

## Analysis of the Strengths and Weaknesses of Literate Punjab Programme (LPP)

**Sarfraz Ahmed Khan, Ph.D. Scholar**

Allama Iqbal Open University  
[sarfraz.edu.pk@gmail.com](mailto:sarfraz.edu.pk@gmail.com)

---

---

### Abstract

For the development and prosperity of a nation, Education is considered as a vital tool. The educated youth is a great asset for any country. International conventions and commitments are ensuring universal education across Pakistan and other developing countries in order to achieve goals. Government of Punjab has committed its resources in the form of many development projects. Literate Punjab Programme (LPP) was one of those efforts initiated to achieve the goal of universal education. In the present study, a comprehensive analysis of LPP was made in order to assess the advantages, merits, strengths and weaknesses of this program using the data collected from the stakeholders of this programme, i.e., the students, the teachers and the parents of the enrolled students. The structured questionnaire based survey approach was used and the results indicated positive results of this programme for stakeholders, besides certain weaknesses requiring attention for improvement in replica attempts in future like the availability of financial resources and teachers' compensation, Non-interest from executives, Interruption during the execution of the program, Punishment in NFBEs and ALCs. The major strengths of LPP were syllabus, teaching methodology and teachers training. Engagement of political figures, females and opinion makers in programme helped in achieving the targets. Teachers' availability, free stationery and learning environment were strong areas of LPP.

**Keywords:** Pakistan, Literate Punjab Program, Stakeholders, Strengths

### Introduction

The importance of education can never be denied in any society because educated population is the cornerstone of civilizations and for this very particular purpose, the state has primary responsibility to ensure education of its masses and availability of its human resources for the future, the state plans for the whole nation (Cammarota and Fine, 2010). For an individual, it is a fundamental right secured in international and national charters like United Nation's charter, and respective national constitutions (Caggiano, 2008). In the present day globalised world, the need of educated population is felt in more pressing way and it has been looked as the key to sustainable development, peace, and stability for each country internally as well as the tool to ensure the effective participation of individual societies in the global economic

progress, humanity and peace (Banks, 2007). In pursuance of this common sharing, a collective commitment from all the nations was emerged in the form of Daker Framework for Action in 2000 that has formulated its commitments to achieve the target of Education for All (EFA) by 2015:

1. All the member countries are responsible to ensure that all children including girls have access to and must complete their compulsory primary education. These governments are further bound to provide good quality education within their jurisdictions.
2. All the member countries are responsible to further ensure that youth of these countries must have an equitable access to the appropriate life skills and learning programs, and
3. There must be 50% improvement in the adult literacy by 2015, especially in case of women (UNESCO, 2000).

Pakistan is no exception to it. Pakistan is a signatory to the UN charter as well as the Daker Declaration on the Education for All, 2000 and hence, is responsible to meet with all the international commitments within the given frameworks and timelines. On the other hand, internal commitment to the people of Pakistan in the form of Principles of Policy in 1973 Constitution are providing guidelines to the incumbent governments to move forward in this regard. Article 37-b of the Constitution, 1973 provides that the state shall “remove illiteracy and provide free and compulsory secondary education within minimum possible period.” (Constitution of Pakistan, 1973) However, being the part of Principles of Policy, the gap in achieving this target cannot be controverted in the court of law (Munir, 1996).

It may well be seen that Pakistan is under national and international obligation to meet the goal of free and compulsory education to all the children and adults and in order to achieve this goal, every government is required to use its all the resources, be financial, infrastructural, technical or pertaining to human resource (Shah and Shah, 2012). However, this goal may not be achievable through the formal educational model, therefore, the role of informal education has also been included and these efforts are well assisted by the international efforts like EFA and UNLD (United Nation Literacy Decade) (Rugh, 2012). On the part of challenges, Pakistan is currently facing in achieving the goal of universal education i.e., EFA is the low adult literacy rate as compared to the neighbouring countries. As compared to India 72.1% and Bangladesh 61.5, Pakistan has 57.3% literacy rate in 2015 UNESCO rating (UNESCO, 2015). In the past, the lack of focus and interest in this area has worsen the case (Malik, 2015) and even in the present day efforts, low primary enrolment and dropouts from the schools are increasing the gap between total population and the literate population in the concrete terms. As an estimate, presently, there are over 50 million adult illiterates who are roaming in the streets of Pakistan (Malik, 2015). In the recent surveys, it has been pointed out that one third of children under the age of five are out of schools till to date and out of this one third out of school children 61% are girls and rest are

boys. It is further pointed out that girls have more dropout rate than boys i.e. 54% (Ahmed, et al., 2015).

In the first instance, it is imperative to discuss and analyse the term literacy as used at different levels and organisation and then to find the level of literacy in Pakistan in general and Punjab in particular against these meanings. In traditional understanding, a literate person is one who can read and write (UNESCO, 2006). In some parts of the world, a person is literate if he or she can read and write a paragraph in any language. In the developing countries, the use of numbers, images and understanding of cultural signs and symbols were added in the list to qualify a person as literate (Chrisomalis, 2009). Definition adopted by OECD countries is more expressive and it includes skills to access knowledge through use of technology and ability of a person to assess complex context (OECD, 2012).

What does literacy mean? Is it an ability to be assessed at some point in time or a skill to understand the written material, symbols across the road and signs giving directions and guidance? Does it merely relate to the writing and reading, or it is about tools to learn in both the formal, informal, and non-formal learning environment? These are some pertinent questions, which have been debated often in connection with the definition of literacy at different forums. Literature reveals that literacy is a complex mix of skill and process. It is an intellectual process at one hand that enables the person to give meaning to any written or printed material and this process is lifelong. This process keeps on continuing even in those circumstances when there is no formal or informal learning environment is provided (Malik, 2015). On the other hand, it represents a progression of skills that enables its holder to understand the spoken words, written text etc. and to give meaning to it (World Bank, 1995.). A person, using the basic definition of literacy, may be listed as literate as he or she can read and write a single paragraph, in the present day international citizenship and challenging global environment, this definition serves hardly any purpose. The global conscience has led the nations to adopt the expanded version of definition that includes ability to use of complex language with the speech sound understanding, meaning patterns, use of words in different situations and sentence structure to synthesis any written material with fluency (UNESCO, 2006.). In light of this discussion, for the purpose of this research, following definition of the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) has been adopted, “ability to identify, understand, interpret, create, communicate and compute, using printed and written materials associated with varying contexts. Literacy involves a continuum of learning in enabling individuals to achieve their goals, to develop their knowledge and potential, and to participate fully in their community and wider society” (UNESCO, 2004).

## **Need To Focus on Literacy Programmes**

Here arises an important, though basic question. What is the need to pay immediate and emergent attention on the literacy at national and international levels? It has been estimated that out of over 7.714 billion population living on the face of the earth and 74.21% of adult population (over 16 years of age), nearly a billion is illiterate in their own national languages and out of this approximate 650 million are adult women who cannot read or write (UNESCO, 2015). The present day world has been changed substantially from what it was a century ago. Even at the micro level, adults are responsible in every sphere of life as parents, colleagues, seniors, friends, workers etc. and literacy i.e., critical ability to understand, comprehend and to explain helps every person to comprehensively play his or her roles. Without skill to learn, i.e. literacy, the personal development will be stopped and over the period of time, the potential of the person will be rusted both for the family and the nation (Rugh, 2012).

At the national level too, literacy is important both a societal measure to achieve national goals as well as in terms of national economic prosperity. It is essential to eradicate poverty from domestic to national levels, to improve the standards of living for all the generations and to address issues pertaining to health and well-being of the people as whole (Malik, 2015). Youth is considered as the best population to exploit for the national economic prosperity as leaders to skilled workers. Skilled population has been accepted as the national asset in terms of national future capabilities whereas illiterate and unskilled people are burden on the economy as ineffective or less productive part of the national population (Banks, 2010; UNESCO, 2004). The childhood is the right time to equip a child with the literacy skills and to prepare him or her for the national building in future and this is the very reason, formal education of child is fully recognised in different international forums and compulsory free primary education is mandated by UNESCO and Darker Declaration in all countries of the world (Morrison, et al., 2008).

## **An Overview of International Literacy**

Literacy rate is showing marked improvement over the period of time, especially in case of women during the last ten years. It is very positive in adult and youth literacy where by 2012, 87% of the young females were literate and 92% of the men were found skilled with the basic literacy tools literate (UNESCO, 2015). In the global community, there are over 40% of the countries are found with the overall literacy rate over 95% and a majority is looking to achieve 90% mark in next few years. However, on the number side, there is a long way to go. Overall, 781 million adults are still illiterate mainly women. This major chunk resides in Sub Saharan Africa and some parts of Asia where this rate is found lover than 50% among the adults. International efforts to improve the situation is very much monitored during the last ten years and direct access programmes like EFA and Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) are effectively watching the progress of educational universality and literacy in countries having low literacy rate including Pakistan (Malik, 2015). In a recent survey conducted at the global level, it

was consolidated that 75% of all illiterate persons i.e. around 560 million adults are residing in only ten countries and Pakistan is one of these (Malik, 2015; UNESCO, 2015).

### **Literacy in Pakistan**

The national educational policy found its genesis from the Founding Father's vision and guidance that he delivered in the early days of the country and it provides that future of the nation is heavily dependent upon the type and quality of education, government provides to its children, however, this does not confine the scope to the formal or academic education but included the need of informal and non-formal education to make these children useful citizens in the long run. Muhammad Ali Jinnah further went to explain the importance of technical and scientific education for safe and secure social and economic life through planning in both the children as well as in industries (Govt. of Pakistan, 1947). The constitutional provisions and different educational policies over the period of time has been reiterated this point in the past as well as in the current era through different educational programmes at national and provincial levels, though without many achievements (Hayes, 1987). It has been reviewed that against the revised targets of 88%, Pakistan has literacy rate around 58% that too has large regional, local and gender disparities as most of the enrolment is ensured in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KPK) and Punjab whereas Sind and Baluchistan are far lagging. Female literacy rate in last two provinces is dismally low (Tagar and Shah, 2015). The literacy is aimed to achieve through the application of all forms of education, i.e., formal, informal, and non-formal methods of learning. In order to promote literacy among the adults, however, the focus remained on non-formal and informal methods more than the formal methods (Werquin, 2012).

### **Experimental Pilot Project Integrating Education And Rural Development (EPPIERD)**

Ministry of Education remained the key ministry for promotion of educational initiatives as well as literacy programmes at the federal level in the past. In presence of strong federation, this ministry was able to initiate all the early effort on the issue and get the other federating units involve in the later stages. In 1977, this ministry started Experimental Pilot Project Integrating Education and Rural Development (EPPIERD) programme with the collaboration with UNESCO to achieve the target of literate Pakistan. This programme focused on the objectives like setting up primary model schools at the rural level and to provide these schools with the infrastructure, staff, methodology and material to ensure maximum turnover of the students under the age of 10 in these schools (Govt. of Pakistan, 2009). The programme extended its scope to the vocational training for the areas where dropout rate due to economic reasons was high and to ensure the presence of children in school. In the urban centres and sub-urban centres, programmes to develop new skill oriented programmes were introduced to attract youth and adults besides basic literacy and the selection of these skill programmes was based on the needs of the locality, level of industrialisation in the neighbouring job market and the local trades and this programme

promoted skills like crops and animal husbandry, agro technical subjects, arts and crafts, cottage industries, health, etc.

The review indicated that this programme was a success in acceptance of non-formal education method as a parallel educational stream in adult literacy, especially for women. It had resultantly encouraged among the masses to believe in self-help and to help the government in achievement of educational efficiency instead of looking towards the government for assistance. But in all this effort, the focus on the formal education and re-orientation of formal school learning at primary level was missed as an objective of the programme. Another drawback was the lack of comprehensive and national level efforts to make this project a replicable project and hence it was able to impact in isolation and to the limited regional efficacy. In the recommendation part of the programme, it was very much emphasised that the spirit of this project, being a pilot project, was to extend its scope in all parts of the country and unless that could have been done through elaborate and joint efforts, the true impacts of this programme could not be identified (Govt. of Pakistan, 2009).

### **Rural Education and Development (READ)**

EPPIERD's review had some positive impact upon the policy development and was further extended under the name of Rural Education and Development programme (READ) with the financial assistance of UNICEF and under the auspices of Non-Formal Education Wing of the Ministry of Education (Govt. of Pakistan, 2009). This new and extended programme focused on the missing objectives of the EPPIERD and aimed to provide the other areas of the country with the replication of results. It focused on the success factors of EPPIERD like mosque schools, female education centres in villages, adult literacy centres and village workshops in order to bring rural areas into the manifold of social and economic development and to become the wheel of progress for Pakistan. In the initial evaluation, it was a success and was recommended to extend in 2000 villages but could not find place in future years' planning agenda (Govt. of Pakistan, 1978).

### **Iqra Pilot Project**

Due to dismal performance of literacy over the period of time, federal government initiated Iqra Pilot Project in 1986 for the twin cities i.e., Rawalpindi and Islamabad. This programme was brainchild of the Literacy and Mass Education Commission (LAMEC) (Govt. of Pakistan, 1983). In this project educated persons and ex-service men were encouraged to devote their spare time to the education activities and non-formal education centres on their own and in their native / residential areas. Their efforts were ensured and rewarded with handsome stipend. Despite initial positive response of the project, it could not long last and was terminated by the government in 1988 (Govt. of Pakistan, 2009).

## **Nai Roshni Schools**

It was another effort to focus on adult dropouts and children who had not found opportunity to join any formal education institutes. This project was launched for the period of 1986-90. The target population was adult boys and girls of 10-14 of age and it was planned to bring overall 1.650 million children into the mainstream education over the period of two years with the support of 22,000 Nai Roshni Schools across the country (Govt. of Pakistan, 1986). After the completion of two-year course, these children would be able to join formal schools at grade 6-class and continue their formal education later on. In order to achieve this target, 22,000 formal school buildings were arranged for second time schooling with the full time dedicated and trained teachers and staff. This teaching staff were responsible to make public liaison with the children, their parents, persuade the community and the children to get their education done and keeping of records etc. (Govt. of Pakistan, 2009). However, like many other educational initiatives of that era, this could not be completed and was left incomplete.

## **National Commission for Human Development-NCHD**

With the start of new millennium, new efforts were made to bring the literacy level of the country at par with the developed world and National Commission for Human Development-NCHD was launched at country level in 2003. It was again a non-formal literacy project and initially it ensured a lot of public ownership. In the first year, 400,000 students got enrolled and it was expected that in the later years, it could be multiplied numerously. Despite the potential of the programme and initial response, it was closed down before its completion (Govt. of Pakistan, 2002).

## **Allama Iqbal Open University (AIOU)**

Genesis of distant learning is deep rooted in the non-formal educational model and AIOU is the pioneer institution of Pakistan in this regard. It was established in 1974 and over the period of time, it has developed itself into a multidiscipline university offering over 400 courses and degrees applying media based distant learning modules system including electronic tutorials, CDs, local resource centres and postal communication. Despite non-formal educational modal, the range offered by the university is wide covering MPhil in certain subjects. However, the important and related aspect of this initiative is the programmes directly related to the literacy initiatives and basic / primary education (AIOU official website, 2015).

### **I. Integrated Functional Education Project**

Among the early initiatives, AIOU collaborated with the Ministry of Education (MoE) and Pakistan Television Corporation to promote Literacy and Adult Educational Programmes. In programme like Integrated Functional Education Project that was basic in nature but due to lack of expertise and basic support of infrastructure, it took a quite long time initially and the major effort was put in development of curriculum, research surveys, teaching material, contents and

evaluation methodology at the central level with the help of regional contribution, as most of the programmes were required to be run in more than one local languages (Bukhsh, 2015). Integrated Functional Education Project and many other programmes were not meant to award degrees but with the repetitive presentation through PTV media in national and local languages, social awareness and skill development of the masses were required while sitting at their own places. To an extent, such programmes were initially switched to physical courses of short durations too, at selected places only, but later on due to similarity to formal / structural education modal, these were dropped (Bukhsh, 2015).

## **II. Functional Education Project for Rural Areas (FEFRA)**

FEFRA was an effort to provide functional learning at the local and rural levels through non-formal educational methods at some common place near the doorsteps of the learner. In this programme, targeted audience was rural illiterate, especially women with little or no support of national language programmes. These were functionally trained in childcare, livestock management, home based poultry, prevalent agricultural skills and basic electricity and electric appliances skills. After initial success, these programmes were adopted as main functional programmes at the AIOU level and run through the use of PTV and other media resources, too. However, as the basic instructional mode, these physical presence programmes were run through the use of local demonstrator / trainer with the use of diagrams, pictures, flip charts and other audio-visual devices due to poor language communication level of the participants. Most of the learning was hands on and discussion oriented where each participant was encouraged to apply the learning and ask its own difficulty for clarity. This program has helped in development of basic skills as well as learning capabilities among the participants and now-a day; such programmes are mostly televised (Bukhsh, 2015, Govt. of Pakistan, 2009).

## **III. Integrated Functional Education Project**

It was a federally funded female focused programme that was projected for duration of 18 months and regional specific for Rawalpindi. It was collaborated between the non-formal private initiative and the AIOU. It was focused to provide the basic literacy tools to females of the area and to enable them to join the formal education institutes upon completion of this course leading to university education. The targeted females were adults and were unable to join primary education institutions due to age difference and social pressures and hence the choice to become the part of non-formal educational activity with adults was a better opportunity. The project was however, reviewed as of limited utility and duplication of the activities going on at much larger level in non-formal education side (Malik, 2015).

## **IV. Integrated Functional Literacy Project**

Integrated Functional Literacy Project was a dedicated project for AIOU's Women Education Department with financial assistance of Netherland government through Women

Division of the Government of Pakistan. It was part of youth empowerment and women development initiatives of the government AIOU's basic model of distant learning was adopted since it was developed and the resource sector, curriculum, helping material and other technical facilities were available from the university's platform. Regional scope of this project was wider and distant and women of far flung and remote areas deprived of education due to absence of social, cultural or institutional support were aimed to bring in the mainstream. These target populations of this project, after the completion, were invited to join regular matriculation courses leading to higher studies as distant students of the university. The project was hampered due to socio-cultural reasons and could not produce the desired results throughout Pakistan, hence was reviewed as partially successful (Govt. of Pakistan, 1998).

## V. Women's Matrix

It was another project supported by the Government of the Netherlands to help women to achieve their secondary level certifications and education while remaining at their own places. The spread of this project was initially selected and later it was supported for the whole country and produced good results. In 1990, after the review of this project, the number of targeted students was increased to 10,000 per annum with the collaboration of AIOU (Govt. of Pakistan, 2009).

### Objectives

In light of the initial discussion and the research background, after the initial literature review, following objectives were framed:

- To identify the strengths and weaknesses of LPP
- To suggest measures for the improvement of quality of education in non-formal sector

### Statement of the Problem

In most of the government programs, it is unfortunate to find that these end without achieving the desired results, even sometimes end without proper closure. At the same time, evaluations (periodic or final) often fail to provide a true assessment of the fruits of the program, especially the users' perspective. However, the scope of this research was confined to the external assessment / users' perspective of LPP and hence this research was aimed at figuring out real impact of LPP on the desired beneficiaries and to present a case for its replication in other districts (unmodified or modified) or even otherwise.

### Research Questions

This research intends to answer the following research questions:

- What are the strengths and weaknesses of LPP to keep in view promoting non-formal education?
- Is the programme can be replicated through some modifications?

## **Materials & Methods**

It is important to relate the decision of the selection of appropriate research design with the objectives of the research under consideration. In a research activity, all factors like human behaviour, project review, social and cultural considerations are important and need consideration (Creswell, 2013). Therefore, for a research that has objective to review of progress of a completed project and its replication in the other districts of Punjab, it requires a flexible descriptive research design to allow manoeuvrability, if so requires. LPP was initially started in 4 districts of Punjab and was aimed to be replicated with some changes in next phase in all districts of Punjab. For the purpose of feedback and full analysis, all the children, parents and tutors / staff engaged in this project form part of the population for the survey activity from selected districts.

## **Sampling**

In the present research there is no uniformity among the population as the stakeholders were students, teachers as well as parents of the students enrolled in LPP. The other stakeholder was the Government, however, this research aimed to review the project from beneficiaries' point of view; therefore, Punjab Government was excluded. For the rest of three stakeholders were selected using random samplings. During the research process, the sample was found adequate and no later changes were found necessary to complete the research.

## **Data Collection Instrument Development**

In this research, selection of data collection instrument is supported by literature review and basic structure of the research involving feedback of multiple stakeholders. Similarly, the research objectives and research questions i.e., analysis of LPP and determination of future perspectives of the same was requiring an in-depth review that was only possible in survey technique. A pilot survey was initially conducted to review the strength of selected data collection interview, and based on the findings / observations, final questionnaire is based. The questionnaire is developed keeping in view the achievable and targets of the programme and strictly according to the research objectives. The respondents have been approached while visiting their workplaces / addresses due to lack of proper awareness and knowledge that hindered postal responses.

## **Validity & Reliability of the Instrument**

Validity refers to the appropriateness, meaningfulness, correctness, and usefulness of the inferences a researcher makes whereas reliability refers to the consistency of scores of answers from one administration of an instrument to another, and from one set of items to another. Both these concepts are important to consider when it comes to the selection or design of the instrument a researcher intends to use (Franekel & Wallen, 2009). Validity of the instrument was ensured with the help of experts in the field. According to the suggestions of experts, the

researcher modified and improved the instrument. After necessary changes and modifications, the researcher finalized the tools while the reliability of the instruments was checked with the help of Cronbach's Alpha. The value of correction was .84.

### **Data Analysis**

In this research, the data were collected using survey technique and was available in five scaled format that can be presented in form of percentage, frequencies and patterns, if applied. In order to analyse this data, different software including excel sheets may be applied, however, in order to ensure best results, and possibilities of diverse analysis, this research applied SPSS software for analysis and using descriptive statistics available as the result of survey data, frequencies and mean of each statement is calculated to identify distribution and central tendency of each statement.

### **Results & Discussions**

#### **Strengths of LPP**

In the first instance, strengths of LPP may be discussed in light of research results.

#### **Engagement of Youth and Females as Mentor and Teachers in LPP**

LPP is a programme of informal education of those children who had no opportunities to go to formal schools at the right time as well as adult education. This programme, in order to achieve the results, engaged a lot of fresh teachers and mentors besides engaging experts from Literacy and Non-Formal Education Department, Govt. of the Punjab. The statistics indicates that over 74% of the teachers participated in the survey were under the age of 35 years of age, hence those had acted as agent of change in this programme. Length of service had also indicated the same results for change management. At the same time, the gender frequency indicates that the majority (72%) of the teachers and programme implementers were females. As a matter of strategy, where it was the part of the programme to convince the locality and families to send their children for informal education with LPP, female convincers and teacher was a right approach. It was noted that these females had a better access to inside the families.

#### **Teachers' Availability and Teachers' Efforts**

Teachers were available for the students during the programme and from the point of teachers; it was agreed by 87% of the participants. 73% of the parents believe that teachers have done their jobs by making up deficiencies of their children and 51% believed that LPP staff worked hard to teach their students as against 33% who did not agree. Regarding teachers' availability 84% of the NFBEs students have agreed that teachers were available and 54% of ALC student agreed to the situation. Here presence of teacher is little low in ALC. 75% students at NFBEs indicated that teachers were cooperative and 64% students at ALC were of the same opinion. Similarly, the teaching methods and styles were found understandable by 52% NFBEs

and 45% ALC's students. On the effort to persuade parents to send their children to LPP, another 61% parents agreed that they have sent their children to LPP upon persuasion of LPP staff that shows a commitment on their part.

### **Syllabus / Curriculum and Teaching Methodologies**

The other strength of LPP appears as the teaching methodologies, syllabus, and the availability of teaching kits with the teachers. It was found that in the teachers' survey, 61% of the participants have indicated that syllabus was well defined and 57% considered that teaching methodologies were best suited to the nature of the programme. 60% participants have confirmed the results by agreeing to the statement that non-financial support to the programme in form of teachers' training was available. In response of the timely provision of the syllabus to the students, teachers have identified that it was in time and adequately by 73%. In opinion of 43% of teachers engaged in LPP, the curriculum was the best part whereas 69% considered teaching methodology was the strength of the programme. On the question of teaching training 60% teachers found it crucial factor in success of the programme. In response of the statement if syllabus / curriculum was provided in time, 81% have shown confidence in timely and adequately that confirms the opinion of teachers on this point. From the point of view of the students, 60% of NFBEs students have found that syllabus / curriculum was provided in time but in case of ALC, only 34% agreed to the statement and this shows some grey area in overall good performance.

### **Learning Environment Including Physical Space**

One of the success factors in LPP can be seen in form of the learning environment for the learners. One aspect that is the teaching environment has been seen in the earlier part. The availability of good learning environment is confirmed by 56% teachers in the survey. However, only 50% of the teachers found the spaces provided for the execution of the programme as adequate. For 70% students at NFBEs and 73% students of ALC, physical space was adequate. Learning environment was free and encouraging as 78% students at NFBEs and 54% students of ALC, they were free to ask questions. 68% students at NFBEs and 62% students of ALC agreed that teachers were cooperative. Similarly, only 37% students at NFBEs and 42% students of ALC found teaching kits incomplete.

### **Role of Local Administration, Political Forces and Elders of the Area**

The role of outside forces like local administration, political figures and elders of area however had provided differential strength to the programme. Teachers considered the support of the local administration as conducive, responsive, and appropriate by 75% and another 60% considered the role of elders of areas as social force, positive. 62 % parents did not see any hurdle posed by political motives and leaders and hence cooperative as reflected from the results of statement 23 in parent's survey.

## **Programme Outcomes**

Without prejudice to the results of the programme presented in PC-IV officially, this research indicates that 64% of NFBEs students and 36% of ALC students can read and write in Urdu etc. and 47% of NFBEs students and 36% of ALC students can read English without help. 85% of NFBEs students and 25% of ALC students desired that other children should go to school too and 84% of NFBEs students and 38% of ALC students wanted to continue their studies. This programme helped 86% of NFBEs students and 38% of ALC students in their education and for 77% of NFBEs students and 26% of ALC students, it helped in understanding things better. 54% students on both groups indicated that their children / siblings are now going to school in formal education.

## **Weaknesses in Execution of LPP**

On the other side, this research is able to identify certain weaknesses in the execution of this programme and these are discussed as under:

### **Availability of Financial Resources and Teachers' Compensation**

According to teachers as LPP programme, the availability of funds was not up to the mark as only 28% considered it as adequate. Only 44% teachers considered it as the best part of the programme. Only 30% of the teachers considered the compensation for their work as well.

### **Non-interest from Executive**

In the opinion of teachers, executives have not played their part properly as only 34% participants showed their satisfaction over their role. At the same time, only 30% of teacher participants found support of PMU and Education Department timely in case of need. Only 26% of the participants considered administration and project implementation part as best part of the project.

### **Interruptions in Programme**

It was observed that the programme was not smooth in some areas and there were interruptions that are confirmed from the results where 62% of the student of NFBEs and 69% of ALC considered the programme as interrupted.

### **Punishment at Programme**

Despite clear prohibition of punishment at schools, this programme has reported punishments as 51% of the student of NFBEs and 37% of ALC confirmed so. This reporting may result in stopping children to join future programme.

## Conclusion

In view of the analysis, it is clear that LPP was able to achieve its target partially though not fully. It has achieved its targets in NFBEs and the survey results are positive from both parents and students. However, its most of the targets for ALC were missed like full literacy and reading and writing capacity of all the participants. Strengths of LPP are syllabus, teaching methodology and teachers training. Engagement of females in programme helped in achievement of targets of the programme. Teachers' availability, free books and other material and learning environment were strong areas of LPP. Furthermore, local administration and political figures have played their part in execution of this programme. On the other hand, non-availability of funds in time and non-interest of administration are weak areas of this programme. LPP was interrupted in ALC part and this had led to non-achievement of targets. The success of this programme has provided future opportunities for replication of LPP in other districts. The success of LPP has helped in change in people perception that is very evident in this research and this change may be used to achieve the purposes of other like programmes. However, for best results further improvement in perception, elders' role in promoting adult and girls' education is required to be worked upon. ALC needs major changes in its execution.

## Recommendations

This research in light of results offers these recommendations:

1. LPP may be replicated in all districts of Punjab with some necessary modifications.
2. Strengths of LPP reviewed may be replicated in future programme with further improvements.
3. ALC may be given due focus and teachers' availability must be ensured.
4. Involvement of political leaders may be ensured in each proposed district.
5. Proper campaign involving satisfied parents in the previous programme may help in achieving future program.
6. More female teachers may be hired for NFBE and male teachers for ALC programme.
7. Funds may be increased, and mechanism of releasing funds may be improved for quick availability.
8. Teachers working under LPP and ALC may attracted through better salary package.

---

## References

- Ahmad, M., Saleem, K., Mehmood, R., ul Islam, M., & Iqbal, S. (2015). Literacy Efforts In Pakistan: Need For Altering The Course Of Action. *The AYER*, 3, 300-307.
- AIU Official Website, (2015), [www.aiou.edu.pk](http://www.aiou.edu.pk)
- Banks, J. A. (2007), *Diversity and citizenship education: Global perspectives*. Jossey-Bass, An Imprint of Wiley. 10475 Crosspoint Blvd, Indianapolis, IN 46256.

- Bukhsh, Q. (2014), *Distributed learning as a potential approach to distance education: prospects and challenges at Allama Iqbal Open University* (Doctoral dissertation).
- Caggiano, M. H. S. (2008), *Education. Fundamental Right. RIGHT TO EDUCATION*, 19. Retrieved on December 21, 2015 from <http://unesco.atlasproject.eu/unesco/file/df01a676-ed72-43a5-9fcf-d1fb4cf6de99/c8c7fe00-c770-11e1-9b21-0800200c9a66/187916e.pdf#page=15>
- Cammarota, J., & Fine, M. (Eds.). (2010), *Revolutionizing education: Youth participatory action research in motion*, New York: Routledge Taylor & Francis Group.
- Chrisomalis, S. (2009), The Origins and Co-evolution of Literacy and Numeracy, in Olsen, D. & Torrance, N. (Eds.), *The Cambridge Handbook of Literacy* (pp. 59-74). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Creswell, J. W. (2013), *Research design: Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches*. Sage.
- Govt. of Pakistan, (2009). *Achievements of Ministry of Education; January 2008 to November 2009*, Islamabad: Policy and Planning Wing, Ministry of Education.
- Govt. of Pakistan. (1978). *The fifth five-year plan 1978-83*, Islamabad: Planning Commission, Government of Pakistan.
- Govt. of Pakistan. (1983), *The sixth five-year plan 1983-88*, Islamabad: Planning Commission, Government of Pakistan.
- Govt. of Pakistan. (1998) *National education policy 1998-2010*: Islamabad, Ministry of Education.
- Govt. of Pakistan. (2009), *National education policy 2009*, Islamabad: Ministry of Education Government of Pakistan
- Hayes, L. D. (1987). *Crises of education in Pakistan*, Lahore: Vanguard.
- Malik, S. Y. (2015), MDGs on Universalization of Primary Education: Analysis of Gaps Between Commitment and Implementation in Pakistan. *Mediterranean Journal of Social Sciences*, 6(6 S1), 224.
- Morrison, F. J., Bachman, H. J., & Connor, C. M. (2008), *Improving literacy in America: Guidelines from research*, Yale: Yale University Press.
- Munir, M. (1996), *Constitution of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan: Being a Commentary on the Constitution of Pakistan, 1973*, Lahore: PLD Publishers.
- OECD, (2012) *Programme for the International Assessment of Adult Competencies (PIAAC)*, Retrieved December, 11, 2015 from <http://www23.statcan.gc.ca/imdb/p2SV.pl?Function=getSurvey&SDDS=4406&lang=en&db=imdb&adm=8&dis=2>
- Rugh, A. B. (2012), *International Development in Practice: Education Assistance in Egypt, Pakistan, and Afghanistan*. Palgrave Macmillan.
- Shah, S., & Shah, U. (2012). Girl education in rural Pakistan. *RISE*, 1(2), 180-207.
- Tagar, H. K. & Shah, A. R. A. (2015). Millennium Development Goals: Reducing Gender Disparity through Educational Incentives (Evidences from Sindh-Pakistan). *International Journal of Innovative Research and Development*, 4(5):1-20

- UNESCO (2000). The Dakar framework for action. *The World Declaration on Education*, retrieved on November, 11, 2017 from <http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0012/001211/121147e.pdf>
- UNESCO (2004) *Education Sector Programme, Position paper*, retrieved on December, 11, 2015 from <http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0013/001362/136246e.pdf>
- UNESCO (2006) *Education for All Global Monitoring Report* retrieved on December, 12, 2015 from [http://www.unesco.org/education/GMR2006/full/chapt6\\_eng.pdf](http://www.unesco.org/education/GMR2006/full/chapt6_eng.pdf)
- UNESCO, (2015) *Literacy Statistics Metadata Information Table, September 2015*.
- Werquin, P. (2012). The missing link to connect education and employment: recognition of non-formal and informal learning outcomes, *Journal of Education and Work*, 25(3), 259-278.
- World Bank (1995). *Priorities and strategies for education*, Washington, D. C.

=====

**Sarfraz Ahmed Khan**

Principal in The Educators (A Project of Beaconhouse) Talagang Campus  
Academic Coordinator, Public Relation Officer  
Ph.D. Research Scholar in DNFCE from Department of Distance, Non-Formal And Continuing Education, Allama Iqbal Open University, Islamabad, Pakistan  
[sarfraz.edu.pk@gmail.com](mailto:sarfraz.edu.pk@gmail.com)