences of their own people and representing their society. Ali contextualises his novel in geo-politico, temporal and spatial boundaries. He dramatises from the War of Independence of 1857, downfall of Delhi and Muslim power, to the coronation of 1911 through pinhole of individual lives of Mir Nihal’s family. A postcolonial text is the one in which the “local concerns” are crucial in its understanding. So, to read Twilight in Delhi without conception of Delhi would hamper its understanding. The postcolonial writers contend that their writings are voicing the authenticated experiences of their own people.

Apart from apparent “political imperialism,” “cultural imperialism” is another bane of colonialism. As Ashcroft write, “we use the term postcolonial to cover all the culture
effected by the imperial process from the moment of colonisation to the present day. This is because there is continuity of preoccupation throughout the historical process initiated by European aggression.” Due to cultural change the postcolonial literature negotiates myth, history, language, and landscape, alongside Self and Other.

The postcolonial feminism is dominant thematic pattern. In postcolonial feminist discourse, women are normally painted as an active agent in the historical and social processes. The colonial construction of male dominated colonies is vigorously contested by postcolonial writers like Ahmed Ali. His women characters are mostly strong like Begum Jamal and Begum Waheed, some of them are passive resisters like Begum Nihal’s cunning way of having her own way in Asghar’s marriage, some of them are symbolic emblem of the postcolonial concept of women as space like Bahadur Shah’s relative and the naked woman in street, and all of them epitomise the celebrated indigenous culture which include cultured courtesans like Mushtari Bai.

In fact, the figure of cultured courtesan runs in many subcontinent writings, for example, in Saida Bai of Vikram Seth’s A Suitable Boy. Another sort of postcolonial feminism is the depiction of women as oppressed in social, religious, and cultural contexts. Begum Nihal, Mehro, Begum Waheed, and Bilqueuee are silent sufferers of thumbscrews of prevalent patriarchal system. They are the women who are doubly displaced from the centre as a woman and as the colonised. In one way, Ali lays blame on the colonisation for women disempowerment as if the western culture of wielding power strongly altered the local practice of giving significant status to women. Distinguished historians like Romila Tharper, Irfan Habib, and IH Qureshi explain how Mughal women of nobility were empowered in the medieval India. Examples of Razia Sultana, Maha Manga, and Nur Jahan can be quoted here. These authors also suggest the important role of women in the social life which has been altogether ignored by most of the Orientalists.
The re-presentation of indigenous cultural ethos is the core of any postcolonial text. The colonial gaze looks down upon the denizens of Delhi with their leisure and pleasures of kite-flying, pigeon-keeping, qwaali-singing, paan-chewing during their imperial rule in India. But here they are celebrated with reverent indulgence, Begum Nihal sits on her cot and “… draws her dome-shaped paan-box, puts lime and katha on a betel leaf, then adds finely cut areca nut, some cardamom, a little tobacco, rolls it up and puts it in her mouth.” Ali’s detailed descriptions of rituals of *Mehfil-e-meelad* and Asghar’s wedding show his heartfelt reverence for his culture. The subcontinent culture does not endorse capitalistic commoditisation of person-to-person contact so here we see Mir Nihal and band of friends like Sirajuddin Khan Saail and Daagh Dehlalwi is not bound by any economic relation and this is another way of “the empire writing back to the centre.” The postcolonial writers also flout the western value of solipsism so Begum Jamal’s departure from Mir Nihal’s house bleeds his heart to death.

The postcolonial theorists agree on the hybridization as a necessary consequent condition of colonial experience. As Frantz Fanon says “black men, white masks”. Asghar represents such hybrid existence of thresholds. His attire and his shunning of some of his ancestral and cultural mores as obvious in his opting to marry with a girl of his own choice and his living in a separate house with his wife show his fascinated adopting of foreign value-systems. Yet, he has to live his life into the convention-bound family which creates an
acute chasm. Due to it, his assimilation he becomes an outsider in his own family as evident from Saeed Hassan’s sarcasms. His split self is elucidated by Homi K. Bhaba:

“… the irresolvable borderline culture of hybridity that articulates its problems of identification and its diasporic aesthetic in an uncanny, disjunctive temporality that is, at once, the time of cultural displacement, and the space of the ‘untranslatable.’”

There is a good reason to assume that Asghar’s character is closest to Ahmed Ali’s heart because he confesses that he feels like a “brown Englishman” who is on a receiving end as he has lost his “identity”, “freedom,” and “culture” (Ali, xiv). The hyphenated post-colonialism shows the inextricable intertwining of the two entities and, therefore, hybridization is imperative.

French philosophers Gilles Deleuze and Felix Guattari philosophise the idea of “landlessness” which infers to the forced “exile” of the person from his land. Ali alludes to such land loss of people of Delhi after 1857 war when inhabitants were driven out and again in 1912 when Delhi was replaced by New Delhi and new people were settled there. Deleuze and Guattari coin the term of “reterritorialization” to denote “the violent dynamics of the colonial or imperial propagation of economic, cultural, and social transformation of indigenous culture, at the same time as characterising of the successful process of resistance to deterritorialisation [i.e., appropriation] through the anti-colonial movement.”

Ali refers to both forms of imperialist control of land, literal and figurative, and also portrays the resistant element it such an action ignites. For instance, Asghar is enchained to corrupt influence of colonial culture on indigenous and Mir Nihal is the one who resists and wages the war against it, no matter how hopeless that is. In fact, Ahmed Ali’s battles by writing the novel in the first place because this is his bid to eternalise in art what has been made to vanish in the air. Therefore, metaphorically, his novel is exegesis of “reterritorialisation.”

The sub-textual reading of the text surfaces the well-designed symbolic structure which brings Ahmed Ali’s postcolonial point home. Apart from it, the inserted poetic pieces
Sadia Riaz, M.Phil. and Farhan Ebadat Yar Khan Ph.D.
The Image of the Woman Paralleled With the Decline of Delhi

The last Mughal Emperor Bahadur Shah Zafar's poetic laments are employed as epigraphs and frequently inserted in text. Thus it is a structural device which also constructs the meta-narrative to comment, reiterate, and reinforce the main narrative. The opening epigraph encapsulates the whole idea of the book:

> Delhi was once a paradise,
> Such peace had abided there;
> But they have ravished its name and pride,
Remain now only ruins and care.

Ahmed Ali realises that the colonial devastation is irrevocable yet time and history will forever live through resurrection in art forms such as his own literary effort.

**Discussion**

Ahmed Ali’s novel, *Twilight in Delhi* laments the fall of Delhi and the rise of the British conquerors who stripped the city of its glory and grandeur that was characteristically Indian. The loss of the old values and the style of life that was celebrated and venerated by its people are gradually seen to give way under a new and British style of life. In tracing this decline, Ahmed Ali’s feminist stance is also revealed, where he likens the beauty of the Delhi city with the beauty of a woman. It is thus, that the image of the woman: the courtesan as well as the domestic woman reign important in the novel. The gradual decline of the position of women, demonstrated in the marriages that take place and in their physical ailments and gradual deaths, is paralleled with the historical changes that take place in this city. This paper will therefore attempt to critically analyze and trace these parallel images that contribute in establishing Ahmed Ali as both a feminist writer who brings out the voice of the suppressed female as well as a writer who laments the change that the Delhi city and the people of India were wrought with.

Ahmed Ali develops in his novel a contrast between what was and what is, and it is this contrast that gives a sense of transience in the novel and emphasizes upon the changes that take place in the lives of the people. He elaborates upon the position of the women and the lives that these people lived, and with the gradual evolution of the novel, a significant change and regression can be sensed and perceived. In the portrayal of this idea, Ahmed Ali brings out certain images and also deals with relationships as well as marriages that serve to bring out this contrast and transience more prominently.

One of the most significant images that Ahmed Ali portrays in the course of the novel, paralleled with the position of women and the state of Delhi is that of the wall.

Around the beginning of the novel, Ahmed Ali shows how the women are protected within the four walls of the zenana: He writes: ‘Walls stood surrounding them on all sides, shuttung the women in from the prying eyes of men, guarding their beauty and virtue’ (Ali,
While the image of the women enclosed within the four walls seems oppressive, yet at the same time it also points to the way the women were guarded and protected, secured within the walls of their house, so as to maintain their purity. It is the sanctity of the woman which is venerated and preserved, and this is likened to the state of the city of Delhi.

Delhi too, as Ahmed Ali elaborates is secured within the city walls. However, with the infiltration of the British conquerors, these walls are slowly destroyed and the city is made vulnerable to the ravages of the foreign people, who strip the Delhi city of its past, glorified identity. Ahmed Ali writes: ‘The city walls were also going to be demolished. The residents of Delhi resented all this, for their city, in which they had been born and grew up, the city of their dreams and reality, which had seen them die and live, was going to be changed beyond recognition.’ (Ali, 2007, p. 195) With their arrival, the old Delhi thus ceases to exist and a new Delhi is constructed. The demolition of these walls, inevitably bring about the demolishment of all that Delhi stood for. ‘The old culture, which had been preserved within the walls of the ancient town’ are therefore eventually annihilated (Ali, 2007, p. 197).

The demolition of these walls thus lay bare the glorious city of Delhi to the ravages of the foreign people, and side by side the sanctity of the woman and the position she enjoyed in society is also seen to deteriorate. The walls therefore, in representing the secured and guarded property of the people, are brought down with the arrival of the colonizers. Delhi thus comes to resemble the naked, vulnerable woman who is mentioned in the first part of the novel, as she wanders aimlessly, desirous of being rescued but being perpetually condemned to insults and ridicules. Her vulnerable state thus foreshadows the sad plight of women and the state of Delhi.

Furthermore, the various characters presented in the novel and the relationships between these characters also serve to highlight the gradual decline of Delhi. The marital relationship of Mir Nihal and Begum Nihal, in fact serve to represent the twilight state of Delhi. While their marriage venerates the old values of life, where a woman was protected as well as given certain rights, yet the extra marital affairs of Mir Nihal with Dilchain and the courtesan Babban Jan, seriously deflate the purity of their relationship. Ahmed Ali here too focuses more on the plight of woman, where Begam Nihal is driven to insanity with this breakdown of loyalty from her husband. Mir Nihal’s extra marital affairs however merely
serve as the starting point for a series of digressed relationships. The purity of the marital relationship and the respect due to a woman within this relationship deteriorates further and further with the passage of time. Ahmed Ali, through these digressive relationships demonstrates the passage of time, and the replacement of the old values with the new style of life. He pinpoints how the values of the Delhi people are affected with colonization and with the arrival of a foreign race who introduce their culture amongst the Indian natives. Indeed as Ahmed Ali writes, ‘…a new Delhi meant new people, new ways and a new world altogether.’ (Ali, 2007, p. 197)

The new culture, and the new ways of life thus rob Delhi of its earlier traditions and its glorified past. The city takes on a deathly image, telling a tale of its receded history. The subsequent marriages that take place in the course of the novel show a visible digression. Whereas the marriage ceremonies initially took place with the consent of the families, Asghar’s marriage with Bilqeece proves otherwise. The parents of Asghar are forced to bend under the will of their son who chooses a bride for himself, rather than consenting to the will of his parents. His marriage, taking place soon after the coronation of George V thereby becomes a touchstone, representing the changes that shall soon take hold of Delhi. Ahmed Ali therefore brings together the macrocosm and the microcosm: the assertion of the British Empire, paralleled with the changes taking place on a domestic level. With the beautiful city of Delhi, stamped upon by a foreign race, Ahmed Ali also shows how the position of the woman becomes more and more flaccid.

Asghar’s marriage with Bilqeece supposedly fulfills his dream of winning his beloved. However, this dream once fulfilled is replaced with a new dream and a new image of the beloved. Asghar, weary of Bilqeece now goes from woman to woman, satisfying his hunger elsewhere. With this endless lust, the image of the courtesan thus also deteriorates. In the beginning of the novel, Ahmed Ali elaborated upon the two different types of prostitutes: ‘the cultured ones and the whores’. (Ali, 2007, p. 38) Whereas the cultured ones were respected by society and were even asked to civilize young men, by teaching them good manners, the whores merely existed for the satisfaction of a man’s sexual lust. With the death of Babban Jan, Mir Nihal’s mistress, the image of the courtesan thus also begins to deteriorate into that of a whore. The respect due to a woman and the position enjoyed by the courtesan thus deteriorates and their status in fact amalgamates into that of a whore. The
Delhi becomes a city in the hand of the conquerors who strip it of its culture. With the changes wrought by the British people, Ahmed Ali writes: ‘All this made Delhi look more like an exhibition ground than the city which was once the greatest in Hindustan.’ (Ali, 2007, p. 135) Similarly, the woman too becomes an exhibition: a mere satisfaction of the man’s sexual lust. This is seen most explicitly in Asghar’s relationship with other women. Moreover, the woman as a mere fulfillment of a man’s physical lust culminates in Asghar’s relationship with Bilqeece’s sister, Zohra. Soon after the death of Bilqeece, Asghar’s attention is diverted towards the beauty and charm of her younger sister, and he begins to desire his marriage with her. His attraction towards her is limited merely to the physical level and this lust therefore further deteriorates the position of women in society.

This deteriorated position of the woman is also lamented upon by Ahmed Ali in the marriage of Ghafoor with the niece of Sheikh Muhamad Siddiq. Their marriage is basically settled against any logical considerations and the woman is seen to be cast away as a beast of burden. Sheikh Muhammad Siddiq willingly gives up his niece to Mir Nihal’s servant, Ghafoor, merely to rid himself of her and the responsibility that is due of him. Well aware of Ghafoor’s lust for women, no man stands up for the protection of Sheikh Siddiq’s niece, and it is thus that soon after her marriage, she becomes a victim to the throes of death, too young and weak for the ‘strong and virile Ghafoor.’ (Ali, 2007, p. 200) Thus, Ahmed Ali shows how this lust for women is being brought into the domestic household and how the respected woman of the household is also reduced to this degraded position, with no man left to protect and guard her honour. Similarly, Delhi too is subjugated under the power of a foreign rule.

Another instance which relates the fall of Delhi to the decline of the position of women can be seen in the event of Mehroo’s marriage, the youngest daughter of Mir Nihal. The issue of her marriage is introduced in the very beginning; a proposal that comes for her from ‘far away’ (Ali, 2007, p. 8) While, this proposal comes with a promise of material riches, the proposal from Saeed Hassan—the widower of one of Mir Nihal’s daughter—gains little favour. Though he had treated his deceased wife well, yet the family is unwilling to give him yet another daughter. Caught in the lust of material riches, they blindly accept the
proposal of Meraj, and realize the deception that they had become a victim of on the day of the marriage when the groom appears before them, and reveals himself as physically disfigured. In contrast to his deception then comes the traditional proposal of Saeed Hassan, who had no riches to offer, but that of respecting the woman and guarding her sanctity. Though Mir Nihal initially refuses to marry his daughter to the disfigured man, yet he is made to realize the helplessness of their position, where the girl in turn would be suspected to be suffering from some physical ailment. Thus, the woman is led towards her misery.

This blind act of giving up the daughter for marriage thus parallels the infiltration of the British Empire, who too were blindly accepted by the Mughal Empire. Unaware of the subsequent consequences of allowing the British to enter India for the sake of trade, they are eventually made to bend under their rule and accept them as the ultimate conquerors. Ahmed Ali in his depiction of the decline of Delhi therefore deals with these effects of colonization, where the city is thus robbed and looted of its identity, just as Mehroo’s individuality is sapped. Mehroo and the city of Delhi are thus made to quietly accept their misfortunes.

Thus, it can be established that Ahmed Ali closely relates the decline of Delhi to the declining position of the female race. Right in the opening chapter of the novel, Delhi is metaphorically portrayed as a female body which has been “raped and conquered” (Ali, 2007, p. 4). Ania Loomba also talks about this in her book on Post-colonialism stating, that “from the beginning of the colonial period till its end (and beyond), female bodies symbolize the conquered land” (1998, p. 152). Moreover, Ahmed Ali also draws upon the city of Delhi, bringing it in stark contrast with the image of a beautiful oriental bride. This ‘bride’ however is eventually ‘ravished’ by the alien race, and like the bride of Mehroo, Bilqeece and also the niece of Sheikh Muhammad Siddiq, she looses her original beauty.

Conclusion

Ahmed Ali can therefore be established as a feminist writer who laments upon the deteriorating position of women and links it with his lament of the loss of the traditional city of Delhi. The novel closely links the historical changes of the city with that of the domestic changes taking place as regards the female position in society. The image of the wall, the traditional ceremony of marriages and the women reduced to a mere object of lust, closely resemble the decline of Delhi. Even with Bilqeece’s death, Ahmed Ali links many more
deaths, and thereby turns the city into the grossly image of death. Ahmed Ali thus laments: ‘Delhi became a city of the dead.’ (2007, p. 232) The city in fact begins to resemble the woman ‘gone astray’ that Asghar encounters in one of his wanderings, whom Ahmed Ali describes as: ‘Her face though pretty, communicated a sense of the barrenness of the soul; and about her ways there was something of the women who have gone astray.’ (2007, p. 53) His novel can therefore be praised for its artistic excellence where it inter-relates two of his main concerns and thus provides his readers with a holistic picture of his art, creativity and magnificence of idea.

Work Cited

Bhaba, Homi K. Location of Culture. London: Routledge, 1994

Sadia Riaz, M.Phil.
University of Management and Technology
Lahore, Pakistan
sadisehole@gmail.com

Farhan Ebadat Yar Khan, Ph.D.
Professor of English
Higher Education Department
Government of Punjab
Lahore Pakistan
dr.farhanebadatyarkhan@gmail.com

Language in India www.languageinindia.com ISSN 1930-2940 15:6 June 2015
Sadia Riaz, M.Phil. and Farhan Ebadat Yar Khan Ph.D.
The Image of the Woman Paralleled With the Decline of Delhi
Love and Money: An Analysis of The Great Gatsby

Selvi Bunce
Abstract

Although some may classify The Great Gatsby by F. Scott Fitzgerald as a love story, there is doubt as to whether or not Gatsby was actually in love. As a man obsessed with wealth and social standing, Gatsby had little space in his mind, let alone his heart, for anything else. The paper focuses on issues of wealth and social standing as presented in The Great Gatsby. Identity crisis faced Gatsby is pointed out. The question of love between Daisy and Gatsby is discussed. Even though Gatsby had struggle with false identity, he was goal-oriented and hope-oriented, an idealist.

Key words: The Great Gatsby, Daisy, Gatsby, identity crisis, poor boy and rich girl, wealth and social standing.

Obsessed with Wealth and Social Standing

Although some may classify The Great Gatsby by F. Scott Fitzgerald as a love story, there is doubt as to whether or not Gatsby was actually in love. As a man obsessed with wealth and social standing, Gatsby had little space in his mind, let alone his heart, for anything else. As one reads this novel, it is easy to see everything Gatsby does to obtain his classic 1920’s golden girl, Daisy. However, his motives must be questioned. In The Great Gatsby, Jay Gatsby’s obsession with becoming upper class, alongside his twisted sense of self worth, bring to question whether or not Gatsby really does love Daisy.

Identity Crisis

Since he was a boy, Gatsby had always struggled with his identity, especially his social class. Even as a child, he felt like he deserved more than what he had been allotted. When describing Gatsby’s true background, the narrator states “His parents were shiftless and unsuccessful farm people- his imagination had never really accepted them as his parents at all.” (Fitzgerald 98). This innate discomfort within his own family is exactly what makes Gatsby the falsely confident and truly insecure man he becomes.

Focus of Gatsby’s Life
Gatsby’s entire life revolved around making more out of himself, in terms of wealth. He would not feel successful until he had accomplished his goals exactly as he pictured them. Daisy, the wealthy girl of his dreams, was simply a necessary part of the picture. Not only was Daisy just a part of Gatsby’s plan, but she was also integral to his own self confidence and confirmation. Gatsby’s real name was James Gatz. According to Nick, “The truth was that Jay Gatsby of West Egg, Long Island sprang from his Platonic conception of himself.” (Fitzgerald 98).

Daisy, the Golden Girl

With this twisted sense of self and deliberately created identity, Jay Gatsby was destined to be self consumed and insecure. The only thing that could solve this was, of course, someone else to reinforce his homemade identity, and that someone was Daisy, the golden girl.

Daisy exemplified everything Gatsby wanted in life. She was the picture of wealth.

Nick’s Bewildered Perspective

When the reader first encounters Daisy it is from Nick’s bewildered perspective. As Nick describes seeing Jordan, Daisy’s long time friend, and Daisy for the first time he says, “They were both in white, and their dresses were rippling and fluttering as if they had just been blown back in after a short flight around the house” (Fitzgerald 8).

The reader is immediately given a feeling that these women are somehow other-worldy, and above everyone else without even intending to do so.

Daisy Knows How to Act

Born and raised in old money, Daisy knows how to act. She represents what new money cannot buy. For example, when Nick and Gatsby are discussing Daisy’s voice, Gatsby suddenly says, “Her voice is full of money” (Fitzgerald 120). He says this with a seriousness that is not characteristic of a man blinded by love.

Here the reader is shown how painfully aware Gatsby is of Daisy’s status. This is shown again when Nick explains the first summer Gatsby and Daisy were together: “Gatsby was...
overwhelmingly aware of the youth and mystery that wealth imprisons and preserves, of the freshness of many clothes, and of Daisy, gleaming like silver, safe and proud above the hot struggles of the poor” (Fitzgerald 150).

**Gatsby Becomes Rich**

Gatsby does eventually become rich, but it is not the wealth Daisy is composed of. The only way to become a part of the magical world of old money was to marry in, and that was Gatsby’s plan. He was drawn to Daisy because she would help him to achieve what he could not do alone.

**Struggle with False Identity**

To be above the struggles of the poor was all Gatsby ever wanted. Gatsby was a smart young man and he knew where he stood in the world. This is seen as Nick explains what Gatsby was thinking when he first met Daisy. Nick says, “However glorious might be his future as Jay Gatsby, he was at present a penniless young man without a past, and at any moment the invisible cloak of his uniform might slip from his shoulders.” (Fitzgerald 149). This quote also shows Gatsby’s ongoing struggle with his false identity.

Gatsby knew he could eventually get rich, but he wanted the past he so deeply lacked. He wanted to be respectable. He wanted to be old money. This is evident in how as soon as Tom mentions his underhanded business dealings towards the end of the book Gatsby chokes up and loses his cool. According to Nick, “He began to talk excitedly to Daisy, denying everything, defending his name against accusations that had not been made” (Fitzgerald 134).

If he were the true gangster that his bootlegging profession would suggest, Gatsby would have been able to handle it, maybe even admit to it. All Gatsby wants is to be seen as respectable; he wants to be Tom. Tom is everything Gatsby is not. Tom is a powerful sportsman from old money while Gatsby is a poor army boy with underhanded business dealings. Gatsby believes that having Daisy, and therefore becoming respectable through her old money, will solve all of his problems and put him above those “hot struggles of the poor”.

*Language in India* [www.languageinindia.com](http://www.languageinindia.com) **ISSN 1930-2940** 15:6 June 2015
Selvi Bunce
Love and Money: An Analysis of *The Great Gatsby*
Poor Boy Cannot Marry the Rich Girl

In the end, the poor boy once again cannot marry the rich girl, and Gatsby is all but forgotten as Tom and Daisy go on to continue their lives enjoying the perks of being born into old money. Acquiring Daisy was Gatsby’s main goal throughout his entire adult life, working hand in hand with acquiring wealth. He was goal-oriented and hope-oriented, an idealist.

Makes the Reader Question Gatsby’s Motives

In The Great Gatsby, Gatsby’s motivation not only inspires the reader, but makes the reader question Gatsby’s motives. Gatsby’s struggle with his own identity made it much harder for him to love anyone else. And although many star-struck lovers become blinded by love, Gatsby was in fact blinded by wealth. Gatsby did not love Daisy, but what she represented. He saw the future and knew it was bright, and had everything gone his way, maybe it would have been.

Works Cited

Issues of Caste and Communalism in the Novels of R. K. Narayan

Shakeba Jabeen Siddiqui, Ph.D. (Linguistics)

Abstract
Narayan’s novels reflect a true picture of India during the British rule, through the mirror of his locale, an imaginary home town Malgudi, which is a microcosm of India. The locale of Narayan’s novels is Malgudi, a town somewhere in South India. Traditional concept of typical Hindu thought of status, caste, creed and communalism are evident in his novels. The main characters are linked to these thoughts; this is discussed here as issues related to caste and communalism. The problems of caste, and creed are portrayed in his novels, but these matters are left unsolved by the author. There is no lasting cure suggested for their eradication, neither are there any suggestions given for peaceful co-existence. He also discusses issues of communalism in his novels and advocates the Gandhian ideology of being an Indian first rather than the follower of any one religion.

Key Words: R.K Narayan, Malgudi, Caste, Religion, Communalism

Introduction
Narayan dealt with the issues of caste in his novels in context with man-woman relationship and Indian marriages. He upheld the Hindu traditions and did not support mixed marriages, that is, inter-caste and inter-religion marriages. In his novels, The Guide and The Painter of Signs, he raised the issues of caste in Indian culture and tried to show the disparity of cult and faith, or how differences between religions still constitute an impediment to a legitimate and valid marriage among the Hindus in India. A Hindu can neither marry a woman of low origin like devdasi, like Rosie, nor a Christian girl, Daisy (Narayan, 1958). Disparity of caste and creed are the insurmountable obstacle in a Hindu marriage in India in Narayan's novels.
Themes

R.K Narayan deals with themes centering upon a moment or a mood of crises and for these he found plenty of material in the life around him. Narayan dealt with at least five different places with issues of casteism and religion in his novels. In keeping with the highest Hindu tradition, Narayan chose not to approve of mixed marriages, in his novels. The disparity between culture and faith or religion does still constitute an impediment to legitimate and valid marriage among the Hindus of India. A Hindu in his novel can neither marry a woman of low origin like a devdasi [Rosie] in the Guide, nor a Christian girl [Daisy]. This latter is often shown as an insurmountable obstacle in a Hindu marriage as seen in his novel The Man Eater of Malgudi (Narayan, 1962).

Role of Religion

Narayan had a definite sustained mythical structure that followed the well known pattern of the story from the puranas where a demon grows too powerful and threatens the heavens with his elemental forces of disorder, but finally blows up like a bubble in the sea, leaving the universe as calm as before. Critics have pointed out how closely the novel recreates the old Hindu myth of Bhasmasura. At times Narayan uses phrase and dialogue from the characters which inscribe the role of religion in his novels like when Savitiri defines Vasu in the novel: ‘Every rakshasa gets swollen with his ego, he thinks he is Invincible, beyond every law. But sooner or later something or other will destroy him (The Man Eater of Malgudi, Narayan 1962, p.95).

There are events which show that religion, belief and faith play an important role in the life of Indian Hindus. It is depicted in the event when Narayan mentions in one of his novels “Waiting for Mahatma”,’ that “there are a dozen temples within the radius of fifty miles.” The Hindu view of karma and mukti can also be seen in the novel “Waiting for Mahatma” when Kanni, the shopkeeper compels Sriram to settle an old debt of his grandmother of nine rupees and twelve annas so that the dead woman’s soul would rest in peace in the next world (Narayan, 1955). The Painter of Signs is another novel exhibiting the mythological view of Indian Hindus which is evident in many of the novels of R.K Narayan (Narayan, 1976). The mythological
characters of holy Ganga and king Shantanu offer a parallel to the relationship between Daisy and Raman. The theme of Narayan’s novel, *The Tiger and Man* is the oneness of soul of all living beings which is so alike, its sublimation through gradual self discipline and renunciation, and the final salvation from the bondage of karma and the cycle of birth.

According to William Walsh (1979), “The religious sense of Indian myth is a part of Narayan’s grip of reality of his particular view of human life and his individual way of placing and ordering human feeling and experience. What one can say about Narayan without qualification is that he embodies the pure spirit of Hinduism.”

**Characters within Tradition and Religious Belief**

Narayan’s novels are essentially stories of Indian life whose basis is religion and tradition based on their caste and community. Most of Narayan’s novels trace the growth of an individual who is firmly rooted in the Indian social order that is in turn based on their religion. The protagonists - Swaminathan, Chandran, Krishnan, Ramani, Raju, Sampath, Margaya, Jagan, Sriram and Raman are literally the members of a Hindu joint family. The individual of his novels like any other Indian has to grow in this environment and his character is shaped at times under the influence of his caste and religion, from the selection of his career and the selection of his life partner. The family itself observes the age-old customs, tradition and beliefs of the Hindu religion.

**Narayan and Varnasharama**

Narayan in his novels present the Hindu view of Varnasharama, that is, the imperatives of Hindu society. *Varna and Ashrama* which regulate the lives of every Hindu, whether modern or traditional in India, does the same with the lives of all individuals in R.K Narayan’s novels. Narayan’s characters, like a fair majority of Indians, implicitly accept the manners, mores and professions of their castes. The issues of inter-caste marriages are raised in some of the novels of Narayan to portray the picture of the Indian audience who frown on inter-caste marriages and outcaste the person from their caste. They can find no place in the fixed pattern of the Hindu society where matching of caste, religion and horoscope is the most important feature of Hindu
marriage. This adherence to caste, religion and horoscope is quite evident in Narayan’s novels. Krishnan loves the English teacher, but he marries Shushila, a girl of his caste, in spite of the mismatch of their horoscopes.

Another matter of morality is evident from Narayan’s most read and popular novel, The Guide, where Raju’s mother objects to his affair with Rosie partly because she is a married woman, but largely because she is a devdasi, a dancing girl, whose caste is not known. Again, in his novel The Vendor of Sweets, Jagan the hero is shocked when his son Mali imports an American girl Grace and intends to marry her (Narayan, 1967). He does not accept her as his daughter in law and does not have peace until he succeeds in booking the girl’s passage back to America. The issue of caste can be evident from the lines of Jagan:

“Assured by this protestation, Jagan said, ‘What shall I do now?’
‘About what?’
‘About Mali and that girl.’

The cousin gave a clear-headed statement, ‘Get through their marriage very quickly in the hill temple. It can be arranged within a few hours.’
‘Alas! I don’t know what her caste is, so how can I’.

In addition, Jagan also mentions that Gandhi fought against the caste system in India, when his daughter-in-law innocently asks what is the present status of caste-system in India?

The next event is from Narayan’s novel from The Painter of Signs when Raman, the hero announces his decision to marry Daisy, a Christian girl. His aunt shows a lot of agitation towards this marriage and threatens to leave home for ever (Narayan, 1976). Raman in The Painter of Signs has to contend with this issue of caste due to the traditional force his aunt is embroiled in. The very first question she puts to him when he announces his decision to marry Daisy is, ‘That girl! What is her caste? Who is she?.... Isn’t she a Christian or something…a name which
is...How can you bring in a Christian?’ Before she asks all these questions, she shows her consternation and drops the vessel, as if she has lost her hold on things.

Raman’s announcement to a marry a girl of another community and religion touch something primordial, exposing the racial prejudices dormant in his aunt, who has slaved all her life to bring him up as her son. This decision of Raman ends in her aunt’s decision to ‘leave home for Kasi’. The above events and dialogues expose the issues of caste and creed that take precedence in the novels of Narayan time and again.

**Religion and Portrayal of Women Characters**

The influence of religion on Hindu life is also evident from the portrayal of women characters in Narayan’s novel, Savitri of *The Dark Room* (Narayan, 1938) and Shushila of *The English Teacher* (Narayan, 2000). He created the characters to show the pathos and superficial pride of Hindu wives in accordance with the accepted Hindu concept of a married woman immersed in the daily rituals of their caste and religion. Other features like the decoration of the threshold of homes with a festoons of green mango leaves, and the floors and doorways with white rice flour drawings of many designs; then there are the traditional reception of welcoming the daughter-in-law with ‘arathi’ – bringing a huge plate or tray full of oil with a piece of camphor burning in the center and moving the plate up and around in front of the girl - before she enters her new home, and such rituals are some of the influences of cultural and religious, as well as caste traditions in the novels of R.K Narayan.

**Issue of Communalism**

Narayan took up the theme of communal harmony for the first time in his novel “A Tiger for Malgudi” and refers to a scene of communal riot: “At another place we went into a rioting mob – groups of people were engaged in a bloody strife, attacking each other with stone, knife and iron rod and screaming murderous challenges. In their frenzy they had not noticed us, but when they did they dispersed swiftly” (Narayan, 1983).
Narayan then proceeded to enumerate and enunciate some of the well known causes of communal conflicts: “If you are ready to hate and want to destroy each other, you may find a hundred reasons – a diversion of canal water in your field, tow urchins of opposite camps slapping each other, rumours of molestation of some women, even the right to worship in a temple, anything may spark off a fight if you are inclined to nurture hatred - only the foolish waste their lives in fights ……”

It is easy to conclude from these views of Narayan that communal tensions are rooted in intolerance and hatred, which are the outcome of caste and religious prejudices. All the religions preach love; however at the same time they practice hate. The novelist seems to establish this fact by projecting the other side of the coin. He questions as to how else we could explain communal conflict in the name of religion, Christians crusading in the past against Muslims, Muslims waging jihad against non-believers, Hindus engaging themselves in Dharmyudh against mlechhas and caste wars between castes? Our society has provided us ample evidence that no matter how much love religions teach, in actual practice they spread hatred. He argues that when you place a religious procession of one community passing by the place of worship of another, this is often an occasion for mischief and a starting point of communal conflict, rooted in self-interest, it is maliciously intended to exploit religions for political purposes.

Narayan’s characters are not freed from the feeling of communalism. The glimpses of these feelings are evident in Swami and Friends, when the Christian teacher Mr. Ebenezar scolds his Hindu students:

“Oh, wretched idiots”, the teacher said, clenching his fists” (Narayan, 2000).

“Why do you worship dirty lifeless wooden idols and stone images? Can they talk? No. Can they see? No. can they bless you? No. Can they take you to heaven? No. Why? Because, they have no life. What did your Gods do when Mohammed of Gazni smashed them to pieces, trod upon them, and constructed out of them steps for his lavatory.

“If those idols and images had life, why did they not parry Mohammed onslaught?” He then turned to compare Jesus with Lord Krishna, “Next moment his face became purple with
rage as he thought of Sri Krishna: ‘Did our Jesus go about stealing butter like that arch scoundrel Krishna? Did our Jesus go gadding about with dancing girls like your Krishna? Did our Jesus practice dark tricks on those around him?’

Swami is also not freed from communal feelings against Christianity.

Swaminathan’s blood boiled. He got up and asked, “If he did not, why was he crucified? Swaminathan put to him another question, “If he was a God, why did he eat flesh and fish and drink wine? As a Brahmin boy it was inconceivable to him that a God should be a non-vegetarian. In answer to this, Ebenezar left his seat, advanced slowly towards Swaminathan and tried to wrench his left ear off.”

He could have spoken kindly, and given the answers very gently, but he decided to shout insults and pull the boy’s ears, which was not the way of showing any love or kindness, like he was supposed to do, if he had really followed the teachings of Jesus.

In Waiting for the Mahatma, Bharati tells Sriram, “Don’t ask whether they are Muslim children or Hindu children or who they are. It is no use asking that; we don’t know. We have given them only the names of flowers and birds. Bapuji [Gandhi] said once that even a number would be better than a name, if a name meant branding a man as belonging to this religion or that. . . . These children must grow up only as human beings.” Passages such as these clearly distinguish Narayan’s Gandhian community from contemporary far-right communalism, which equates a Hindu-only localism with Indian national identity (Narayan, 1955).

According to Pousse (1990) Gandhian ideology militates against ascribed “categorical identities,” which set up invidious “in-group/out-group” divisions, and instead stresses interactive “practical identities,” which are based upon “the entire complex of habits, expectations, abilities, routines that integrate one’s daily activities with those of a community.”
By the end of the novel, *Waiting for the Mahatma*, Sriram and Bharati have created just such practical identities for themselves and, by extension, their children; as he observed, “the life [they] embark on so happily is Gandhi’s proper memorial, for this achievement was to instill in his followers a sense of social responsibility”.

**Conclusion**

Narayan in his novels has limited his characters to the cultural limitations of the India of that time and those male characters were often very weak and they could not break the barriers of the strong cultural effects. The culture was mainly the strict following of the caste system, creed and religion and any change or new traditions were strongly opposed. Narayan, in his novels, upholds the Hindu traditions and does not support mixed marriages, meaning inter-caste and inter-religion marriages. Narayan raised the issue of caste in Indian culture and tried to show the disparity of caste and differences of religion which still bring impediments to legitimate and valid marriages among the Hindus in India. Disparity of caste and creed are an insurmountable obstacle in a Hindu marriage in India, in Narayan's novels. The two most important time-honoured categorical imperatives of Hindu Society are Varna and Ashrama.

Apart from caste, there was a strong feeling of patriotism in the hearts of Indians and they were revolting against the British domination and power. Narayan beautifully depicts the characters as having a strong love of their country, despite the fact the characters are not very strong as individuals. Narayan also evaluated and exposed the issues of communalism in his various novels.

References


==================================================================

**Shakeba Jabeen Siddiqui, Ph.D. (Linguistics)**

Department of English  
M.P. Garg Degree College  
Allahabad-211011  
Uttar Pradesh  
India  
shakeba.siddiqui@gmail.com
Abstract

This paper is devoted to analyse the selected poems by Marathi Dalit poets who incorporate frustration, depression, irritation, etc., in their poems as the emerging themes. The paper identifies how in post-Ambedkarian era, Dalits have tried to assert their identity in various quarters of life: politics, religion, education and economics.

Key words: Manusmriti, Dalit literature, Ambedkar, Self-identity, religious structure

Meaning of Self within Hindu Tradition
To begin with, it is important first to understand the meaning of the Self which varies from culture to culture and circumstances to circumstances. The Vedic tradition, which is dominant even today, takes Self as holy, free from all the bondages, caste, creed, race and gender. It is unaffected by any natural and physical obstacle, it is immortal, and mover of body. If it comes out from the gross body, all five elements which constitute the body, amalgamate it in nature and the soul acquires a new garb. To quote from the Bhagvad Gita:

\[
\begin{align*}
\text{vasansi jirnani yatha vihaya} \\
\text{navani grihnati naro parani} \\
\text{tatha sarirani vihaya jiranny} \\
\text{anyani samayati navani dehi}
\end{align*}
\]

Just as a person casts off worn-out garments and puts on others that are new, even so does the embodied soul cast off worn-out bodies and take on others that are new. (Krishnan 108)

Denying Dalits to Possess Self

Contrary to this, Dalits since ages were deprived of Self. Religion was alien for them and so were its benediction. They were haunted by fear of pollution and abomination. When one peeps in the pre-Ambedkarian India, the condition of Dalits was miserable. The Manuvadi philosophy of culture and society didn’t allow them to stand on the platform of human beings. Divested of humanity and there by Self (I, MY, ME, WE, OUR, US) Dalits, galvanised by Ambedkar’s ideology and bolstered by self-confidence, tiedy to make their presence felt in all quarters of life. In this way they not only subverted their chattel like status but also established rather stalwartly their presence with dignity as is revealed in the following analysis.

Dalit Literature

Dalit literature which presents and discusses the agonies and sufferings of the ages was not considered in the main stream of Indian literature. But with the passage of time, Dalit Literature has grown up with its bones and muscle getting stronger in Marathi and many other Indian languages.
In the second half of twentieth century where the male Dalit writers in Marathi like Namdeo Dhasal, Arjun Dangle, Arun Kamble, Prahalad Chendwanka, Waman Kardak, Yashwant Manohar, Tryambak Sapkale, J.V. Pawar, Omprakash Valmiki including many others cultivated the field of Dalit literature with their bitter experiences.

The female Dalit writers like Hira Bensode, Min Gajbhiye, Anuradha Gaurav, Jyoti Lenjwar, Mina Londe, Baby Kamble, Urmila Pawar and others have contributed equally, and their writings have acquired a comprehensive place in university curriculum. In this connection Eleanor Zelliot remarks: “A new school of Marathi literature, Dalit Sahitya, arose over two decades ago to express the thoughts and record the lives of ex-Untouchables. The voices of women have recently joined the dozens of male voices that have added a new dimension to the literature of western India” (Feldhaus 65). It has stamina to stand in parallel with literature of other marginalised communities such as Afro-Americans and Native Americans.

Dr. Ambedkar, Dalit Conversion and Dalit Literature

During the post-Independent era, Dalit literature got impetus under the towering figure: Dr. Bhim Rao Ambedkar who is acknowledged as MAHA MANAV, MESSIAH and MODERNIST. He brought a renaissance in the thought of modern generation in general and of dalits in particular. Dalit conversion into Buddhist opened a new gateway to get emancipation from traditional legacy, which they had been bearing for centuries. According to Sharankumar Limbale, “the first mass conversion of Dalits took place on 14 October 1956, and the first literary conference of Dalit writers was held on 2 March 1958. Significantly, it was called a conference of Dalits rather than Buddhist literature” (Limbale 41).

This conversion was a milestone for Dalits in their long and arduous journey of acquiring a new Self. This Self had no fear of polluting anyone. In other words, rejection of Hinduism at large and acceptance of Buddhism in particular was a bold declaration of their newly acquired Self like status. In 1949 Dalit writers established an organisation, Dalit Sevak Sahitya Sangh, on the insistence of Appasaheb Ranapise. In 1950, its name was changed to Dalit Sahitya Sangh on the insistence of Appasaheb Ranapise. In 1950, its name was changed to Dalit Sahitya Sangh and ultimately on 11 March 1960 it was altered to Maharashtra Buuddha Sahitya Parishad. Discussion of Dalit literature began during the period from 2 March 1958
to 11 March 1960. In this way Dalits, defied the barriers imposed on them and asserted their identity in the field of education and literature.

**Literature as Tool to Fight Against Caste Atrocities**

Literature became one of the major weapons to fight against atrocities inflicted by upper caste. Dalit writers took literature as Omprakash Valmiki defined it:

> Literature is that discourse which stands on the side human being who is oppressed, who is in great peril, who wants to live. Literature should infuse him with the urge to live. Literature should shake him up, teach him to do battle, not weaken him, not make him submit to hegemony, not enslave him. We need to free ourselves from the social order surrounding us. For me, good literature that which wakens us towards that freedom.” (Valmiki 137-138)

Literature did for Dalits, what it did for Indian freedom struggle. Their struggle is to get the answers for surging questions in their heart and mind. Their effort is to get self-identification on the human platform. They too, want to take fresh air in the azure sky where there is no smell of discrimination, marginalization and exploitation.

**A Study of the Selected Poems of Select Dalit Poets**

Here, in this paper the focus is concentrated on the selected poems of Namdeo Dhassal, Arun Kamble and J.V. Pawar, who struggled to establish their identity in the cultured and literate society via poetry. In this context, Mulk Raj Anand states, “The process of poetry arising out of the cry can be felt in most dalit poems, because in these utterances protest seems to come from the insulted and the injured, who have laboured for generation for supers, their hands with dirty work” (Anand xi). Their sufferings and pains are fore-grounded in the tropes, similes and metaphors used in the poems.

**Namdeo Dhassal**
Namdeo Dhasal (1949-2014), founder of Dalit Panther was one of the major poets who struggled for emancipation from the social taboos. He associated his poetry with politics. For him, “poetry is politics,” he told the photographer Henning Stegmuller, “I enjoyed discovering myself. I am happy when I am writing a poem, and I am happy when I am leading a protest of prostitutes fighting for their rights” (Dhasal n.p.). In the poem, “Leaving the House,” the poet wants to find out reasons behind the multiplication of their “hunger death”, “slum”, “Beggars”, “men without work” etc. Here, as a social leader, he tries to find the solution of the problems, because these phrases have become transferred epithets for the inherited identification. His heart aches to behold the fast increasing worse condition of untouchables. He wants a new platform to give them shelter, free from inhuman society. This poem enshrines the queries:

Tell me I’m yours. Say I’m yours.

Why don’t you say something? Why don’t you say something?

Look, We have brought new brand slate with us.

Give me an answer: answer me; give, I say.

Prostitute multiply:

Question mark question mark Question mark

Hunger death multiply:
Beggars multiply:

Men without work multiply:

Why do question multiply, multiply: question:

Why wasteland: Why more wasteland? (Anand 50-51)

The assertion of the phrase “Question mark” refers to the poet’s anxieties to come out from the web of the multiplication of perplexities and to stand with his own people. Dalits have been facing these problems for centuries, but now they have lost the patience, so the poet says:

you will be given only three minutes

speak

speak speak

speak speak speak. (Anand 51)

Repetition of the word “speak” refers to zero degree tolerance power. His irritation has been converted into the aggressive and abusive language:

O.K.

We’re turning our backs on you right now.

Right now we’re becoming assassins

taking off even the doors as we leave,

running war- tanks over you

Spit on you; I Sit on you: Spit! Spit! Sky Us. Sky. Us.(Anand 51)
As the above analysis reveals, Dhassal, via his poetry, has acquired a unique self which is ready to fight. Indeed, it is a marked improvement on the state of passivity in which dalits were enchained for centuries.

**Sunflower**

In another poem, “NOW, NOW,” the poet, addressing their messiah, Babasaheb Ambedkar, expresses his utmost desire to migrate from ignorance to enlightenment, where they can visualise themselves. The centuries-long burdens would be removed there. They are thankful to destiny that they have been “blessed with a sunflower-giving fakir.” He was the first who was intellectually and politically strong who empowered dalit society. This is the reason, he is adored even today. To quote his own words:

> Turning their backs to the sun, they journeyed through centuries:
>
> Now, now, we must refuse to be pilgrims of darkness.
>
> That one, our father, is bent for carrying,
>
> carrying and darkness. Now, now we must lift that burden from his back.
>
> Our blood was spilled for his glorious city
>
> And what we got to eat was right to eat stones.
>
> Now, now, we must explode that building which kisses the Sky!
>
> After a thousand years we were blessed with a Sunflower-giving fakir;
>
> Now, now, we must, like sunflowers, turn our faces to the sun. (Anand 53)

The metaphor of sunflower reminds the readers of the image of a sunflower and its seeds. As seeds are buried in the soil and with the proper nourishment they come out and blossom in sun light, so did Dalits. Under the shade or shadow of Babasaheb, Dalits found...
condusive environment to nurture their Self. Now, they are tiered of bearing the burden of untouchability hence there new Self urges them to move forward and help each other in gaining fulfilment.

**Mother’s Role**

“SO THAT MY MOTHER MAY BE CONVINCED.....,” is one of the most power poems of Dhassal, states the same newly acquired self which is bent upon revolting. Here, the poet is searching his own identity as well as of mother’s who has been buried under the tradition. Generally, a woman has to play three roles in her life: a daughter, a wife and a mother. Woman is considered as synonym of sacrifice. In all the three forms, she performs prescribed duties. As a wife and mother, her responsibilities multiply. Her prime time is devoted to the service of a family. The expectations led out for a woman in her family are in abundance. In the words of the poet, “without speaking, you look like heirloom mental of Chaste wife” (Anand 60). She puts a lot of patches on heart. She is exhausted due to unbearable burdens of the gender and caste. He is reminded of the bygone days when his mother used to feed him and her own stomach would ache. Addressing his mother, he asserts:

In your prime, you became weak, naive, a tethered cow.

Mother, You never understood:

This land does not value the woman, the sudras, the worker, the landless.

(Anand 60)

Here, Dhassal rises beyond his caste and recognizes other oppressed communities as women, poor people and workers. The acknowledgement of these victimised communities also imparts a unique Self along with sudras. By recording the sacrifices of his mother, Dhassal secures a human like self for her as well.

**Arun Kamble**
Arun Kamble (1953-2009) was one of the founding members of Dalit Panther movement. He struggled to acquire dalit identity on national political level, and he gained success. He served as a secretary of Janta Dal, a member of the National Election Committee and in charge of Bihar State in the reign of then prime-minister Vishwnath Pratap Singh. He, as the president of Dalit Panther, led the Namantar Andolan very successfully which was a sixteen years long dalit campaign to rename Marathwada University as B.R. Ambedkar University. His objective was to make dalits aware of their rights. Along with his social and political efforts, he endeavoured to get justice for his community by the virtue of his pen. Soaked in the sweat and blood of segregated dalits, his pen inscribed their agonies on the paper in the form of poetry and prose.

Kamble’s Speech

“Speech” can be taken as a starting point for discussion. It encapsulates the poet’s controversial ideas regarding the speech that arises in his mind. He finds himself between what tradition has taught and what is required today. On the one side, the tongue is twisted to the past and on the other side it is difficult to embrace new one:

Bone chewing grampus

at burning ghat
permanent resident

of my heart

with weight of tradition

behind his back

yells, “Sadding bastard, I
tell you

stutter with our tongue!” (Anand 85)

Further, the Brahman teacher argues for the adoption of sugar-coated tongue from the Vadas in very abusive manner. To quote:

Picking through the Vadas

buttering his queue

Brahman teacher at school

bellows, “Speak my pure tongue,

whoreson!” (Anand 85)

Arguing for the “Privilege” of Human Rights

This was the fact that Dalits were not allowed to go to school. Somehow, when they were encouraged to go to school under the influence of Dr. B.R. Ambedkar, they were physically and psychologically humiliated and tortured as we find in case of Baby Kamble pre-independent and Omprakash Valmiki post-independent India. Their main motive was to make them aware of their human rights. The poem reveals the anxiety and agony. The poetic persona is not without an interactive self. Under the influence of his ancestors, he speaks his traditional dialect whereas his Brahman school teacher forces him to use the so-called “pure” tongue of the upper castes. The Self that would have accepted his lot quietly a few decades
earlier, questions the suggestion now. He asks which tongue he is supposed to speak in. In this way, the poetic persona gains the identity of a speaking Self.

**Contradictory Living Styles of Castes**

In the another poem, “The Life We Live,” Kamble explores the contradictory living style of dalits and *savarnas*. The speaking self that questioned the authorities in the previous poem appears here too. By the way of contrasting the life style of upper castes with that of his own, this speaking self makes his presence felt.

This self-created umbrella of Hindu philosophy is creating a huge gap in our society. There is a Dalit caste in our society which remained alive on the leftover of food and rotten animals. They (Brahmans) enjoyed delicious dishes in the name of Brahma. A Dalit’s dead body was “shoved under half-turned sand”; they were kicked, abused and spitted upon. Just opposite to it, there were *savarnas* who were considered as descendants of sages. They enjoyed the natural resources, golden cup and ultimately their dead bodies were burnt with sandalwood. Kamble exclaims whether this world would develop faster if savarnas were forced to live the life of dalits. The new speaking Self is bold to challenge the authority. This discrepancy on the basis of caste compels an intellectual to think and re-think. To quote Kamble’s own words:

> If you were to live the life we live  
> Then out of you poems arise.  
> We: kicked and spat at our piece of bread.  
> We: down gutter degraders of our heritage.  
> You: its sole repository, descendant of sage  
> We: never have a paisa to scratch our arse  
> You: the golden cup of offering in your bank.  
> Your bodies burn with flames in sandalwood

Santosh Bahadur Singh, Ph.D. and Shubhanku Kochar, M.Phil., Ph.D. Scholar  
Assertion of Self: A Reading of Selected Marathi Dalit Poets  188
Ours are shoved under half-turned sand.

Wouldn’t the world change, and fast

If you were forced to live at last

This life that’s all we’ve always had? (Anand 86)

**J.V. Pawar’s Tide**

“I Have Become the Tide” by J.V. Pawar presents a powerful voice for liberation from the atrocities of ages. In this poem, the surging mental and physical agonies of unprivileged class assume a volcanic eruption. Metaphorically, the poet compares his great agonies with the sea and the sea shore. The sorrow of have-nots soaks all the harmony of their life as the sand soaks the water of the sea. Their agony is as vast as the sea, though the sea has its shore, but their sorrow doesn’t have. He wants to find out the limitation of suffering. He relates with the proverb ‘oil from the sand’ and concludes that if sand is squeezed hard, oil can be received. It means, impossible can be possible but, the end of sorrow in the context of Dalits is impossible. He wants to be a powerful tide which can swipe away all the dust from the reality. Here the narrator identifies with tide and discovers a new Self which is more substantial!

As the sand soaks up the water of the shore,

So my great sorrow.

How long will it be like the sand?

How long will it cry out from its obstinate will to exist?

As a matter of fact, it should have been in tide like the sea out there.

Much would have been gained by rolling over the drawfs around here.

Even the sea has ashore; why doesn’t my sorrow have limits? Why didn’t those who squeezed oil from the sand have inkling the sorrow? (Anand 141)
**Manusmriti**

Further, he goes back to the event of 1928 which was the first satyagrah of Ambedkar movement in Mahad in which people were to drink from public reservoir. It ended in violence and later a conference was called and the portion of Manusmriti which justified untouchability, was burned. That was the strong wave to get justice. The poet says:

> The wind that blows everyday

> that day yelled in my ear-

> “women stripped”

> “village boycott”

> “men killed”

As it spoke, it gave me a mantra: “Make another Mahad!”

> My hands now move toward the weapon on the wall. (Anand 141)

His voice becomes stronger in the last stanza of the poem when he compares himself to the sea and decides to build tombs from where he will command everything. It will be the limitation of the suffering of his community. In the words of the poet:

> I am now the sea; I soar, I surge.

> I move out build your tombs,

> The wind, storms, sky, earth

> Now are all mine.

> In every inch of the rising struggle

> I stand erect. (Anand 142)
The poet’s identification with nature is complete. A new Self which is free and pure emerges out in the end. This new self is not only free from agonies but also has the capacity to liberate others. This poem highlights the determination of unprivileged class to wipe out the atrocities against them, and makes proper platform to stand up. Now, their buried self has been converted into strong tides via words and will give them new identity till eternity.

To sum up, it is argued that Dalit poetry is a serious attempt to salvage the dead self to a living one with the help of images and rhythm. Dalit poets have indeed succeeded in asserting their identity in various ways. That Namdeo Dhassal has his own way which is different from that of Arun Kamble and J.V. Pawar as is revealed in the above analysis. An attempt to achieve absolute liberty on political, social, economic, educational and literary levels brought Dalit intellectuals under the umbrella of Mahamanav Babasaheb Ambedkar and its result is fruitful. Their emotions enshrined in the poems have acquired a remarkable place in the main stream of Indian literature.

=================================================================

Works Cited


Santosh Bahadur Singh, Ph.D. and Shubhanku Kochar, M.Phil., Ph.D. Scholar

Assertion of Self: A Reading of Selected Marathi Dalit Poets 191


S.B. Singh, Ph.D.  
Assistant Professor  
Lady Irwin College  
Delhi University  
New Delhi 110001  
India  
sbsingh9@gmail.com

Shubhanku Kochar, M.Phil., Ph.D. Scholar  
Assistant Professor  
Lady Irwin College  
Delhi University  
New Delhi 110001  
India  
shubhankukochar@gmail.com
Further Biblical Allusions to John the Baptist in Shakespeare’s *Hamlet*

Song Cho, M.A.

In *Antony and Cleopatra*, Alexas says: “Good majesty, / Herod of Jewry dare not look upon you / But when you are well pleased.” To which Cleopatra responds: “That Herod’s head / I’ll have” (3.3.2-5). According to Naseeb Shaheen, the name “Herod” in this passage appears to make reference to Herod the Tetrarch (193), the ruler of Galilee responsible for the death of John the Baptist. The Gospel of Matthew, chapter 14, recounts the beheading of the itinerant preacher. Herod had John arrested after he criticized Herod’s marriage to Herodias, his brother’s wife. Shaheen quotes Matt. 14.6,8: “The daughter of Herodias daunced before them, and pleased Herode. And she . . . said, Giue me here Iohn Baptists head in a platter” (647).

In a previous article titled *Echoes of John the Baptist in William Shakespeare’s Hamlet*, I made mention of the marginal note of Matthew 14: 1 as recorded in the 1599 Geneva Bible. A closer look at the biblical text may suggest that Shakespeare may have been aware of another marginal note found in the 1560 Geneva Bible. The note of Matthew 14: 4 reads: “As well because nature abhors such horrible incest, as also that he had taken her by force from his brother” (spellings have been modernized, my emphasis). Before proceeding, it should be kept in mind that “Shakespeare’s references are often closer to the Geneva Bible than to any other version. It was the most popular version of the day, and it is only natural to assume that he owned a copy” (Shaheen 39).
In *Hamlet*, King Claudius marries his brother’s wife. The ghost of Hamlet’s father says to his son: “O horrible, O horrible, most horrible! / If thou hast nature in thee, bear it not. / Let not the royal bed of Denmark be / A couch for luxury and damnèd incest” (1.5.80-83, my emphasis). In *Cymbeline*, Caius Lucius finds a headless body and cries: “Soft, ho, what trunk is here / Without his top? The ruin speaks that sometime / It was a worthy building. How, a page? / Or dead or sleeping on him? But dead rather, / For nature doth abhor to make his bed / With the defunct, or sleep upon the dead. / Let’s see the boy’ face” (4.2.355-361, my emphasis). Hence, it appears that these passages may have borrowed biblical material from the aforementioned marginal note.

=================================================================

**Works Cited**


=================================================================

Song Cho, M.A.
Assistant Professor of Spanish
Oklahoma Baptist University
Shawnee, OK 74804
USA
song.cho@okbu.edu
Acquisition of Case Markers in Typically Developing Malayalam Speaking Children

Sreelakshmi R., Final year MASLP Student
Nandhu S Mohan., Final year MASLP Student
Satish Kumaraswamy, Asst.Professor & Ph.D. Scholar

Abstract

This study aims to establish a descriptive data on acquisition of case markers in typically developing 3-8 years old Malayalam speaking children. Fifty normal school going children were grouped according to age basis and were provided with the picture description task. Picture stimuli of each case marker were used for sample collection. Responses were marked on work sheet separately and each session was recorded for further detailed analysis. Result indicated that the children in older group performed well compared to younger group in all case markers. In the current study it is found that as the age increased, the ability to use correct case marker has improved.

Key words: Typically developing children, case markers, Malayalam

Introduction

The part of morphology that covers the relationship between syntax and morphology is called morpho-syntax, and it concerns itself with inflection and paradigms, but not with word-formation or compounding. Morpho-syntax encompasses linguistic strategies and operations to represent syntactic features via morphological marking as opposed to merely combinatorial or syntactic strategies. Morpho-syntactic operations are the relation between one linguistic form and another that correlates with a conventionalized meaning distinction. The morpho-syntactical aspects include plural markers, case markers, PNG markers etc. Case markers as a system of marking dependent nouns for the type of relationship they bear to their heads. Case is a grammatical category whose value reflects the grammatical function performed by a noun or
pronoun. The major types of case markers are nominative, accusative, genitive, dative, instrumental, locative and sociative.

Morpho-syntactical studies in the Indian context would aid in assessment and help in establishing the baseline to set goals for morphological intervention in disabled children. The lack of acquisition data has hinged in the development of any standardized tests in Malayalam. There is a need of more normative data of acquisition grammatical in Malayalam language. The present study attempts to understand the case markers in Malayalam speaking typically developing children.

http://www.personal.uni-jena.de/~x4diho/Morphosyntax.Introduction.pdf

Review of Literature

Human system of communication that uses arbitrary signals such as vocal sound, gestures, signs or written symbols is succinctly defines as language. But Language is far too complicated intriguing, and mysterious to be adequately explained by a brief definition. Contemporary views of human language hold that language is a rule based behavior which evolves within specific historical, social, and cultural context and is described by at least five parameters - phonologic, morphologic, syntactic, semantic, and pragmatic. Language learning and use are determined by the interaction of biological, cognitive, psychosocial, and environmental factors.

The acquisition of language is still a controversial research issue which is struggling between biologically, genetically, evolutionarily and psychologically based explanations.

Brown (2009) reported that early word utterances are telegraphic because the utterances contain only the content word such as nouns, verbs and adjectives but miss out inflections and grammatical functional words. The emergence of morpho-syntactical aspects makes the utterances more meaningful and better grammatically organized. The acquisition of morpho-syntactic aspects of language is a controversial issue which is still the area of research interest. Morphology is the aspect of language concerned with the rule governing change in word
meaning. The morpho-syntax is the system of the internal structure of words (morphology) and the way in which words are put together to form phrases and sentences. The morpho-syntactical aspects include plural markers, case markers, PNG markers etc.

The languages of India belong to different language families like Dravidian, Indo-Aryan, Tibeto-Burman, etc. There are hundreds of languages in India. The Dravidian languages are highly agglutinative. Words are usually formed by adding suffixes to the root word serially in these languages. When compared with the research on morphological development in English speakers, there is scarcity of studies in the Dravidian languages, in normal as well as clinical populations.

Malayalam is a language of the Dravidian family and is one of the four major languages of this family with a rich literary tradition, Malayalam has a rich morphology, and identifying the morphological suffixes of Malayalam verbs and nouns is a tough task.

In Malayalam case system, various suffixes are added to noun stem to indicate different relationships between the noun and other constituents of the sentence. The various case markers are nominative, accusative, genitive, dative, instrumental, locative and sociative.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case markers</th>
<th>Significance</th>
<th>Malayalam Case markers</th>
<th>English case markers</th>
<th>Examples</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nominative</td>
<td>Denote subject</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>/kutti padunnu / The child is singing.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accusative</td>
<td>Denote object</td>
<td>അ /e/</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>/kuttiye vazhakku paranju / The child was scolded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Genitive</td>
<td>Denote possession</td>
<td>ഉണ്ണ /ude/, നെ /nte/</td>
<td>Of, belongs to</td>
<td>/ramante pena/ Rama’s pen</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Language in India  www.languageinindia.com  ISSN 1930-2940  15:6 June 2015
Sreelakshmi R., Final year MASLP Student, Nandhu S Mohan., Final year MASLP Student and Satish Kumaraswamy, Asst.Professor & Ph.D. Scholar
Acquisition of Case Markers in Typically Developing Malayalam Speaking Children 197
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case Type</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Malayalam</th>
<th>Significance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dative</td>
<td>Indicate purpose</td>
<td>്/ke/ ന/ne/</td>
<td>To, for&lt;br&gt;Elephant likes sugarcane</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Instrumental</td>
<td>Denote agent</td>
<td>്/aal/</td>
<td>With, by&lt;br&gt;Ravana was killed by Rama.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Locative 1</td>
<td>Denote place or situation</td>
<td>്/il/</td>
<td>In&lt;br&gt;The bird is sitting on the tree.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Locative 2</td>
<td>Denote place or situation</td>
<td>്/kal/</td>
<td>In&lt;br&gt;Lamp is on the doorstep.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sociative</td>
<td>Denote social action</td>
<td>്/od/</td>
<td>-&lt;br&gt;The child asked mother for water.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1: showing various case markers in Malayalam and their significance


Jia and Fuse (2007) investigated the acquisition of grammatical morphemes in Mandarin speaking children and concluded that acquisition of grammatical morphemes by school aged immigrants takes several years to complete.

Roberts & Anderson (2007) agreed with these findings as they noted delays in transitioning from one to two words in speech. Furthermore, this type of delay progresses into multi-word speech evidenced by a decreased Mean Length of Utterance (MLU).
The research in language acquisition is the basis for the development of any assessment material. In India various attempts were made by the pioneers of our field to study language acquisition. Subbarao (1995) described the language of typically developing Kannada speaking children and concluded that genitive case, dative case and locative case usages were more compared to the use of instrumental, accusative or sociative cases.

Vijayalakshmi (1981) studied children in the age range of 1-5 years using the test of acquisition of syntax in Kannada (STASK). Results showed that the children used time, gender, number, case and person markers as well as prepositions, determiners, adverbs and adjectives. There was an increase in frequency as age advanced. The simple present and future habitual terms for both masculine and feminine forms were noticed in the age range of 3-4 years in the subjects using Kannada language.

Rukmini (1994) developed a Malayalam language test for children in the age range of 4-7 years. The test has 2 parts, semantics and syntax. Each part has 11 subsections with 5 items each for expression and reception except semantic discrimination (only reception) and lexical category (only expression). The test was administered to ninety Malayalam speaking children in the age range of 4-7 years. The results indicated that the scores increased with increasing age. Children performed better in the reception task on the expression task. Also they performed better on syntactic and semantic tasks.

Rupela & Manjula (2007) studied the development of morphological categories of Kannada in children between 6 to 8 years age and reported that they used genders, plurals and tenses correctly.

Shastry (2010) studied acquisition of tense markers in Kundapura Kannada-speaking typically developing children. From her study on 30 children she reported that frequency of occurrence of present tense markers were more when compared to other tense markers. There
were dialectal variations which were frequently observed in present tense forms. She concluded that frequency of occurrence of present tense markers were more when compared to other tenses.

Pokharel (2012) reported a study on acquisition of case markers in typically-developing Nepali children using narration task as well as picture description task and the results showed that there was a gradual increment in the development of all case marker types with the age.

Need of the Study
As observed from the literature review, Indian studies of acquisition of language, syntactic aspects in general and morphological structures in particular, are not frequent. Morphosyntactical studies in the Indian context would aid in assessment and help in establishing the baseline to set goals for morphological intervention in disabled children. The lack of acquisition data has hinged in the development of any standardized tests in Malayalam. There is a need of more normative data of acquisition of grammatical elements in Malayalam language. The present study attempts to understand the case markers in Malayalam speaking typically developing children.

Aim of the Study
The aim of the present study is to report on the acquisition of case markers in typically developing Malayalam speaking children in the age range of 3-8 years.

Subjects
50 typically developing Malayalam speaking children in the age group of 3 to 8 years were further divided into 3-4 years, 4-5 years, 5-6 years, 6-7 years and 7-8 years with 10 members in each groups participating in the present study. Equal number of males and females were assigned in each group.

Inclusion Criteria
• Age range 3-8 years according to school register
• Attending Malayalam medium school

Language in India www.languageinindia.com ISSN 1930-2940 15:6 June 2015
Sreelakshmi R., Final year MASLP Student, Nandhu S Mohan., Final year MASLP Student and Satish Kumaraswamy, Asst.Professor & Ph.D. Scholar
Acquisition of Case Markers in Typically Developing Malayalam Speaking Children 200
Malayalam as first language

**Exclusion Criteria**
- No speech and language problem
- No neurological problems
- No hearing abnormality
- No known disease or disorders

**Stimulus Used**
Picture description task was used. Common case markers in Malayalam were identified and appropriate picture stimuli were used for each case marker.

**Recording Environment**
The entire session was audio recorded using microphone attached to Micromax A117 smart phone. The recording environment was a quiet room in the school building.

**Data Collection**
The data was collected from each individual by presenting picture stimuli via PowerPoint presentation in Dell Inspiron N5040 laptop and subjects were instructed to describe the picture using sentences. Responses with appropriate case markers were considered as correct response. Inappropriate case markers as well as omission of case markers were considered as incorrect response.

**Analysis**
The study envisioned obtaining an audiotaped conversational sample from normal speaking children. The audiotaped samples were analyzed at the syntactic level primarily focusing on case markers. The presence of unit of analysis was noted and marked as ‘1’ and absence or usage of inappropriate case marker was noted and marked as ‘0’. The total number of each case marker was tabulated.
Results and Discussion

**Fig 1: Acquisition of case markers (in percentage) in typically developing Malayalam speaking children of age range 3-8 years**

The youngest population in the sample was 3-4 years. Nominative, accusative and Locative 1 were well developed (100%, 90% and 70% respectively). Other case markers were less than 45%. Locative 2 was not present in this population.

Most children in age group of 4-5 years have acquired nominative, accusative and locative 1 case marker types (100%, 90% and 80% respectively). Dative, genitive and instrumental case marker types showed acquisition of 70% whereas the sociative showed 60% of acquisition. Locative 2 was not present among this group.

Children in age group of 5-6 years have acquired nominative accusative, dative, sociative and genitive case marker types (100%, 90%, 90%, 90% and 90% respectively). Locative 1 and instrumental case marker types showed acquisition of 80%. Locative 2 was not present among this group.

Among 6-7 years old children nominative accusative and locative 1 showed 100% acquisition and rest all other case markers except locative 2 showed 90% acquisition.
7-8 year old children were the eldest group in this study. All the case marker types except locative 2 showed 100% acquisition.

**Exceptional Cases**

It can be clearly observed from the above figures that locative 2 case markers (/kal/) are not used by any of the age groups. This odd finding can be due to the fact that this particular case marker is not commonly used even by adults in normal conversation. This case marker is mainly used in higher level language usage, for e.g. in literary works.

The present study is in accordance with Pokharel (2012), which says that there is a gradual increase in the development of all the case marker types with increase in age, i.e., older children have acquired more number of case markers than younger children in a study done on Nepali speaking typically developing children.

**Summary and Conclusion**

Malayalam is an agglutinative morphologically rich language in which identifying the morphological suffixes of Malayalam verbs and nouns is tough task. Morphology is the aspect of language concerned with the rule governing change in word meaning. The morpho-syntactical aspects include plural markers, case markers, PNG markers, etc. Blake (1981) defines case markers as a system of marking dependent nouns for the type of relationship they bear to their heads. Acquisition of morpho-syntactic structures is still the area which needs lots of research explanation.

The present study aimed at reporting the acquisition of case markers in typically developing Malayalam speaking children in the age range of 3-8 years. The results revealed that there is a general increase in the acquisition as well as frequency of usage of any type of case markers with increase in age of the children.
Nominative, locative and acquisitive case marker types are the most developed type of case markers in any age groups whereas instrumental, genitive, sociative and dative are least developed in earlier ages compared to other case marker types. As an exceptional case, Locative 2 case markers (/kal/) are not used by any of the age groups.

Hence, these case markers should be taken for intervention only when all other types of case markers have been acquired. Normative data is essential as this acts as the data for control group when determining the acquisition of morpho-syntax in clinical populations like Down syndrome, Specific language impairment, Austism spectrum disorders, etc.

Limitation of the Present Study

The small sample size taken as well as the subjects taken from the similar community, i.e. from a single dialectal population, is the limitation of the study as it affects the generalization of the study to the whole Kerala population.

Future Implications

1. To include more number of subject as well as include various dialectal communities.
2. Sampling points of data can be increased.
3. More research work needed on language use by the disordered population.

References


Language in India www.languageinindia.com ISSN 1930-2940 15:6 June 2015
Sreelakshmi R., Final year MASLP Student, Nandhu S Mohan., Final year MASLP Student and Satish Kumaraswamy, Asst.Professor & Ph.D. Scholar
Acquisition of Case Markers in Typically Developing Malayalam Speaking Children
Sreelakshmi R., Final year MASLP Student, Nandhu S Mohan., Final year MASL P Student and Satish Kumaraswamy, Asst.Professor & Ph.D. Scholar

Acquisition of Case Markers in Typically Developing Malayalam Speaking Children


Retrieved from:


==================================================================

Sreelakshmi R. Final Year MASLP
Dr. M. V. Shetty College of Speech and Hearing

Language in India www.languageinindia.com ISSN 1930-2940 15:6 June 2015
Sreelakshmi R., Final year MASLP Student, Nandhu S Mohan., Final year MASLP Student and Satish Kumaraswamy, Asst.Professor & Ph.D. Scholar
Acquisition of Case Markers in Typically Developing Malayalam Speaking Children
Sreelakshmi R., Final year MASLP Student, Nandhu S Mohan., Final year MASLP Student and Satish Kumaraswamy, Asst.Professor & Ph.D. Scholar

Mangalore 575015
Karnataka
India
lakshmilegacy.r@gmail.com

Nandhu S Mohan, Final Year MASLP
Dr. M. V. Shetty College of Speech and Hearing
Mangalore 575015
Karnataka
India
smnandhu4803@gmail.com

Mr. Satish Kumaraswamy
Assistant Professor
Dr. M. V. Shetty College of Speech and Hearing
Mangalore 575015
Karnataka
India
sat8378@yahoo.com
Language or Life-force: What It Takes to be a Language Teacher?

Sweta Sinha, Ph.D.

Abstract

Language is one of the most important cognitive faculties that man possesses. Without language man is more dead than alive. It is an essential component in effective personality building especially in case of young language learners. The role of elementary language teachers becomes very important due to this. The teachers need to free themselves with any type of prejudice and need to give the freedom of expression in whatever language the child chooses as the first step towards language education. The emphasis should be to inculcate the spirit of confidence and proficiency in the first language/ mother tongue. Once this is achieved then teaching a target language becomes an easy job. The paper highlights some of the steps that a language teacher can undertake in order to excel in the task of language teaching at elementary level.

Keywords: language acquisition, linguistic competence, language teaching pedagogy, E-description

1. Language: a gift

Language is an immensely magnificent gift that man has been endowed with. It is amazing that just like other biological systems working in a human body language too plays an equally vital role. Survival of human race is as much dependent on oxygen as it is on language. Yet, how many of us consciously think of its role and importance in our daily lives? How many of us truly spare some time to refine our quality of language use or for that matter do we not judge one another on the basis of what language form one uses?

It is really discriminating and derogatory to be judged for something as vital and pertinent as language. Have we ever judged anyone because someone breathes oxygen in the serene environment of a country side or someone who stifles in the suffocating atmosphere of a
metropolitan? We do not. Oxygen is our life-force and so it is beyond judgment. The present paper argues for a similar position for language. The paper argues that language is no less than oxygen that ensures healthy growth and development of the human race. Another important issue that gets voice in this paper is the role of teachers in providing a conducive and judgment free environment for young children to study and practice language of their choice and interest. Both these issues are very much related.

2. Nature of Language

Let me begin by discussing the various aspects of language that make it highly important and at the same time very latent just like oxygen. We realize its existence only when it ceases to exist. Language is as much biological as it is sociological. It is as much cognitive as is imitative. It is as much powerful as is vulnerable, each at the same time and each at the same degree of intensity. Earlier researches tried to locate the gene responsible for language in man. Such researches were an attempt to establish the biological origin of language. The discovery of gene FOXP2 revolutionized the contemporary linguistic world. The simultaneous researches in the neuro-linguistics sphere and the researches on aphasia establish that language indeed could be located to particular locations in the brain. (Broca, 1861) The claim was further established when Lenneberg argued for the biological basis of language. (Lenneberg, 1967)

The intriguing nature of language can be established from the fact that several researches are being carried out all around the world to find out what exactly contributes in the acquisition of language. From behaviorists to cognitivists, all have tried to bring forth one or the other nature of the language. Behaviorists focus on the imitative nature of language: the application of stimulus- response theory (Skinner, 1957). The stimulus from the surrounding initiates response from the learner in the form of language. The brain thus acts as a homogenous computational system with language acquisition being one part of general learning. Language acquisition and language learning are life-long processes (Piaget, 1962). This theory holds true in almost all aspects of language except for one very major aspect that the rate of acquisition of language is not same at all ages. Also the rate of acquisition differs for different languages.

The cognitivists gain ground here. They believe that language is a cognitive faculty and it is not just a stimulus-response mechanism owing to external influence but it is also due to the
mental faculty of the human race that language is nurtured in the human mind. Each human brain is capable of processing information in a separate brain language that Pinker (1994) aptly labels as ‘mentalese’: in such a case language is as much an instrument of individual expression as much as a method of social cohesion. These are the two most important functions of language. Only when both these functions of language are given equal focus the proper growth of individual can be guaranteed. How can we forget the contribution of the innatist theory which clearly argued that every human being is born with an innate ability to acquire language and that every human brain has a hypothetical language acquisition device? There is a a ‘critical period’ in which the ability to acquire language is maximum in man and as one outgrows that period the efficiency to learn a language diminishes. (Chomsky, 1968)

Language has the power to bring together nations. It also has the power to ruin civilizations. Just like the power of science which can construct as well as destroy depending on how it is used, in the same way language can be used to uplift society or break it. This argument finds its birth in the linguistics determinism theory that was postulated some decades back. In one such hypothesis that led to the theory we get to know that language creates the world as we see and perceive it. We see what we are capable of expressing. Or we remember what we can express in our language. (Sapir, 1921; Whorf, 1956)

3. Synonymous with Life

It will not be an exaggeration to put here that language indeed is the life force for humanity. Many might argue that language is secondary to humans. It cannot be compared to air and water or for that matter food and shelter but I agree to disagree at this point. When I talk of life here I do not merely mean man’s ability to inhale and exhale air or the ability to eat and digest and grow physically. By life I mean man’s ability to develop, to create and to establish: to develop as a social being, to create habitable societies and to establish habitable environment. This is more than just being alive. It means to be alive and conscious, to be able to use brain and cognition, to be able to communicate and exchange, i.e., to be able to use language. This is the truest form of being alive. It is language which differentiates man from plants and animals. So in my earnest opinion this mental faculty called language should be given the same degree of importance and attention as any other factor that influences life to such a great intensity.
As we are born and we grow up we hardly ever think consciously as to what are the processes through which we acquire language realizing only either when we lose it or we are mocked at by others. A minor brain injury can make a man linguistically impaired, a condition known as aphasia in the medical world. The patient may appear fit and fine biologically but linguistic incompetence can render him to be labeled ‘unfit’ for the society. Since language is as simple as much a complex process so there are enormous possibilities where impairment can occur: production, transmission, reception and comprehension are the four pillars on which a man’s entire linguistic competence rests. As for the other case where we get mocked for our language is purely of sociological origin. The speakers of a socially superior language laugh at a socially inferior language. The problem is not with them that they laugh but the problem is with the other group which allows to be laughed at accepting the imposed inferior status of the mother tongue. We are so much prone to the idiosyncrasies of the popular culture that we lose our own language in the rat-race. Losing one’s mother tongue is synonymous with losing one’s identity. We forget our own speech community and we relentlessly try to enter into a bigger and more popular speech community.

This might not sound so alarming at the outset but it has disturbing and destructive consequences. The situation becomes worse and grave in a multilingual culture. Every culture tries to outshine the other culture and what could be better than engulfing a language altogether. Well, I do not want to alarm the readers here, rather I would like to offer a solution through this paper; a certain and effective measure that could retard or in some cases reverse the entire disturbing process finally resulting into a healthy linguistic environment. The effectiveness of the implementation of the method lays in the able hands of our teachers especially elementary teachers who get to nurture young minds. They are the potters who mould growing nascent brains in the best possible manner. The job is very satisfying but it comes with its own share of responsibility. An elementary teacher especially language teachers need to free themselves of language biasness so as to give an equal and just platform to the young speakers of varied linguistic background. It does not matter what language is to be taught in the class: whether the language is classical like Sanskrit which is for purely academic purpose or modern like English for broader communication or completely foreign like French or German for purely business or job purpose; the basic methodology for remains the same.
4. To be a Language Teacher

Of all the subjects that are taught in schools a language teacher is either the most loved or the least loved. The existence is always on the extremes. There is no middle path. Either the students love their teacher because they are free to express or they hate their teacher because their expressions are schooled. The challenge and agony is rampant. But a language teacher should not be discouraged. There is just a minor need to change the attitude towards language teaching, a mild reformation in the pedagogy that will pay huge dividends in the long run. One just needs to be a good listener first before becoming a teacher. She/ he should lend her/ his ears first and then expect the students to listen to them. This will not only help them to create rapport with the students but it will also assist them in knowing the linguistic aptitude of the students so that they can devise an effective pedagogy for language teaching.

The teacher must enter the class as a clean slate initially where the students feel free to scribble their ideas and opinions. When a child feels the joy and comfort of expressing only then she/ he can learn the various ways to express. If that joy is subdued there will not be any need of a medium to express. So as teachers the first duty is to nurture that joy and comfort in a child. The child must be allowed to speak in whatever language she/ he wishes to speak in, and if we pay a little attention to the National Curriculum Framework (2005) for school education: a set of guidelines passes by the Indian government we see that the need to nurture first language (FL)/ mother tongue (MT) has been heavily stressed upon. The language teacher must leave all his/ her own language prejudices behind the doors when he/ she enter the class. (Sinha, 2013) The idea should be to treat all languages equally. Children must be given contexts to speak freely. Or they can just be allowed to choose their own subjects for talking and discussion.

This is the first step towards language teaching. The teacher must keep one thing clear in mind that only if we respect our own language only then can we respect and learn other languages. If we condemn our own language we have a tendency to condemn other languages also. It is as simple as the fact that if we love and respect our own parents only then can we love and respect others’ parents. After all ‘charity begins at home’ Once this is done the teacher can create awareness about simple grammar of language. Such simple rules that one does not consciously think while speaking. This kind of exercise will create awareness among the young
learners. Such grammar rules can be pointing out the basic word order in the language, phrase movement, verb agreement, singular/plural and masculine/feminine. This will not only make them interested towards their own language but it will also make them analytical and inquisitive about language rules. Once this target is achieved then the target language (TL) must be introduced in the class.

The young students will learn the rules of TL with the same interest and vigor. After a stage the teaching can be more directed and controlled whereby they are given particular contexts to talk about or write. This will help in channelizing their creativity and their ability to learn a new language. The students can also be given exercises which tend to compare TL and their own FL or MT. This will help them to know the similarities and dissimilarities between both the languages. This way the importance of a language does not get demeaned in front of the other and the learning is also fast paced. The following arrow diagram explains the steps that a language teacher needs to undertake.

![Diagram]

Be a good listener

Zero language prejudice

Teach grammar of FL/MT

Create interest in FL/MT

Introduce TL

Draw comparisons between TL and FL/MT

This scheme of teaching can be represented better through the following flow-chart. The paper recommends an elementary teacher to pay close attention to the different stages of language teaching in the prescribed sequence. This would not only make language learning easy and interesting but it would also ensure better output.
If the target language is English then the task becomes even more interesting because the teacher can also use technology for language education. Most of the electronic gadgets like mobiles and computers come with commands in English in most of the places. In such a case the

Language in India www.languageinindia.com ISSN 1930-2940 15:6 June 2015
Dr. Sweta Sinha
Language or Life-force: What It Takes to be a Language Teacher?
language teacher can employ the method of ‘E- description’ where the students can write their assignments in the form of e-mails and SMSes to their teachers. (Sinha, 2014)

5. Conclusion

It does not matter what language we as teachers appreciate more, what matters is when we teach language at elementary level we need to be very careful because language is very much intrinsic to the personality building process in young learners. The teacher needs to create a just and prejudice free environment where the learners can bloom without any biasness. We must never forget that language is just another aspect of our identity. Questioning the credibility of one’s language or mocking one’s language is similar to questioning or mocking one’s identity. The elementary language teachers should therefore lay example for the entire human society that irrespective of the need of a popular language or culture the lesser known languages and cultures have the same right and dignity to be expressed.

The teacher must try to incorporate the virtue of being a good listener in order to excel in the class of language teaching. He/she must try to make the learner aware of the grammar of his/her own language before teaching another language. This will not only inculcate immense confidence but it will also increase the language proficiency among the learners and needless to say, the teacher will be much loved and revered in the class.

====================================================================

References


Dr. Sweta Sinha

Language or Life-force: What It Takes to be a Language Teacher?
Morrow and Company.


http://ijee.org/vol_3_issue_3


---

Sweta Sinha, Ph.D. in Linguistics
Centre for Linguistics
School of Language, Literature and Culture Studies
Jawaharlal Nehru University
New Delhi 110067
India
apna1982@gmail.com
Use of Discourse Markers: A Case Study of English Writing by Yemeni Students

Thekra Mohammed Abdullah Yehia
Ph.D. Scholar in Linguistics

Abstract

The purpose of this paper is to evaluate the quality of English writing of level four students in Taiz University and to find out whether there is correlation between writing quality and the variable of gender. It also aims at investigating the use of discourse markers that Yemeni English Foreign language learners use in their composition writings. The research questions addressed in this paper are (1) what are the discourse markers that are frequently used by Yemeni EFL learners? , and (2) is there a direct relationship between the use of such markers and the writing quality of the learners? The 10 essays written by the study sample were analyzed following Fraser's (1999) taxonomy. The findings of the study reveal that the most frequently used discourse markers are the collateral ones, followed by the inferential, discourse activity, contrastive, discourse structure, causative and topic change markers. It is also shown that there is a positive correlation between learners' writing quality and gender of the participants. The paper concludes with some recommendations and suggestions that could participate in improving this critical area of language studies.

Key words: Discourse, Discourse Markers, Coherence, Coherent Devices, Cohesion, Cohesion Types, Contrastive analysis, First Language Interference

1. Introduction

In Yemen, English language is taught as a foreign language. It is being taught in public schools from grade seven onwards, though the quality of public school instruction is low. Although private schools, following either a British or an American system, teach English and produce proficient speakers, Arabic is still the language used for the communicative purposes.
The number of English speakers in Yemen is small compared to other Arab countries such as Egypt, Lebanon, UAE, and Saudi Arabia.

1.1 Linguistic Differences between Arabic and English

Arabic is from the Semitic language family, while English is an Indo-European language. The Arabic and the English languages differ in many respects. English language systematically and linguistically differs from Arabic Language. And this gap of matching makes English language learning even more difficult. Arabic is a synthetic language as the form of any word indicates almost all its grammatical characteristics such as gender, person, number, tense and others. For example, the word “katabtu” corresponds exclusively to “I wrote”, neutral, singular, first person, past simple tense. English, on the contrary, is an analytical language, which requires additional words to fulfill these functions, and the meaning of words is responsible predominantly for the semantics. The differences could be seen at the different linguistic levels.

At the phonological level we could see that Arabic has 28 consonants and 3 vowels while English language has 24 consonants and 8 vowels and diphthongs. English beginners confuse with the spelling of words like “bet” beat”, and “beet”. Arabic is a vocalized language, it gives no importance to short vowels in writing so Arabic students confuse spelling words like “pan”, pen” and “pin” “thread”. Arabic has several diacritics (small vowels) that can be written above or beneath each letter. These diacritics are most of the time assumed to be guessed by the Arabic reader. Most Arabic texts are written without these diacritics. So consonant clusters, such as in the words split, threw or lengths, also cause problems and often result in the speaker adding an extra vowel: spilit, ithrew, or lengthes. Arabic has gutturals and emphatic consonants which are absent in English.

At the morphological level we could find that the root words of Arabic are purely three-consonant- based and all derivative words are formed by combining the three-root consonants with fixed vowel patterns and; sometimes, an affix. This kind of difference could cause some kind of confusion when articulating or spelling English words as per the irregularity of English spelling rules.
At the syntactic levels English has no gender and cases, for example, “they write”, “I write” the verb “write” does not indicate its gender and case on its own; the doer does. Word order is also different- adjectives always follow nouns in Arabic while in English the former precede the latter. In English the sentence pattern is SVO while Arabic as a VSO patterned language. There is a large potential for errors of interference when Arab learners produce written or spoken English due to the differences between the two languages at the different linguistic levels.

1.2 Discourse

Discourse is a communicative event in which language plays a prominent role. It minimally requires a sender (writer, speaker), a receiver (reader, listener), and a message that is being communicated. This message is not merely a concatenation of clauses; it forms a unified, coherent whole. Both the sender and receiver normally have the implicit agreement that the message being communicated is coherent.

1.3 Coherence and Cohesion

Coherence can be reserved for the conceptual relationships that comprehenders use to construct a coherent mental representation accommodated by what is said in the discourse. Coherence, in linguistics, is what makes a text semantically meaningful. It is especially dealt with in text linguistics. Coherence is achieved through syntactical features such as the use of deictic, anaphoric and cataphoric elements or a logical tense structure, as well as presuppositions and implications connected to general world knowledge. The purely linguistic elements that make a text coherent are subsumed under the term cohesion. Coherent devices refer to - Repetition of a Key Term Phrase, synonyms, pronouns, transitional words, sentence pattern. Cohesion refers to the ways in which texts are 'stuck together'--the ways in which sentences are linked or connected by various linguistic and semantic ties."

Cohesion, on the other hand, is limited to the linguistic markers that help the speaker/writer to build such coherent representations. Cohesion emphasizes discourse-as-product, and coherence emphasizes discourse-as-process. Cohesion and coherence can be grammar driven and vocabulary driven. Cohesion can be *Grammatical*- concerns such matters
as reference, ellipsis, substitution, and conjunction-, lexical-concerns such features as synonymy, antonymy, metonymy, collocation, repetition, etc., and instantial cohesion - concerns ties that are valid only for a particular text.

Grammar-driven cohesion refers to sentence structure, word structure, and the intonation of the discourse segments. Vocabulary-driven cohesion refers to the lexical vocabulary of the discourse segment. Cohesive markers, then, activate both vocabulary-driven (pre-grammatical, knowledge-based) and grammar-driven (syntax-based) coherence. Vocabulary-driven and grammar-driven coherences are interrelated - they support each other for the production of a comprehensible input. There is no single discourse marker that necessarily fulfills any one or exclusively only one function. They can have more than one function and relate to more than one level of discourse.

1.4 Contrastive Analysis

As per the linguistic differences amongst languages, a new type of analysis came into appearance. Contrastive analysis is that type of linguistic analysis of two languages which points out the similarities and differences between them. Such analysis points at the specific features of each language system in its major areas: phonology, morphology, lexicology, syntax, text analysis (Johansson, 1975).

Some errors could be attributed to first language interference. Lott (1983: 256) defines interference as 'errors in the learner’s use of the foreign language that can be traced back to the mother tongue'. There is a huge difference between English and Arabic in the use of discourse Markers. Furthermore, discourse markers have a multiplicity of functions, which means that a discourse marker may have more than one function and thus it can be used to signal a variety of relations between various written discourse segments. Somewhat more subtle distinctions are sometimes made. One can distinguish between discourse-as-product (the linguistic construct) and discourse-as-process (the communicative event).

Thus, researchers and teachers of foreign language have been working hardly to identify the problematic areas in the process of constructing a new system of language. To do so, they
started to study the similarities and differences among languages, because similarities will ease the target language learning while differences hinder it. Contrastive analysis plays a crucial role in the field of S/F LL. In order to avoid the occurrence of errors, you, firstly, need to spot them up; then, analyze them to trace and identify the actual reasons beyond their occurrence, and finally, set a list of suggestions and remedial treatments to avoid their occurrence in the future.

1.5 Discourse Markers

Discourse markers are those words and expressions which relate discourse segments and indicate the relationship between an utterance, and the prior discourse, functioning as indicators of discourse structure. They are characteristics of connected discourse, that is to say they contribute to discourse coherence, which signal the communicative intentions of discourse. They could be words or phrases, for example, a conjunction such as "and, but", an adverbial "now, then", a comment clause "frankly speaking", interjection "oh, well"— that is uttered with the primary function of bringing to the reader's attention a particular kind of linkage of the upcoming utterance with the immediate discourse context (Redeker, 1991:1168).

1.5.1 Fraser’s (1999) Taxonomy of Discourse Markers

Fraser (1999) classifies discourse makers in to two categories, propositional and non-propositional. Propositional discourse markers are used to relate the propositions or messages of the sentences while non-propositionals are used to signal an aspect of discourse structure or topic like organization and management. The propositional discourse markers are sub-classified into contrastive, collateral and inferential markers. The non-propositional discourse markers are identified as discourse structure markers, topic change markers and discourse activity markers.

1.5.1.1 Propositional Discourse Markers

The contrastive discourse markers signal the contrast between segments (2) and (1) in some aspects of interpretation. The group includes the following markers: (But, In contrast, Whereas, In comparison, On the Contrary, Conversely, Indeed, Instead of, Rather than, In fact, In reality, Otherwise, On the other hand, Alternatively, However, Though, Even though, As though, And though, Although, All the same, Despite, Even so, Except for, In spite of, Nevertheless, Nonetheless, Regardless, Yet, Still, Notwithstanding, But, Also).
The collateral markers, functionally, shows a quasi-parallel relationship between the explicit contents of segment (2) and segment (1). The group includes the following items: (And, Above all, Also, Besides, Better yet, And yet, Well, For another thing, Furthermore, Moreover, In addition, Or, Aside from, More to the point, On top of it all, To cap it all off, What is more, I mean, In particular, Namely, Analogously, Parenthetically, That is to say, By the same token, Equally, Correspondingly, Likewise, Similarly, That said).

The inferential markers signal that segment (2) is a conclusion of the explicit proposition of segment (1). This group of markers includes the following items: (So, Of course, Accordingly, As a consequence, Consequently, As a logical conclusion, As a result, Because of, Hence, It can be concluded that, It stands to reason that, Thus, Therefore, In this case, Under these conditions, At any rate, Then, All things considered, In any event, In the light of the foregoing ).

The last propositional discourse markers group is the causative markers. This group specifies that segment (2) provides a reason for the proposition presented in segment (1). The items of this group are “After all”, “Because”, and “Since”.

1.5.1.2 Non-Propositional Discourse Markers

The first non-propositional discourse markers are the discourse structure markers which work as organizers for the components of the topic. They indicate the beginning, middle and end of the text. This group includes the following makers: (Once again, At the outset, Finally, First/second, Lastly, To start with, In the first place, Next, Moving right along).

The second non-propositional group of discourse markers is the topic change markers. They signal the shift of handling topics. The items of the following group include:(By the way, To return to my point, Back to my original point, That reminds me, Before I forget, Incidentally, Just to update you, Speaking of x, To change to topic, On a different note, While I think of it, With regard to).

The third non-propositional discourse markers are the discourse activity markers. This
group of markers indicates that the current discourse is merely an activity that illustrates, exemplifies or explains a preceding one. The discourse activity markers include the following: (For example, For instance, To explain, To clarify, To illustrate, According to, To interrupt, In short).

Finally, due to the linguistic differences between Arabic and English, Yemeni students, inevitably, make errors regarding the use of the discourse markers when writing in English.

2. Literature Review

Modhish, A. S. (2012) has done a case study entitled “Use of Discourse Markers in the Composition Writings of Arab EFL Learners” in which he investigated the use of discourse markers that Yemeni EFL learners use in their composition writings. He investigated the discourse markers that are frequently used by Yemeni EFL learners, and tried to check whether there is a direct relationship between the use of such markers and the writing quality of the learners in question or not.

The study sample included 50 essays written by level three students and was analyzed following Fraser's (1999) taxonomy. The findings of the study revealed that the most frequently used discourse markers were the elaborative ones, followed by the inferential, contrastive, causative and topic relating markers. The findings also showed that there was no strong positive correlation between learners' total number of discourse markers used and the writing quality of the participants. There was, however, a positive correlation between the topic relating markers and the writing quality of the learners.

Finally, Mudhish enriched his conclusion with some valuable recommendations. He advised the EFL programs in the Arab world and in the other similar contexts treat writing as a separate skill and not to be looked at as a secondary skill that is not given the attention it deserves. He also insisted on EFL learners being encouraged by writing instructors to adventure with the language and not to be unnecessarily cautious of making errors as this might lead learners to be rather inhibited. And he concluded his recommendations by advising English language teachers in general and EFL writing instructors in particular to tackle the discourse
markers inductively and deductively, and provide learners with adequate exposure in L2 which will certainly enable learners to pay attention to these linguistic items and become aware of the facilitating role they play in making their texts more coherent and cohesive.

Frahan Z. & Fannoush T.(2005) has examined the difficulties that are likely to be encountered in translating discourse Markers from English into Arabic i.e. translating the SL discourse markers into their TL equivalents in Arabic. The study is reserved for the investigation of discourse markers according to Fraser's (1999) discourse markers model. Translation and critical discussion of two English texts (Scientific and Journalistic) taken from two English magazines (The Reader's Digest and The Time), conducted by (3) M.A. students of translation, College of Arts, University of Mosul, are given.

The study concluded with the fact that English style has a clear-cut tendency to the use of discourse markers in more profusion and diversity than Arabic. In the translation of discourse markers from English into Arabic, there was indeterminacy across several sub-classes; for example, a contrastive discourse marker may be rendered by an inferential one and vice versa. The students agreed in the translation of the coordinators "but", and "and", while they faced difficulty in the translation of subordinates. The study could also highlight another problem that there is mixing propositions for conjuncts i.e. (discourse markers) and vice versa which could be considered as another source of ambiguity and mistranslation, for example "as" in some part of the written text was not a discourse marker but rather a preposition.

3. Research Objectives

The current paper is an investigation into the use of discourse markers in the English writing of the Taiz English department graduates. It aims at:

- Evaluating the quality of writing of level four students in Taiz University
- Investigating the correlation between writing quality and gender
- Identifying the problematic areas regarding the use of the English discourse markers and how they affect the quality of English writing and the possible reasons beyond their occurrences.
4. Methodology

4.1 Participants

The sample of the current study is five students of the English department, Taiz University, Yemen, two males and three females. The data collected for this study was merely 10 essays written by five volunteers, two essays each. The place of the test was the dean office where they could sit quietly to do the task without any disturbance. The time set for the test was one hour for both essays. However, the students were asked to write the beginning and finishing time to make it easy for the scholar to identify the mean of time duration per essay.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Essay number</th>
<th>Starting time</th>
<th>Finishing time</th>
<th>Duration in minutes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1+2</td>
<td>10:15</td>
<td>10:53</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3+4</td>
<td>10:15</td>
<td>11:10</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5+6</td>
<td>10:15</td>
<td>11:20</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7+8</td>
<td>10:15</td>
<td>11:15</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9+10</td>
<td>10:15</td>
<td>11:12</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total of minutes</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>275</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Mean of time per essay</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>275/10 = 27.5</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table (1)

4.2 Data Collection Procedure

As the current study is a descriptive one, 60 students volunteered for the mission, and out of the list five students were randomly chosen. The researcher gave the students three alternative topics, which all were connected to them and their interest. 10 essays, two essays each, written by these learners were subjected to thorough analysis and attention was focused on their use and manipulation of discourse markers so as to achieve a unified piece of writing at the essay level. Fraser's (1999) Model of discourse markers analysis has been chosen for studying discourse markers. Fraser has classified discourse markers into two major classes with subclasses. The first is propositional discourse markers while the second is non-propositional discourse markers. With regard to writing quality, the 10 essays were rated by two EFL writing instructors on the basis of (task response, use of coherence and cohesion, grammatical range and accuracy, mechanical accuracy, and organization). The collected data were analyzed mainly quantitatively.
and qualitatively. To this end, statistical measures were utilized to present data statistically by means of frequency of occurrence of discourse markers, mean of occurrence and percentages.

### 4.3 Writing Assessment Criteria

The scholar adopts two procedures for evaluating the essays. The first procedure is a holistic one, dealing with the text as a complete unit (White, 1985). She made an adaption between the TWE (Test of Written English) criteria and the General Assessment Criteria for academic writing assignments in International Master’s Programmes to come up with the following holistic criteria assumption:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Task Response (content evaluation) number of ideas relating to task (5mks)</th>
<th>Coherence and cohesion (5mks)</th>
<th>Lexical Resource (5mks)</th>
<th>Grammatical Range and Accuracy (5mks)</th>
<th>Mechanical Accuracy (3m)</th>
<th>Organisation (2mks)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fitness of writing parts all together</td>
<td>Choice of words</td>
<td>Appropriate and accurate use of preposition</td>
<td>Proper format</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Logical Flow of Sentences</td>
<td>Correct Time of Use</td>
<td>Appropriate and accurate use of verb conjugation</td>
<td>Correct Spacing</td>
<td>Body</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organisaton of Ideas</td>
<td>Is the writer understood to the reader</td>
<td>Correct Place of Use</td>
<td>Appropriate and accurate use of articles</td>
<td>Punctuation</td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Extending Ideas and Support (bring facts of experience to support ideas)</td>
<td>Use of Conjunctions</td>
<td>Correct Way of Use</td>
<td>Spelling</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Use of Coherent and</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Capitalization</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.4 Identification and Classification of Discourse Markers

The second evaluation procedure was descriptive and analytic. According to Fraser’s 1999 Discourse Markers Model, the discourse markers were labeled according to the frequency of their occurrence- the discourse markers belong to one category were listed together under that category. The scholar aims at investigating the most discourse markers used by the Yemeni students when writing in English according to the frequency of use of each category. The categories set by Fraser’s 1999 Model are as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Discourse Markers</th>
<th>Non-Propositional Discourse Markers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Propositional Discourse Markers</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Collateral Discourse Markers</td>
<td>1. Discourse Activity Markers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Inferential Discourse Markers</td>
<td>2. Discourse Structure Markers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Contrastive Discourse Markers</td>
<td>3. Topic Change Markers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Causative Discourse Markers</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table (3)

5. Results and Discussion

According to the criteria set in table (2) for doing a holistic evaluation of the writing proficiency of the students, table (4) shows that the students have fulfilled low writing
proficiency rates with an average rate of 12.4 out of 25 which equalizes to 50%. Only one student fulfilled a good rate of achievement, 19.5 with a percentage of 78%.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of the student</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Task response coherence and cohesion</th>
<th>Lexical resource</th>
<th>Grammatical range and accuracy (5 mks)</th>
<th>Mechanical accuracy</th>
<th>Organization (2 mks)</th>
<th>Total out of 25</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>m</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>19.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>f</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>f</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>m</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>f</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table (4)

Regarding the correlation between writing performance and gender, we could see in table (5) that male students have fulfilled better achievement with a percentage of 60% compared to female students’, 43.3. Accordingly, there is a noticeable correlation between writing proficiency and gender.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>60%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>32.5</td>
<td>43.3%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table (5)

Regarding the results which came out from the analysis done following Frazer’s Discourse Markers Model, they were as follows:
Contrastive Discourse Markers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Frequency of occurrence</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>But</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Even if</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table (6)

As table (6) shows the use of contrastive markers was only restricted to two markers, “but” and “Even if”. Whereas “but” has achieved a frequency of 13, “even if” has only one. This could be attributed to first language interference, as in Arabic the word “but” has may equivalents like “bal”, “bainama”, “lakinna” which has different semantic meanings in different contexts. When writing in English, Arabic students use “but” to capture all those semantic meanings as being the only substitute.

Collateral Discourse Markers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Frequency of occurrence</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>And</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Furthermore</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moreover</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Also</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Or</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In addition</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table (7)

As table (7) shows the students used 6 collateral markers, out of which two markers only achieved higher frequencies, “and” and “also”, as they fulfilled frequencies of “22” and “9” respectively. This could be attributed to first language interference. In Arabic the collateral marker “wa” is the equivalent to the English one “and”, and “Aydan” is the equivalent to “also”. There are also so many collateral markers in Arabic like “Kodalika”, “bilidafa”, “adif ila dalika”, “Alawatan ala dalika”, “aw”… But “wa” (and) and “aydan” (also) are more commonly used in
both standard and colloquial forms of language. The other markers, on the other hand, are only used in Standard Arabic. Here lies the reason beyond the frequent use of “and” and “also” when writing in English language.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Inferential Discourse Markers</th>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Frequency of occurrence</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>So</td>
<td>20</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>therefore</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thus</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>24</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As table (8) shows the students used 3 inferential markers, “so”, “therefore”, and “thus”, out of which one marker, “so”, achieved the highest frequency of occurrence as it fulfilled a frequency of “20”. This could also be attributed to first language interference. The English inferential marker “so” has many equivalents in Arabic Language, “lida”, and “wa li hada al sabab”, “wa buna’n alaiyahi”. “so”, in Arabic, can semantically cover the meanings of some other English inferential markers. That’s why we find Arabic students overuse it when speaking or writing in English.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Causative Discourse Markers</th>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Frequency of occurrence</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Because</td>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>8</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table (9) shows that the students used one causative markers,”because”, with a frequency of occurrence of “8”.. The Arabic equivalents to “because” is “liana” and it can semantically cover the meanings of some other English causative markers. That’s why we find
Arabic students overuse it when speaking or writing in English. Thus, we could say that first language interference and the less exposure to English along with the limited use and practice of English can be considered as major factors for the appearance of such phenomenon.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Discourse Structure Markers</th>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Frequency of occurrence</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>generally</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Finally</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>To conclude</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>On the whole</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>First of all</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Secondly</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Then</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>12</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table (10)

Regarding the frequencies of the discourse structure markers, table (10) shows that “finally” was used for seven times while the other six markers were used once each. In colloquial Arabic, speakers use less structure markers than they do when speaking Standard. We could say that the students transfer their linguistic habits of language use from Arabic into English.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic Change Markers</th>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Frequency of occurrence</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>As we know</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Regarding to</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>In my opinion</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>6</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table (11)
As table (11) shows the students used 3 topic change markers, “as we know”, “regarding to”, and “in my opinion” with similar frequencies of occurrence as they fulfilled “2” frequencies each. Each marker of the three has an Arabic equivalent that has the same semantic meaning. Those Arabic equivalents are usually used in both Standard and Colloquia Arabic. The low rates of frequency reflect the ignorance of the students of the use of such markers during discussions, debates, or argumentations. We could say that the students transfer their linguistic habits of language use, both positive and negative, from Arabic into English.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Discourse Activity Markers</th>
<th>Frequency of occurrence</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Such as</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>For example</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To sum up</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>15</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table (12)

As table (12) shows the students used 3 discourse activity markers, “such as”, “for example”, and “to sum up”, out of which one marker, “for example”, achieved the highest frequency of occurrence as it fulfilled a frequency of “9”. This could also be attributed to first language interference. The English discourse activity marker “for example” has two equivalents in Arabic Language, “mathalan”, and “ala sabeel al mithal”. In Arabic, “for example” is more commonly used and semantically cover the meaning of “such as”. That’s why we find Arabic students overuse it when speaking or writing in English.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Discourse Marker</th>
<th>Frequency of occurrence</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Collateral Discourse Markers</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inferential Discourse Markers</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
As we see in table (13), the students used a total of 117 discourse markers. The collateral discourse markers achieved the highest frequency of occurrence, 30, where the collateral discourse marker “and” alone fulfilled a frequency of 22, see table (7). It could be attributed to the influence of the mother tongue of Arabic as Arabic native speakers overuse this particular marker. The inferential discourse markers achieved a frequency of 24, see table (8) where “so” alone achieved 20. This high achievement could be related to the type of topic itself that involves a deeper level of discussion which made the candidates employ such kind of markers to link the ideas together in order to maintain the unity of the discussion. On the other hand, the topic change markers fulfilled the least frequency of occurrence, 6, see table (11), where three markers have been used with an equal frequency of 2 each. The low rates of frequency reflect
the ignorance of the students of the use of such markers during discussions, debates, or argumentations. We could say that the students transfer their linguistic habits of language use, both positive and negative, from Arabic into English. This low and paralleled rate of frequency indicates the candidates’ low fluency level and shortage of vocabulary; which could be attributed to the less practice of English language and the dominance of Arabic language use for the communicative purposes.

6. Conclusion and Recommendation

The low quality of writing reflected the need to intensify our focus, as teachers, on developing the writing abilities of the students. Teachers should provide students with enough chances to take part in interactive writing activities. They should design different types of activities that authenticate the use of the discourse markers in communicative contexts with reference to their equivalents in Arabic. This could reinforce their comprehension of the different types of discourse markers and their uses. Teachers should also enhance better environment for learning by involving the students in cooperative writing tasks, providing them with more challenging and exciting tasks connected to their interests and lives, and by giving them constructive feedback. Better ways of teaching could raise the students’ interest to achieve higher levels of learning. Regarding the educational institutions, they can design syllabi in which the four skills are employed to scaffold the improvement of writing capability. Carefully planned set of activities could give the students better chances of practicing the four skills all together in order to improving the language proficiency of the students. The teachers need to involve the students in

References


Language in India www.languageinindia.com ISSN 1930-2940 15:6 June 2015

Thekra Mohammed Abdullah Yehia

Use of Discourse Markers: A Case Study of English Writing by Yemeni Students 234


[http://grammar.about.com/od/c/g/cohesionterm.htm](http://grammar.about.com/od/c/g/cohesionterm.htm)

Thekra Mohammed Abdullah Yehia
Kuvempu Institute of Studies in Kannada
University of Mysore
Mysore 570006
Karnataka
India
nicefuture1979@yahoo.com
Abstract

This paper reviews *Doing Research: The Complete Research Paper Guide* by Dorothy U. Seyler from the perspective of students and research scholars who are required to write research articles. The reviewed covers all the chapters and presents the salient features of this classic work, which is very relevant even today.
Key words: Research methods, research strategies, design of research articles, methods of analysis, Doing Research: The Complete Research Paper Guide by Dorothy U. Seyler.

Introduction

Doing Research: The Complete Research Paper Guide by Dorothy U. Seyler is precisely what is claimed in the sub-title. It is a complete, well organized and well written guide for writing a research paper. Dr. Seyler is Professor of English at Northern Virginia Community College and, she has written extensively on the process of writing.

Chapter One – Getting Started

Seyler begins the book by explaining the purpose and meaning of research. All of us “do” research. We seek out customer reviews and product reviews for major purchases. We research a problem or issue for a presentation or a work project. And, most of us have written research papers during our academic careers.

The larger and ultimate purpose of research is to expand available knowledge and to solve previously unsolved problems. A research paper is the documentation of this discovery. Because this work is potentially a contribution to ongoing scholarship, it must be clearly organized, carefully reasoned, and well written.

A point that the author makes repeatedly is that just gathering and recording information is not research. Research requires the advancing of human knowledge and the answering of previously unanswered questions. We don’t engage in research to satisfy a personal curiosity or even to gain an advanced degree; we do research in order to extend the boundaries of knowledge and understanding.

There are three types of research papers: expository, analytic, and persuasive. An expository paper is written to provide information. They include literature reviews, market research, and technical reports. They are often assigned in courses in order to teach the students research skills. An analytic paper involves more than the gathering of information. It requires the
evaluation of information and the implications behind it. These papers explore cause and effect relationships, decision making processes, and other topics of analysis and evaluation. Finally, a persuasive essay seeks to convince the reader of a premise or thesis.

The author next presents those types of writing that are not actually research. We might call them “pseudo-research.” Included are a collection of quotations or the restatement of a single author’s position, a reflection paper describing personal experiences, a purely theoretical paper with no resources supporting the theory, or a paper with no documented sources.

Motivation for research and writing is very important and we must establish, from the start, why our project is significant and worth the effort. Good research is built around asking the right questions in the pursuit of new understanding. In addition, not only must we select a topic, we must limit the extent of our study in order to achieve focus and clarity.

Effective research is built upon a clear statement of purpose that establishes the direction and style of writing. One must also consider the intended audience for the report. What do we want them to learn and to do as a result of this study? A more generalized audience requires less use of specialized terms and/or the defining of important terms. Topics to avoid are those that are irrelevant to the field, that are too general, that only have one available source, or that are too technical. In this way, we are careful to limit our research to topics that are relevant and manageable.

In assessing the need for research, it is important to start with what we already know and to use this to choose a significant issue for study. A good method for starting this process is to “free write” a page of thoughts on the topic, listing the questions and issues related to the topic. A similar method is to “brainstorm,” writing short statements and questions related to the topic, then paring the list down to the most relevant. Using these methods one can surmise the possibilities, set priorities, and evaluate items on the list to narrow the choices. The goal of this process is to go beyond common knowledge to discover issues in need of further investigation.
At the heart of these methods is the need to ask questions and to narrow the topic for the sake of the advancement of knowledge.

In the search for topics and resources there are several listings that can be used to gather information. They include the Library of Congress Subject Headings (LCSH), *The Reader’s Guide to Periodical Literature*, as well as internet sites and listings. As we continue this part of the project, it is also helpful to speak to colleagues to get their feedback and input on the issue.

Once we have settled on a topic for research, it is important to create a tentative thesis statement. This statement should be taken from the freewriting and brainstorming described in the last section. This is an important part of the process because it guides all of the future research and sets the target for the project. As a next step in the process, the author encourages the writer to produce a more lengthy statement of purpose in which a research strategy is set forth.

Related to this is the need to keep a research journal for jotting down new ideas, setting out a weekly schedule, and providing a written assessment of the progress of the study. It should record all the time spent on research and writing. It should be a place for creative thinking and processing data, and a record of the completion of major sections of the project, as well as a place to vent frustrations and concerns. The journal should also record the plans for future work and needs to be updated on a regular basis.

Ultimately it is important to have a plan of attack along with a written schedule of the work to be done. In this way, the project can be completed on time and achieve the goals set out for it at the very beginning.

**Chapter Two – Locating Sources**

The second chapter of the book primarily describes the methods for utilizing the resources in a college library. The author describes the parts of a typical library and how to gain access to the books and periodicals it contains. She gives helpful rules for narrowing a search,
using general reference works like encyclopedias and indexes. She also presents ways to find background material for a research question using dictionaries, almanacs, and historical surveys. In looking for sources, the author directs us to larger indexes and databases.

The author gives a relatively thorough description of the three catalogs of a typical library: the author catalog, the title catalog, and the subject catalog. Originally these were three separate card catalogs, now they are computerized. But these three methods of search are still available and accessible online or through an in-library computer terminal. The author next presents the information available on a typical page entry for an item in the catalog. This includes author, title, publication information, call number, and availability. Dr. Seyler also describes the basic classification systems, whether the Dewey Decimal System or the Library of Congress classification system (LC). The Library of Congress (LC) system is the most widely used among college libraries.

The goal of a search is to develop a working bibliography. The book gives tips for finding and recording items to be included in this document. As one searches for specific books in a library stack it is also helpful to examine other books on the same shelf because they will be related to the topic at hand. She makes the point that we must always be on the lookout for books related to our topic.

The reference section of the library is an important place for identifying resources and narrowing the search. Here one finds background information and a more general overview of the subject. Some of the most helpful general references are the latest copy of Books in Print and other book indexes. Also included in the reference section are dictionaries, encyclopedias, atlases, books of quotations, collections of mythologies, almanacs, yearbooks, indexes to bibliographical dictionaries, bibliographical indexes, and general literature indexes.

Magazine and journal articles often reflect the most up-to-date research on a given topic. They are, therefore, an important place to look for source materials. One identifies relevant articles by searching periodical indexes. In this section, the book is a bit dated since so much of
the material found in periodicals is currently located online. Dr. Sayler does speak of this growing trend, but the book offers instructions in the use of CD-ROM for this search. Today, such searches are primarily digital. The author also gives instructions on searching for related newspaper articles and academic journals.

The chapter also covers the use of documents published by the government. Documents included are the results of government research projects that relate to economics, public policy, health care, law, business and other topics of public interest. These reports are often important sources for statistics and demographic information.

Finally, the chapter describes the use of specialized resources in creating a research bibliography. These include indexes that reveal secondary sources for the topic in question, lesser known or used journals, dissertation abstracts, and citation indexes. These resources can often lead one to previously unknown books or articles related to the subject and deepen one’s understanding of the issues involved.

Enhancing our capacity to perform research today are all of the online databases that provide access to academic journals, dissertations, and other resources. Most college libraries subscribe to some or all of the databases. These include ERIC, EBSCO, MLA International Bibliography, and ScienceSource.

There are also times when it is necessary to look for resources that are not found in a library. The author suggests these searches normally include topics in the humanities or social sciences. These resources include documents retained in the National Archives which are located in Washington, D.C. and in regional branches across the country. In addition, there are state and local archives, historical societies, and other sources of documents and correspondence. Even more directly, one can write letters to business leaders, government officials, and others who would have relevant knowledge of the subject of the study. Finally, many qualitative studies are built around surveys and interviews which become an important source of relevant information.
Chapter 3 – Preparing a Bibliography

As one proceeds in the search for resources, we must make and keep a record of the materials to be used for the project. In making this record, we are producing a working bibliography for our research. This document will serve to show that there are sufficient resources available to complete the project, which of these resources will be the focus of the study, and to provide proper support and documentation for the conclusions of the study.

The author suggests using 3X5 cards, one resource per card, a card for every relevant source, each card containing all the required bibliographic information, and completed in the proper format for later use in the final bibliography. In doing this recording properly, we are ensuring that we have all the necessary information to complete the written project without having to go back to the library to add missing details, thus saving time and effort in the process of completing the project, and assuring that our report is thoroughly documented.

In filling out the cards we wish to use in creating our bibliography it is essential that we include the author, title, and publication information. It is also important to create each card in compliance with the style format used by the assigning school or institution (MLA, APA, ACS, and others). In this chapter, the author presents samples of completed bibliographic cards, reminding the reader that in many cases, bibliographic information must be “translated” into the order and format of the assigned style, and the cards should be constructed to reflect the required style. In this way, the cards can be directly used in creating the final bibliography for the study. Dr. Sayler then presents the conventions for producing a proper bibliography. In general, each citation should be given using hanging indentation. Each citation should be in given in the proper order. As well, she presents the proper form for giving an author’s name whether a single author or a work with multiple authors. She also describes the conventions for titles and publication information. This section is a valuable resource for anyone writing a research paper or other scholarly work. The chapter concludes with a description of the rules for completing a “Works Cited” page in the MLA format.

Chapter Four – Understanding Sources and Taking Notes
Once we have created a working bibliography, it is time to study those resources in order to gather the information and gain the insights that answer the questions posed in the research project. Central to this process will be note taking, in the process of studying the selected resources. Here, the author gives guidelines for properly using sources in a research project. In doing so, she describes a process of collecting resources and narrowing the focus of the study to understanding of the topic. In addition, she describes the purposes behind the process. We may be attempting to defend a position in the face of a controversy or in the attempt to prove a hypothesis. We need outside sources in order to establish that our view is more than a personal opinion, but is defended by legitimate scholarship. Sources also help us expand our understanding of an issue and enable us to make inferences and gain new insight into the question at hand.

The ultimate concern with proper sourcing is the need to avoid plagiarism and to establish that the work is original. The price of improper documentation is loss of reputation and credibility. As a result, we must provide references for all direct quotations, all paraphrased ideas and opinions, all summaries of ideas, and any factual information that we take from outside sources. In line with this, we must be able to make the distinction between widely known and accepted information which does not need documentation and the discussion and opinion concerning even widely known facts by authors which do need to be referenced.

It is important for us to be able to differentiate between primary (direct quotation from an author’s book or article) and secondary (quotation of an author by a different author) sources and to know when the use of each is appropriate. We also need to know how to assess the reliability and credibility of our sources. The author suggests that we question all of our sources and make the effort to verify a statement or fact with multiple sources. The quality of our sourcing is a reflection on the quality of our study.

The author presents a helpful chart for knowing the difference between primary and secondary sources. A primary source would be a letter written by a famous person, while a secondary source is the reference to or quotation from the letter in a history book or biography.
She also explains which types of reports require primary sources and which must have secondary sources.

When we use a source for our study we are implying that the information is accurate and true (unless we specifically say otherwise). Our own credibility is on the line when we reference a “fact.” In addition, we must evaluate our sources to see that they are relevant and useful to our premise. To do this, we must identify the leading authorities and works in our chosen field of study and build our report around them. This requires that we establish the credentials of the authors we use. We also must examine the reviews of the works we are using, and know the frequency of the use of book or author for citation in other publications using the Citations Index.

With the dramatic advances in knowledge in the past decades, it is possible for older sources to become outdated. We must therefore be concerned to find newer, more relevant sources for our research, and eschew older (even though well known) sources whose information is passé. In addition, we must be sure the information in our sources is properly documented within the source; we need to be careful of undocumented statistics from a secondary source. We also need to pay attention to whether a publication is intended for a general audience or for specialists in the field of study. One must develop a system for evaluating sources as part of the research process.

The author next instructs the reader in developing a preliminary outline to guide reading and note taking. Like the search for outside sources, this outline must be built from the purpose of the study. In line with this, the book presents several organizational strategies for use in this step. These include a report structure, a comparison/contrast structure, the testing of a theory or model, and the problem/solution structure. The appropriate structure must be applied for the chosen subject and the purpose of the study.

The preliminary outline is used in guiding the study and note taking required to complete the study. Notes should be written on 3X5 cards, in ink, and using only one side of each card.
One should do reading and analysis of the sources first before taking notes to avoid wasting time and effort. Be sure to include a clear reference for each note (author and page number). Write out the complete quotation or paraphrase on each note card, and clearly describe what is fact and what is opinion. We also need to state what is an opinion taken from a source and what is personal opinion.

At this point, Seyler presents the different types of note taking. These include summary notes, paraphrase notes, and direct quotation notes. Each of these notes has a role in the final preparation of the paper, and it is important to create the notes in such a way that they can be transferred easily into the final paper. Direct quotations should be used sparingly and where needed to provide statistics, the authority of the original author, or for a special way of making the statement that increases its effect.

At the end of this chapter, the author takes the reader through a description and sample of an annotated bibliography and a review of the literature on a topic. An annotated bibliography is a bibliography with summary notes included for each work. In a literature review the chosen works are listed and the reasons for their incorporation into the study are given.

Chapter Five – Presenting and Documenting Research

An academic paper must be formatted according to the chosen style requirements of the institution. This book tells the reader how to format according to the MLA standards, and by that, takes them through the process of formatting itself. This process goes beyond just avoiding technical errors to preventing charges of plagiarism. The author takes us through the conventions for referencing authors and titles, and makes the point that using these conventions when creating the notes makes it much easier to produce the references in the paper.

The author explains how to avoid an unintentional charge of plagiarism by avoiding sloppy note taking or failure to write down proper references on the note cards. All these dangers can be avoided by being meticulous in properly creating the note cards. It is often useful in writing a paper to create an “introductory tag” in which the author’s name and credentials are
given before the quotation. We also must be careful to not mix a direct quote with a paraphrase; a paraphrase is an author’s statement in our own words. She also describes the dangers of parenthetical referencing at the end of paragraphs.

By contrast, the book does explain how to use parenthetical referencing (according to MLA formatting) within the body of the paper. She shows how to create parenthetical citations, where to place them, and how to deal with complex sources. She also describes a process for adding footnotes or endnotes to a paper along with cautions about their use.

Quotations should follow certain conventions; they need to be accurate, they must be enclosed in quotation marks, they should be brief, and they should be preceded by a reference to the original author. If the writer adds words of explanation to a quotation on a notecard, they need to be put in brackets (not parentheses). When a quotation is given as part of a longer sentence, the first word of the quote is not capitalized. The author also describes the rules for punctuation for a quotation including the use of ellipsis. Finally, she describes the process for recording longer quotations using indentation rather than quotation marks.

The book also presents some helpful guidelines for the proper style of using quotations. We need to use enough of the original statement to get the meaning across. We must be careful to not take the quote out of its context, and thus must give the reader enough information to clearly understand the quotation. We must also introduce the quote properly so as to prevent confusion, and we must incorporate the quotations into our sentences smoothly and properly.

Next Dr. Sayler provides the rules for punctuation, starting with most commonly used and abused rules for commas. She also gives the distinctions between the use of colons and semicolons. This section describes the proper inclusion of numbers into a text, including when to use write out the number and when to use numerals, how to give percentages and amounts of money, how to present dates, and give a sequence of numbers.
The last section of the chapter details the rules for including tables and charts into a report. In general we must see tables and charts as tools of communication and choose the best graphic for expressing our intended message. They should be simple, well-constructed, properly labeled and identified. Tables are helpful for presenting numerical data, while charts translate statistics into visual symbols that help people see the implications of the data. The author also presents methods of using more specialized charts such as line charts and flow charts.

Chapter Six – Writing the Paper

The writing of a paper is built around all the work of research and preparation that provides the base of information to be presented in the report. The book takes us through the process of organization and writing that ensures a high quality of presentation. In organizing the material that will go into the paper, it is important to put the note cards generated in the research phase into a logical order. Then one needs to review the tentative thesis and combine the results of the research to produce a clear and concise thesis statement.

A thesis statement must be given in a complete sentence. It must be limited and focused. It must be taken from the actual research. It must also stand as a unique and possibly unprecedented idea or approach to the topic.

Next, we must compare the organizational approach and information gathered from the organization of the note cards to the preliminary outline. From here, one re-visits the purpose for the project, and begins the process of developing a formal outline for the paper.

The author shows how to construct a traditional outline using roman numerals, capital letters, Arabic numerals, and lower case letters and numbers in parentheses. She also describes a decimal outline, and gives the common rules for creating outline divisions. One can create a paragraph style outline, a sentence outline, or a topical outline. But whichever style one chooses, the style must be consistently used throughout the outline.
The book does not encourage the use of paragraph outlining for a research paper, as they are too wordy and come to resemble the paper itself. She acknowledges that sentence outlines are popular with teachers who assign research papers and gives hints on turning a topical outline into a sentence outline. She also describes the rules for producing an effective topical outline. First, headings of equal rank must be constructed using either a noun, gerund, or infinitive. Second the headings must be specific and meaningful. Also the book gives rules for punctuation and capitalization.

Now we arrive at the process of actually writing the paper. One must plan for an adequate amount of time to compose and revise the paper. The book provides some helpful rules for determining the amount of time required for a normal academic paper, and warns against trying to complete the project “at the last minute.”

The author recommends adding references as the paper is being written rather than waiting until after the first draft is written and going back to add the documentation. The risk of missing a reference is too great to allow this practice. Along these lines, it is important, as one of the steps in reviewing the paper, to make sure that the “Works Cited” page has an entry for every document referenced in the text of the paper. This rule applies to all forms of referencing.

It is also important in the writing process to have all notes, cards, photocopied articles, and other necessary items readily available. And we must make the effort to have them organized and placed so that they can be easily accessed. This will reduce the time needed to complete the project and help eliminate errors in the document. It is also important to choose a comfortable place that is conducive to the writing process. The author reminds us that one of the secrets to writing is to just do it. If we encounter an opening seems difficult, we should move on to write the body of the paper (for which you have the outline and notes) and come back to write the opening later. The author also encourages taking short breaks during writing, as well as, reading and re-reading what you have already written.
In regards to style issues for an academic paper, the author endorses writing in the third person to enhance a sense of objectivity. The author also gives instances where it is proper to use the first person in distinguishing the writer’s personal opinion from other views in the paper. Also important in writing the paper is the proper use of tense, and the author gives rules for moving from present to past and even to the use of the “historical present” in describing a past event.

It is important that the paper be presented in the writer’s own words. While the paper reflects the personal style of the writer, it should not include slang or overly familiar language. Nor should the writer adopt an artificial “academic” style of rarely used terms and complex sentence structure. There is a need for using the specialized terminology of the field, which must be understood by the writer and used properly, but we must avoid a pretentious feel to the paper.

A well written introduction is very important; it engages the potential reader and shows the direction that the study will take. It, therefore, must present the thesis of the paper, describe the intent and the limits of the study, and reveal why the study is worth reading. The author suggests using more than one paragraph for this introduction, and presents useful examples of introductions for a student paper. She also demonstrates some attention gaining methods such as invoking a popular concern, challenging a commonly-held view, or choosing dramatic terminology. One can go too far with these methods, but with careful use, they enhance the appeal of the study.

The introduction can also be the place to give a brief review of the literature on the chosen topic and thus lay a foundation for the study. In the same way, important relevant information and statistics can be used to set the stage for the theme of the paper. Often, writers present the thesis in the opening in order to begin the process of expansion and explanation. The author ends this section of the chapter by giving some rules for what should be avoided in an introduction. These include a simple restatement of the title, using artwork or fancy lettering, attempts at humor, use of an ambiguous question, quoting a dictionary definition, or starting with a purpose statement. All of these techniques misdirect the interest and attention of the reader.
In writing the main body of the paper the author reminds the reader that there are three goals to be pursued. One must provide unity and coherence, take the reader through the source material that supports the thesis, and combine the source material with the writer’s insights to make the case. In this way, the writer takes the reader through the logical process of understanding what has been written.

In order to achieve unity and coherence, one must begin with paragraph unity (each sentence of the paragraph is related to the theme of the paragraph). She makes the important point that well organized notes leads to unified paragraphs. She also describes the process for achieving coherence by repeating important terms, carefully referring to the important terms using pronouns, and the proper use of transition phrases. Transitions are also important in linking paragraphs together into a coherent structure. Relying on an outline does not guarantee that a reader will be able to follow the writer’s argument. The deliberate use of transitions is necessary to make a written document coherent.

Continuing in this vein, the author cautions against using direct quotations that lack some form of introduction or context. This practice leads to confusion on the part of the reader. Related to this is the need to vary the terminology used in introducing quotations. This is necessary to maintain the reader’s interest. This rule applies for introducing any material from sources as well. Adding context and explanation is essential for obtaining coherence.

The goal of a research paper is to combine the information gleaned from outside sources with one’s own thoughts and insights on the topic. Ideally this would be a synthesis which takes known facts and combines them with thought and understanding to achieve a new insight into the question and advance the level of knowledge in the field. While this is the ideal, any good writer presents their own thoughts, formed and expanded by the research they have undertaken. In other words, good writers are not normally telling us what others have thought but what they have learned from the process of interacting with the ideas of those “others.” The book takes the reader through this section by presenting examples and discussing the ways they do or do not
demonstrate a synthesis of writer’s thoughts and the information gleaned from research. In this, she warns against just stringing together a series of facts with little context or explanation.

Good writing entails a clear statement of purpose and direction (topic sentence for a paragraph), multiple sources to reveal the extent of knowledge and discussion of the question, and evaluation by the writer himself to explain the significance of the data. These principles apply at the micro and macro level of writing a research paper. Each paragraph must be carefully constructed which leads ultimately, to a well written complete paper.

The author next describes the writing of the conclusion of the paper. She presents helpful principles for completing a paper. The first is to restate and extend the thesis of the work. This is not a simple repetition of the original statements, but an expansion and explanation of them. A second effective method is to use an important quotation to sum up the ideas expressed in the paper. This requires, of course, not just the quotation, but a surrounding explanation that uses the quote to provide a final punch line and conclusion to the document. A third strategy is to summarize the issue and call for further research. In other words, using the thesis to explain what is currently known and also what doors to future study still lie unopened. Finally, the author encourages the writer to use the conclusion to present a solution to the problem raised in the paper. As you can see, each of these methods is related to the purpose and development of the paper. In one study, presenting a solution is the natural result of the progression of thought. In another, the research leads to further questions that need answering. The writer should choose the method that fits the style and direction of their paper.

The book also gives rules for what to avoid in developing a conclusion to a paper. First, we should not present new or different material. Also, we must not just end the paper abruptly without a summary or a conclusion. It also doesn’t work to tell the reader what you, as the writer, have achieved. Further, we should not offer apologies or “hope” the readers have gained something from reading the paper. Lastly, don’t give too short an answer to a complex question. A one or two sentence summary is insufficient for a detailed research project.
Now the book turns to the question of putting the paper into its final form in preparation for submission. The first issue raised is the choice of a title. This is not an insignificant issue; a good title tells what the paper is about and can even draw the reader in. Dr. Sayler warns against being too clever, while still seeking to gain interest from the reader, and she gives positive and negative examples of titles.

An important part of the writing process is the need for consistent and diligent revision. Rewriting is as important as the writing itself. This entails a three step process: rewriting, editing, and proofreading. The author encourages the writer to print out a hard copy of the first draft (at least double spaced) that can be used for proofreading and revision. The first thing to look for is whether the paper met the original purpose for which it was written. Next, the reviewer should ask if the terms will be understood by the intended audience.

In terms of content, the review must establish that the theme or purpose of the paper is clearly stated and supported. Further, the reviewer must look for irrelevant or unnecessary sections that can be removed. In terms of structure, the reviewer is looking for well-developed, clear, and cohesive paragraphs. Does the logic of the argument flow from premise to conclusion, and does it follow the framework of the outline? Always we are seeking clarity and efficiency of communication. One must also confirm that the document is the required length (whether number of pages or word count).

The author encourages the writer to make large-scale revisions first. Many of these revisions can be made using cut and paste features of our word processor that allow the moving of entire paragraphs within the body of the paper. After making these revisions, it is time to start the process over by printing out this second draft, proofreading, and editing again. The author suggests that we look for coherence and the flow of the thought in the paper. One should also review sourcing, length of quotations, placement of the name of the original author or work for context, documentation, and the details of referencing.
The next step in the rewriting process is to edit the text of the re-structured paper. In editing, one should examine the tone of the paper, looking for such errors as sarcasm, condescension, or attempts at humor. The paper should reflect the professionalism and seriousness of a research project. Editing also involves examining each sentence in the text, looking for correct grammar and other construction errors. One must look out for clichés, trivial wording, or overly long sentences. Also, are the sentences varied in length and construction? Finally, are the sentences clear and do they convey the intended meaning?

Lastly, one should examine the type of language used in the paper, making sure to avoid stereotypes or other forms of inappropriate language. The author includes what she considers “sexist” language and encourages generic terms rather than pronouns such as “he” or “she.” Related to this is the need to be sure that we are using our terms correctly, that we are not using too many specialized terms, that we are avoiding overly abstract terminology, that we have used homonyms correctly, and that we are not overly informal (stay away from contractions).

The last step in the rewriting process is proofreading. In this phase, we looking for typographical errors, and other visual mistakes (a paragraph not indented, for example). It is in this phase that we assure that we have met all the requirements of the formatting style for the paper. These include proper cover page, proper referencing, and works cited page.

The final form of the paper should include a cover page, an outline (if required), an abstract (if required), the body of the paper, appendices (if needed), and a works cited list. The book presents two sample research papers; a shorter work without a cover page, and a longer paper with a cover page. The samples include notes from the author pointing out important features of the two papers for the reader’s instruction.

**Chapter Seven – Observing Other Styles of Documentation**

Dr. Sayler constructed her book around the use of the MLA style format, but she recognizes the need to be familiar with other formats for writing at the academic level. She summarizes the MLA as an author/page style and notes that an author/year style is used in social
science writing, a footnote/endnote style is used in the humanities, and the number style is used in science writing. No matter what, one must be consistent in using a single style throughout a paper.

The book then takes us through a summary of all of the leading style formats used in academic writing. She begins with author/year style exemplified by the American Psychological Association (APA). One of the advantages to the APA style is the use of parenthetical referencing. The book takes us through several examples of how to deal with a single author, multiple authors, and other anticipated options. The author also reveals how to produce a bibliography that includes books, articles, and dissertations. This section ends with a sample of an APA paper.

Next the author explains the features of the CBE (Council of Biology Editors) style. This style is similar to APA and uses author and year in parenthetical references. It differs from APA in the way references are listed in works cited page. A third style that is similar to these two is the USGS (U.S. Geological Survey) style.

After this, the author describes the footnote/endnote style. This style has two main sources, the *MLA Handbook* and the *Chicago Manual of Style*. The MLA style prefers endnotes and Chicago Manual prefers footnotes. This is one of the reasons the Chicago Manual style (Turabian) is so widely used in graduate level academic papers. One of the distinctive characteristics of this format is the use of superscript numbers to identify references that are listed in either the endnotes or the footnotes. Footnotes must be on the same page as the reference given, and follow the rules for the style. Endnotes need to be in consecutive order. The author also takes the reader through the conventions for the first reference to a work and how to cite later references to the same work.

Finally the book shows us how to write a paper in the number style. In number style, each reference is given a number in sequence (1,2,3,…). The number can be presented as a superscript, in parentheses, in parentheses either underlined or in italics, or placed in square corners.
brackets. The author explains where to place the numbers and how to use them in citations and references.

While this book gives a helpful summary of each of these styles and their unique characteristics, it is important that we refer to the latest edition of the style manual for the style that we are assigned to use for our document. After working our way through this text, we see that this book operates as a helpful guide to researching and writing an academic paper. It is clearly written. It contains helpful advice as well as actual written samples to help the student understand the process. Anyone attempting to write an academic research paper would find this book helpful.

Tom Shetler, M.A.
Faculty
Bethany College of Missions
6820 Auto Club Road
Bloomington
MN 55438
USA
tomshetler@hotmail.com

Sudhir Isaiah, Ph.D.
President
Bethany International University
Singapore
president@biu.edu.sg
Abstract
This paper reviews the literature on Socratic Method as a teaching/learning tool to enhance critical thinking skills. It starts with a short history of Socratic Method by introducing its founder and briefly provides an overall picture of the method. Then, a number of definitions of critical thinking is presented and discussed. Next, taxonomy of Socratic questioning is presented. The taxonomy provides a detailed description of questions that can be used when employing Socratic Method. Afterwards, a number of previous studies are reviewed to show the influence of Socratic approach on critical thinking skills. Finally, a brief conclusion will close the paper.

Keywords: Socratic Method, Critical Thinking, Questioning

Introduction
Socrates was a Greek philosopher who is renowned as one of the creators of western philosophy. He is also known as the founding father of a teaching/learning approach which is fueled by questions. Socratic approach follows a chain of orderly and structured questions which assist learners to become aware of their weaknesses in thinking, lack of knowledge, wrong inferences, and false hypotheses. This teaching/learning approach does not follow conventional way of teaching in which students are required to do memorization, read textbooks, listen to lectures, and sit for tests. In this method, instructors raise questions to help learners improve their deep and critical thinking and gain better understanding of topics and ideas. Through this approach of instruction, there are no ultimate answers for the questions that are being raised. As a matter of fact, the person who brings up these questions is not looking for such answers. The idea is to motivate and inspire reflection. Copeland (2005) explains that it is important for
teachers to clarify that these questions are not intended to create an environment of judgment, but rather to help students “examine their attitudes, beliefs, knowledge and logic” (Copeland, p.14).

According to Socrates, throughout the course of discussion and conversation “where all parties to the conversation were forced to clarify their ideas, the final outcome of the conversation would be a clear statement of what was meant” (Byrne, 2011, p.13). Socratic Method of instruction goes back to very old times and apparently was created based on Socrates’ idea that lecturing is not an efficient method of instruction for every learner. Socrates appreciated the experience, understanding, and information that people already had gained and believed that this knowledge is valuable, has a lot of potential, and can be used to develop awareness and wisdom. The philosopher strongly believed that learners can develop and promote reasoning skills and finally progress to more logical thinking and ideas which are supported by rationales and logics (Byrne, 2011). It is believed that philosophical and deep questions which are also an integral part of Socratic Method help improve cognition as the method triggers figurative thinking (Sigel, 1979; Rosnani, 2009).

Sigel (1979) claimed that Socratic questioning helps improve cognition as the method triggers figurative thinking. Socratic discussion is not a roundabout talk or a type teaching method in which the instructor raises a question and the learner responds to it and finally the instructor gives an answer in her ultimate remarks. Based on Socrates’ method, the real job of an instructor is to assist students to gather their opinions and thoughts and construct original thought from prior understanding. Socratic discussion is a useful technique which can assist individuals to differentiate rational viewpoints from unreasonable ones. Throughout Socratic discussion, the learners are guided and assisted to make novel discoveries, so the purpose of questioning is not only restricted to assessment of the students’ knowledge level, but building new stages of thinking to unveil inconsistencies and contradictions. The Socratic Method requires the instructors to give up their job as a conventional teacher who delivers the contents of the course but try to get the learners involved with the materials.

**Critical Thinking Skills**

*Language in India* www.languageinindia.com  **ISSN 1930-2940 15:6 June 2015**
Pezhman Zare & Jayakaran Mukundan
The Use of Socratic Method as a Teaching/Learning Tool to Develop Students’ Critical Thinking: a Review of Literature

257
Critical thinking has been defined in many ways. The distinguished educational expert Dewey (1933) refers to critical thinking as reflective thinking, and proposes that it must be one of the aims of education. One of the most frequently referred to definitions of critical thinking is one used by Ennis (1987), who has similar views to Dewey. Ennis defines critical thinking as “reasonable reflective thinking that is focused on deciding what to believe or do” (p. 10). Norris (1985), in much the same vein, defines critical thinking as deciding rationally what to or what not to believe. For Dewey, Ennis, and Norris, critical thinking is about being careful and reflective when making decisions to believe something or do something.

A more recent perspective on critical thinking involves the use of intellectual standards. Paul & Elder (2002), for example, refer to critical thinking as an art through which an individual can make sure that he/she makes use of the best thinking in any kind of situations. “The general goal of thinking is to figure out the lay of the land. We all have choices to make; we need the best information to make the best choices” (p.7).

Paul & Elder (2002) believe that critical thinkers have a basic ability to take charge, to develop intellectual standards, and to apply them to their own thinking. They suggest there are nine criteria generally used: Clarity, Relevance, Rationality, Accuracy, Depth, Significance, Precision, Breadth, and Fairness. Critical thinkers should apply these criteria as minimal requirements when they reason.

Other educationalists consider critical thinking to be about skepticism. McPeck (1981), for example, suggests that the essence of critical thinking is “the propensity and skill to engage in an activity with reflective skepticism” (p.8). Similarly, Sofo (2004) believes that thinking critically is about doubting and starting to reconsider what we normally take for granted. Sofo (2004) sees critical thinkers as people who evaluate their habits to improve the way they do things. They are people who are open-minded and who take into consideration other perspectives.

**How to Implement Socratic Method**


Pezhman Zare & Jayakaran Mukundan

The Use of Socratic Method as a Teaching/Learning Tool to Develop Students’ Critical Thinking: a Review of Literature
Paul & Elder (2007) emphasize the importance of questioning and the kinds of questions in Socratic approach in order to cultivate the disciplined mind and critical thinking skills. They state that raising analytical questions is very important and foundational to probing reasoning and comprehension. To be successful in thinking, one should be able to identify the elements of thinking by bringing up questions focused on those elements. Paul & Elder (2007) state that when instructors regularly employ the tools of critical thinking, the Socratic discussions get more productive and disciplined in which the students get to know the significance of questioning in learning, and then they would be able to create and follow deep and important questions in other classes and in various parts of their lives.

Besides, in a prominent taxonomy which was provided by Elder & Paul (2007), it is claimed that disciplined and skilled individuals with critical thinking skills clearly make use of intellectual standards each and every day. These individuals understand it once other people or they themselves stop using those standards. They regularly raise questions particularly to target these standards. Yet, most people are unaware of them. These standards include “clarity, precision, accuracy, relevance, depth, breadth, logicalness, and fairness” (p.32). Focusing on these standards, Elder & Paul (2007) provided this taxonomy which can serve as a guideline to promote and develop reasoning and critical thinking skills. Socratic questions are classified into six types of questions in this taxonomy which is presented in the following table.

Table 1: Elder & Paul (2007) Socratic Questioning Taxonomy

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Types of questions</th>
<th>Objectives</th>
<th>Examples</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Clarity</td>
<td>The individual is inquired to elaborate, illustrate, and exemplify his/her viewpoints.</td>
<td>• Can you provide more elaboration on the topic? • Can you give an example?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Precision</td>
<td>The participant is asked to be more precise by providing more specific details.</td>
<td>• Can you please give more details? • Would you please be more explicit?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Accuracy</td>
<td>Argue the accuracy and/or trustworthiness of viewpoints and beliefs.</td>
<td>• How can we ensure that it is true? • How can I validate the claimed facts? • Are these data dependable considering the debatable source?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Elder & Paul (2007) state that although the questioning strategies can be easily practiced and employed, it is essential to understand that improvement in the Socratic questioning abilities take place by dedicating enough hard work and practice in an extensive period of time. All in all, the Socratic questioning and discussion approach is capable of improving critical thinking skills, oral communication ability, question construction skills, and argumentative skills among students. It also helps build students’ self confidence in speaking in English (Walker, 2003; Yang, Newby & Bill, 2005; Rosnani, 2006; Oradee, 2012).

Socratic Questioning and Critical Thinking

According to Paul & Elder (2007), Socratic questioning is an art which is closely linked to critical thinking because it is vital to the brilliance of thinking. The term “Socratic” adds depth, systematicity, and a long-lasting curiosity in evaluating the reality or plausibility of viewpoints to the art of questioning. Both Socratic discussion and critical thinking have a common goal. The conceptual tools, which are necessary to understand how the mind works, are provided by critical thinking (in its search of truth and meaning). Socratic approach makes use of those tools to frame questions vital for finding the truth and meaning. The objective of critical thinking is to build an extra layer of thinking and a strong internal voice of reason. Socratic
discussion cultivates that voice by clearly paying attention to self-directed, disciplined questioning.

Tienken, Goldberg, & DiRocco (2009) focusing on the cognitive disposition of questions claim that there is a distinction in cognitive procedures between questions which draw out recall or and questions that inspire deep critical thinking. As they stated, questions are either productive which focus on higher order thinking (analysis, synthesis, evaluation categories) or reproductive which focus on lower order thinking (recall, comprehension, application categories). The former gives the learners a chance to generate, assess, or analyze. These types of questions are usually divergent and open-ended. The latter makes the learners to remember something or use knowledge delivered by the instructor. These questions usually come with one correct answer and are normally convergent (Tienken, et al., 2009). According to Tienken, et al., (2009) the results of several studies show that higher order questions have effects on learners’ accomplishment and development of critical thinking skills.

Chorzempa & Lapidus (2009), employing Socratic Method among their students, discovered that students learn to discover evidence in the text, use questioning to analyze the text, and also write an answer showing the major elements of the story. They stated that the skills assist the learners to get prepared to reply to a document-based question. After using Socratic discussions, it was noticed that the students “felt more comfortable sharing their ideas, encouraging one another to think out of the box” (p.58). Chorzempa & Lapidus (2009) believe that one of the most important outcomes of holding the Socratic discussions was to see the students learn to willingly reply to each other’s points and questions in a positive and friendly manner, trying to be open-minded, listen, and examine others’ perspectives without attacking each other just because of holding different opinions that are not agreeing with their own points but critically assess their point of views.

In another study conducted by Hong & Jacob (2012) in Malaysia, the researchers made an attempt to use Socratic questioning approach in an online discussion forum to help improve students’ critical thinking skills. The research participants included sixty undergraduate students.
from Swinburne University of Technology in Sarawak, registered for a mathematics subject. The students took part in online discussions for two times. The first discussion was hold in the fourth week, and the second one took place in the tenth week. Each discussion took about one week. The course lecturer moderated the discussions by providing Socratic questions. Quantitative and qualitative data was collected to determine the efficacy of Socratic questioning during the online discussions. Both qualitative and quantitative data came from the students’ postings on the discussion forum.

According to the results, the participants’ postings indicated low or moderate level of critical thinking. Although most of the respondents showed critical thinking skills to some extent, a limited number of postings reflected high levels of critical thinking on a consistent basis. However, the students’ critical thinking scores showed a slight improvement from the first to the second discussions. It is worth mentioning that critical thinking is a construct that may change and develop over time (Darby, 2007; Gervey, Drout, & Wang, 2009). However, the study conducted by Hong & Jacob (2012) employed only two sessions of Socratic discussions among them during two weeks. Therefore, the students’ critical thinking skills did not show significant improvement.

However, the results of a study by Shahsavar, Tan, Yap, and Bahaman (2013) showed that Socratic Method significantly improved students’ critical thinking skills. They conducted Socratic discussions among forty undergraduate students for 14 weeks. The students had Socratic discussions twice a week, online and face to face. The lecturer acted as a facilitator. The research participants were divided into small groups of four or five members. According to the results, the students’ critical thinking skills showed significant improvement as a result of participation in Socratic discussion. Accordingly, it can be claimed that the types of Socratic questions and the number of discussions are among important factors that should be considered when implementing Socratic Method.

Conclusion
One of the most important purposes of higher education system is to train learners to think critically, and educators have also continued to focus on the development of critical thinking skills in students (Scott, 2008). In addition, studies suggest that employers nowadays show more value for the members on their staff team who are capable of solving difficult issues and thinking critically (Gokhale, 1995). In this regard, the results of previous studies showed that Socratic Method is a teaching/learning tool that has a significant potential to develop students’ critical thinking skills, as well as critical reading and listening (Byrne, 2011; Tienken, et al., 2009; Paul & Elder, 2007; Ennis, 1987). These studies, among others, emphasize the importance of questions being raised during the discussion. Appropriate questions direct students’ thinking below the surface, make them think deeply and critically, and promote higher order thinking (Elder & Paul, 2007).

References


---

Pezhman Zare, Ph.D. Candidate  
pezhman.zare@yahoo.com

Prof. Jayakaran Mukundan, Ph.D.  
jaya@educ.upm.edu.my; jayakaranmukundan@yahoo.com

**Language in India** www.languageinindia.com **ISSN 1930-2940 15:6 June 2015**

Pezhman Zare & Jayakaran Mukundan  
The Use of Socratic Method as a Teaching/Learning Tool to Develop Students’ Critical Thinking: a Review of Literature
Department of Language and Humanities Education
Faculty of Educational Studies
Universiti Putra Malaysia
43400 Serdang
Selangor
Malaysia